1	ROB BONTA Attorney General of California	
2	Attorney General of California ARMANDO ZAMBRANO Supervising Deputy Attorney General	
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General MARISSA N. HAMILTON Deputy Attorney General	
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 322489	
5	300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, CA 90013	
6	Telephone: (213) 269-6701 Facsimile: (916) 731-2126 E-mail: Marissa.Hamilton@doj.ca.gov	
7	Attorneys for Complainant	
8	BEFORE THE	
9	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR	
10	STATE OF CALIFORNIA	
11	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 79/24-8572
12	GABRIELA PRIETO, DBA WATERMAN	
13	SMOG 1 395 N Waterman Ave	ACCUSATION
14	San Bernardino, CA 92410	
15	Mailing: 24250 Dracaea Ave., Apt 114	
16	Moreno Valley, CA 92553	
17	Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 294660	
18	Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License No. TC 294660,	
19	and	
20	GABRIELA PRIETO	
21	24250 Dracaea Ave #114 Moreno Valley, CA 92553	
22 23	Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 641956	
24	Respondents.	
25		
26	<u>PARTIES</u>	
27	1. Patrick Dorais (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as	
28	the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair, Department of Consumer Affairs.	
	1	
	(GABRIELA PRIETO, DBA WATERMAN SMOG 1 and GABRIELA PRIETO) ACCUSATION	

- 2. On or about June 20, 2019, Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 294660 to Gabriela Prieto, dba Waterman Smog 1 (Respondent Waterman Smog 1). The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on June 30, 2025, unless renewed.
- 3. On or about July 2, 2019, Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License Number TC 294660 to Respondent Waterman Smog 1. The Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on June 30, 2025, unless renewed.
- 4. On or about May 20, 2019, Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Smog Check Inspector License Number EO 641956 to Gabriela Prieto (Respondent Prieto). The Smog Check Inspector License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on May 31, 2025, unless renewed.

JURISDICTION

- 5. This Accusation is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs (Director) for the Bureau of Automotive Repair, under the authority of the following laws. All section references are to the Business and Professions Code (Code) unless otherwise indicated.
- 6. Section 118, subdivision (b), of the Code provides that suspension, expiration, surrender, or cancellation of a license shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary action during the period within which the license may be renewed, restored, reissued or reinstated.
- 7. Section 9884.7 of the Code provides that the Director may revoke an automotive repair dealer registration.
- 8. Section 9884.13 of the Code provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration of a valid registration shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary proceeding against an automotive repair dealer or to render a decision temporarily or permanently invalidating (suspending or revoking) a registration.

///

onboard diagnostic systems, in lieu of loaded mode dynamometer or two-speed idle testing, on model year 2000 and newer vehicles only, beginning no earlier than January 1, 2013, and on model-year 1996-99, inclusive, vehicles only, beginning no earlier than January 1, 2025. However, the department, in consultation with the state board, may prescribe alternative test procedures that include loaded mode dynamometer or two-speed idle testing for vehicles with onboard diagnostic systems that the department and the state board determine exhibit operational problems. The department shall ensure, as appropriate to the test method, the following:

- (a) Emission control systems required by state and federal law are reducing excess emissions in accordance with the standards adopted pursuant to subdivisions (a) and (c) of Section 44013.
- (b) Motor vehicles are preconditioned to ensure representative and stabilized operation of the vehicle's emission control system.
- (c) For other than diesel-powered vehicles, the vehicle's exhaust emissions of hydrocarbons, carbon monoxide, carbon dioxide, and oxides of nitrogen in an idle mode or loaded mode are tested in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department. In determining how loaded mode and evaporative emissions testing shall be conducted, the department shall ensure that the emission reduction targets for the enhanced program are met.
- (d) For other than diesel-powered vehicles, the vehicle's fuel evaporative system and crankcase ventilation system are tested to reduce any nonexhaust sources of volatile organic compound emissions, in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- (e) For diesel-powered vehicles, a visual inspection is made of emission control devices and the vehicle's exhaust emissions are tested in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department, that may include, but are not limited to, onboard diagnostic testing. The test may include testing of emissions of any or all of the pollutants specified in subdivision (c) and, upon the adoption of applicable standards, measurement of emissions of smoke or particulates, or both.
- (f) A visual or functional check is made of emission control devices specified by the department, including the catalytic converter in those instances in which the department determines it to be necessary to meet the findings of Section 44001. The visual or functional check shall be performed in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- (g) A determination as to whether the motor vehicle complies with the emission standards for that vehicle's class and model-year as prescribed by the department.
- (h) An analysis of pass and fail rates of vehicles subject to an onboard diagnostic test and a tailpipe test to assess whether any vehicles passing their onboard diagnostic test have, or would have, failed a tailpipe test, and whether any vehicles failing their onboard diagnostic test have or would have passed a tailpipe test.
- (i) The test procedures may authorize smog check stations to refuse the testing of a vehicle that would be unsafe to test, or that cannot physically be inspected, as specified by the department by regulation. The refusal to test a vehicle for those reasons shall not excuse or exempt the vehicle from compliance with all applicable requirements of this chapter.

7

8

9 10 11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

27.

No automotive repair dealer or individual in charge shall, in filling out an estimate, invoice, or work order, or record required to be maintained by section 3340.15(e) of this chapter, withhold therefrom or insert therein any statement or information which will cause any such document to be false or misleading, or where the tendency or effect thereby would be to mislead or deceive customers, prospective customers, or the public.

California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3373 states:

COST RECOVERY

28. Section 125.3 of the Code provides, in pertinent part, that the Board may request the administrative law judge to direct a licensee found to have committed a violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case, with failure of the licensee to comply subjecting the license to not being renewed or reinstated. If a case settles, recovery of investigation and enforcement costs may be included in a stipulated settlement.

FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

Beginning March 9, 2015, California's Smog Check Program was updated to require 29. the use of an On-Board Diagnostic Inspection System (OIS). OIS is the Smog Check equipment required in all areas of the State when inspecting most model-year 2000 and newer gasoline and hybrid vehicles and most 1998 and newer diesel vehicles. The system consists of a certified Data Acquisition Device (DAD), computer, bar code scanner, and printer. The DAD is an On Board Diagnostic (OBD) scan tool that, when requested by the California OIS software, retrieves OBD data from the vehicle. All OBD data that the vehicle indicates it supports is requested by the California OIS software and will be retrieved. The DAD connects between the OIS computer and the vehicle's Data Link Connector (DLC). The California OIS software requires a continuous Internet connection when performing a Smog Check inspection and the OIS software communicates with Bureau's central database through the Internet connection. The bar code scanner is used to input technician information, the vehicles identification number (VIN), and Department of Motor Vehicles (DMV) renewal information. The printer provides a Vehicle Inspection Report (VIR) containing inspection results for motorists and a Smog Check Certificate of Compliance number for passing vehicles.

- 30. Data retrieved and recorded during an OIS smog check includes: the eVIN, which is the digitally stored VIN programmed into the vehicle's Powertrain Control Module (PCM); the communication protocol, which is the manufacturer/vehicle specific language the PCM uses to relay information; and the number of Parameter Identifications (PIDs), which is the number of specific data values each PCM uses related to emissions controls.
- 31. During an OIS inspection, engine operating parameters are retrieved from the vehicle's OBD system and recorded to the VID. This is accomplished during the functional portion of the OIS Smog Check inspection by plugging the DAD into the vehicle's DLC when prompted by the OIS analyzer screen prompt. Some of the parameters recorded are:
 - (1) Engine speed in revolutions per minute (RPM).
 - (2) Throttle position as measured by a throttle position sensor (TPS) mounted onto the throttle shaft, measured in a percentage of opening from 0% at idle and near or up to 100% at full throttle.
 - (3) Manifold absolute pressure as measured by a manifold absolute pressure sensor (MAP) connected to an intake manifold source, measured in kilo pascals (kpa). Typical readings for a normally aspirated vehicle are: 0 kpa being absolute vacuum, 25kpa to 45kpa at idle, 101 kpa at full throttle, same as atmospheric pressure at sea level.
 - (4) Mass air flow as measured by a mass air flow sensor (MAF) mounted in the engine's air intake tract, measured in grams per second (gps).
 - (5) Ignition timing is set by the vehicle PCM based on engine speed and load and is measured in degrees Before Top Dead Center (BTDC).
- 32. During normal engine operation at idle, engine speed is relatively steady around its target idle speed. With the engine idling, the TPS is steady and at or near 0%. The MAP and/or MAF readings are also steady. In order for the engine speed to increase, the throttle would have to be opened in order to increase airflow through the engine. The engine's management systems supply fuel and spark timing appropriate to any changes in throttle position and engine speed. An increase in throttle, measured by the TPS, which increases engine RPM, would result in corresponding increases in MAF, as well as a change in MAP. Stated another way, any

movement in the throttle from the idle position will result in an increase of airflow through the engine with corresponding increases RPM and MAF along with changes in MAP.

- 33. During an OIS Smog Check inspection, along with other visual and functional inspections, there is an OBD II query portion of the inspection. The OBD II query is performed with the engine idling and, when requested by the OIS analyzer, an elevated or increased engine speed. The increase in engine speed is performed by the inspector by stepping on the throttle pedal or manually opening the throttle, resulting in a corresponding increase in engine RPMs by allowing an increase in airflow into the engine.
- 34. If the vehicle passes the visual, functional and tailpipe tests, it passes the overall inspection and a Certificate of Compliance is issued and transmitted electronically to the VID. Each Certificate of Compliance has a unique control number so that it can be tracked to determine which Smog Check Station purchased the Certificate of Compliance and to which vehicle it was issued.
- 35. The VID contains registration data from DMV, plus emission standards, vehicle smog check inspections, smog check stations and technicians, and Certificates of Compliance. The VID receives the passing smog check results immediately following the inspection. During the vehicle registration process, the DMV accesses the VID to verify that the vehicle has been tested and certified. The Bureau can also access the VID to view test data on smog check inspections performed at any Smog Check Station, or search for, retrieve, and print a test record for a particular vehicle which has been tested. The EIS or OIS, depending on the test type, also prints a VIR, which is a physical record of the test results and shows the Certificate of Compliance number that was issued if the vehicle passed the smog inspection.
- 36. The smog check technician must sign the VIR under penalty of perjury to indicate that the inspection was done within Bureau guidelines. Smog Check Stations are required by law to maintain a copy of the VIR along with a copy of the repair invoice for three years. The consumer's VIR serves as a receipt and proof that the VID was updated and a Certificate of Compliance was issued. Licensed Smog Check Technicians are the only persons authorized by the Bureau to perform official inspections. They are issued a personal access code and a license,

///

which are used to gain access to the EIS and OIS to perform smog check inspections.

Unauthorized use of another technician's access code or license is prohibited.

37. The Bureau has become aware of methods some Smog Check stations and Smog Check inspectors use to fraudulently issue smog certificates to vehicles that will not pass a Smog Check test on their own, or in some instances, are not even present during the time the test is performed. One method is known as "clean plugging." "Clean plugging" is a method by which another vehicle's properly functioning OBD system, or another source such as defeat devices, are used to generate passing data readings or diagnostic information for the purpose of fraudulently issuing smog certificates to vehicles that are not in smog compliance and or not present for testing. Defeat devices attempt to simulate engine operation during a Smog Check inspection by transmitting OBD data to the VID which has been modified or replaced entirely for the purportedly inspected vehicle during the functional portion of the OIS inspection. The use of a defeat device during a Smog Check inspection is clean plugging and is strictly prohibited.

Station Inspection – January 27, 2022

38. On or about January 27, 2022, a Bureau representative conducted an inspection at Respondent Waterman Smog 1. When the Bureau representative arrived at the station, an inspection on a 1999 Toyota Tacoma had just been completed and the vehicle was still in the testing bay. Bureau records indicated the test was performed under the license of Smog Check Inspector No. EO 641956, Respondent Prieto. However, Respondent Prieto was not present at the station. The Bureau representative identified an employee who admitted to using Respondent Prieto's license and access code to perform the inspection. Respondent Prieto was contacted and arrived at the station shortly thereafter. The Bureau representative informed Respondent Prieto that it was unlawful to use another inspector's license or allow another person to use their license to inspect vehicles. Respondent Prieto was also informed that she was required to keep her passwords private and she was to change her inspector passwords immediately. Respondent Prieto was further informed that failure to properly inspect vehicles was grounds for disciplinary action against her station and inspector licenses.

Station Inspection – April 20, 2023

39. On or about April 20, 2023, a Bureau representative conducted an inspection at Respondent Waterman Smog 1. The Bureau representative reviewed the station testing records and found that the station did not have any records for vehicles failed for Data Check on March 20, 2023 or April 1, 2023. The Bureau representative reviewed estimate and invoice retention requirements with Respondent Prieto. The Bureau representative informed Respondent Prieto that no devices were to be connected between the analyzer OBD II interface and the vehicle being tested and that failure to properly test vehicles was grounds for disciplinary action against her station and inspector licenses.

Station Data Review

40. A Bureau representative reviewed OIS test data for the smog check inspections performed at Respondent Waterman Smog 1. The investigation revealed that data related to certain vehicles certified by Respondents contained a pattern of unmistakable discrepancies between the information transmitted during the inspections and known similar data for the vehicles being tested. Specifically, the Bureau representative observed a pattern of vehicles being certified with engine operating parameters not corresponding to normal engine operation, confirming the vehicles receiving smog certificates were not tested during the OBD functional test, which constitutes clean plugging, as follows:

- 41. On or about March 30, 2023, a 2005 Mercedes-Benz E320, CA License No. 8UGY499, VIN No. WDBUF65J25A698504 (2005 E 320) was tested and Smog Certificate No. TE947665C was issued by Respondent Waterman Smog 1 under the license of Smog Check Inspector No. EO641956, Respondent Prieto.
- 42. The Dynamic PID Chart for the 2005 E 320 shows between time stamp 172 and 18593, engine speed is steady at approximately 700 RPM. During this time, the throttle is fixed at 2% opening, the MAF is fixed at 4.58 gps, MAP is fixed at 32 kPa, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is fixed at -15 degrees BTDC. After time stamp 18593, the engine speed accelerates to approximately 1750 RPM. From the time the engine RPM increases off idle

to the higher RPMs, the throttle is fixed at the same 2% opening, the MAF is fixed at the same 4.58 gps, the MAP is fixed at the same 32 kPa, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is also still fixed at the same -15 degrees BTDC.

- 43. During the entire period the dynamic data was collected, the only parameter that changed was engine RPM. The throttle position, MAF, MAP, and ignition timing advance readings remained unchanged even though the engine speed was increased. These readings are not characteristic or expected for normal engine operation. The discrepancies in the OIS Test Data prove the Data Acquisition Device (DAD) was not connected to the 2005 E 320 being certified, causing the issuance of a fraudulent Smog Check Certificate of Compliance.
- 44. A failing test was performed on the 2005 E 320 at another station on August 2, 2022. During this test, the 2005 E 320 failed the inspection for incomplete OBD II readiness monitors.

- 45. On or about March 31, 2023, a 2006 Toyota Camry LE, no plate, VIN No. 4T1BE32K36U160672 (2006 Camry) was tested and Smog Certificate No. TE947680C was issued by Respondent Waterman Smog 1 under the license of Smog Check Inspector No. EO641956, Respondent Prieto.
- 46. The Dynamic PID Chart for the 2006 Camry shows between time stamp 218 and 17509, engine speed is steady at approximately 700 RPM. During this time the throttle is fixed at 16.5% opening, the MAF is fixed at 2.48 gps, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is fixed at 15 degrees BTDC. After time stamp 17509, the engine speed accelerates to approximately 1550 RPM. From the time the engine RPM increases off idle to the higher RPMs, the throttle is fixed at the same 16.5% opening, the MAF is fixed at the same 2.48 gps, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is also still fixed at the same 15 degrees BTDC.
- 47. During the entire period the dynamic data was collected, the only parameter that changed was engine RPM. The throttle position, MAF, and ignition timing advance readings remained unchanged even though the engine speed was increased. These readings are not characteristic or expected for normal engine operation. The discrepancies in the OIS Test Data

prove the DAD was not connected to the 2006 Camry being certified, causing the issuance of a fraudulent Smog Check Certificate of Compliance.

Clean Plug No. 3

- 48. On or about April 1, 2023, a 2001 Ford Ranger, CA License No. 40067C3, VIN No. 1FTYR10D81TA72839 (2001 Ranger), was tested and Smog Certificate No. TE947684C was issued by Respondent Waterman Smog 1 under the license of Smog Check Inspector No. EO641956, Respondent Prieto.
- 49. The Dynamic PID Chart for the 2001 Ranger shows between time stamp 75 and 42537, engine speed is steady at approximately 675 RPM. During this time the throttle is fixed at 16.5% opening, the MAF is fixed at 1.93 gps, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is fixed at 6 degrees BTDC. After time stamp 42537, the engine speed accelerates to approximately 1475 RPM. From the time the engine RPM increases off idle to the higher RPMs, the throttle is fixed at the same 16.5% opening, the MAF is fixed at the same 1.93 gps, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is also still fixed at the same 6 degrees BTDC.
- 50. During the entire period the dynamic data was collected, the only parameter that changed was engine RPM. The throttle position, MAF, and ignition timing advance readings remained unchanged even though the engine speed was increased. These readings are not characteristic or expected for normal engine operation. The discrepancies in the OIS Test Data prove the DAD was not connected to the 2001 Ranger being certified, causing the issuance of a fraudulent Smog Check Certificate of Compliance.

- 51. On or about July 11, 2023, a 2001 Chevrolet Cavalier Base, CA License No. 6HSJ230, VIN No. 1G1JC524417145827 (2001 Cavalier), was tested and Smog Certificate No. TK301718C was issued by Respondent Waterman Smog 1 under the license of Smog Check Inspector No. EO641956, Respondent Prieto.
- 52. The Dynamic PID Chart for the 2001 Cavalier shows between time stamp 494 and 19697, engine speed is steady at approximately 700 RPM. During this time, the throttle is fixed at 0% opening, the MAP is fixed at 32 kPa, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder

is fixed at 19.5 degrees BTDC. After time stamp 19697, the engine speed accelerates to approximately 1650 RPM. From the time the engine RPM increases off idle to the higher RPMs, the throttle is fixed at the same 0% opening, the MAP is fixed at the same 32 kPa, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is also still fixed at the same 19.5 degrees BTDC.

53. During the entire period the dynamic data was collected, the only parameter that changed was engine RPM. The throttle position, MAP, and ignition timing advance readings remained unchanged even though the engine speed was increased. These readings are not characteristic or expected for normal engine operation. The discrepancies in the OIS Test Data prove the DAD was not connected to the 2001 Cavalier being certified, causing the issuance of a fraudulent Smog Check Certificate of Compliance.

- 54. On or about July 12, 2023 a 2003 Ford Taurus SES, CA License No. 5CET571, VIN No. 1FAFP55UX3A256598 (2003 Taurus), was tested and Smog Certificate No. TK301723C was issued by Respondent Waterman Smog 1 under the license of Smog Check Inspector No. EO641956, Respondent Prieto.
- 55. The Dynamic PID Chart for the 2003 Taurus shows at time stamp 141, engine speed is approximately 625 RPM. Engine speed increases to approximately 800 RPM between time stamp 940 and 1732, before decreasing to approximately 550 RPM between time stamp 2260 and 17931. During this time, the throttle is fixed at 17.3% opening, the MAF is fixed at 4.26 gps, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is fixed at 21 degrees BTDC. After time stamp 17931, the engine speed accelerates to approximately 1650 RPM. From the time the engine RPM increases off idle to the higher RPMs, the throttle is fixed at the same 17.3% opening, the MAF is fixed at the same 4.26 gps, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is also still fixed at the same 21 degrees BTDC.
- 56. During the entire period the dynamic data was collected, the only parameter that changed was engine RPM. The throttle position, MAF, and ignition timing advance readings remained unchanged even though the engine speed was increased. These readings are not characteristic or expected for normal engine operation. The discrepancies in the OIS Test Data

prove the DAD was not connected to the 2003 Taurus being certified, causing the issuance of a fraudulent Smog Check Certificate of Compliance.

57. Two previous failing tests were performed on the 2003 Taurus. The most recent test was performed on June 30, 2023 at Respondent Waterman Smog 1 by Respondent Prieto. During this test, the 2003 Taurus failed the inspection for incomplete OBDII readiness monitors. The Dynamic PID Chart for the data collected during the June 30, 2023 inspection on the 2003 Taurus shows the vehicle idled at approximately 700 RPMs before engine speed was raised to approximately 1875 RPMs and then approximately 2175 RPM by opening the throttle. This represents the expected change in the throttle, MAF, and ignition timing advance parameters as characteristic or expected for normal engine operation. The earlier failing test for the 2003 Taurus was performed on May 30, 2023 at another station. During this test, the 2003 Taurus failed the inspection for incomplete OBDII readiness monitors.

- 58. On or about July 26, 2023, a 2003 Ford Expedition XLT, CA License No. 4YUM146, VIN No. 1FMRU15W43LA08292 (2003 Expedition), was tested and Smog Certificate No. TK823808C was issued by Respondent Waterman Smog 1 under the license of Smog Check Inspector No. EO641956, Respondent Prieto.
- 59. The Dynamic PID Chart for the 2003 Expedition shows between time stamp 68 and 16591, engine speed is steady at approximately 700 RPM. During this time, the throttle is fixed at 19.2% opening, the MAF is fixed at 7.25 gps, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is fixed at 14.5 degrees BTDC. After time stamp 16591, the engine speed accelerates to approximately 1800 RPM. From the time the engine RPM increases off idle to the higher RPMs, the throttle is fixed at the same 19.2% opening, the MAF is fixed at the same 7.25 gps, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is also still fixed at the same 14.5 degrees BTDC.
- 60. During the entire period the dynamic data was collected, the only parameter that changed was engine RPM. The throttle position, MAF, and ignition timing advance readings remained unchanged even though the engine speed was increased. These readings are not characteristic or expected for normal engine operation. The discrepancies in the OIS Test Data

prove the DAD was not connected to the 2003 Expedition being certified, causing the issuance of a fraudulent Smog Check Certificate of Compliance.

Clean Plug No. 7

- 61. On or about July 26, 2023, a 2003 Cadillac Escalade Luxury, CA License No. 5EXF477, VIN No. 1GYEK63N13R299471 (2003 Escalade), was tested and Smog Certificate No. TK823809C was issued by Respondent Waterman Smog 1 under the license of Smog Check Inspector No. EO641956, Respondent Prieto.
- 62. The Dynamic PID Chart for the 2003 Escalade shows between time stamp 112 and 17915, engine speed is steady at approximately 575 RPM. During this time the throttle is fixed at 11.4% opening, the MAF is fixed at 5.5 gps, the MAP is fixed at 35 kPa, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is fixed at 16 degrees BTDC. After time stamp 17915, the engine speed accelerates to approximately 1550 RPM. From the time the engine RPM increases off idle to the higher RPMs, the throttle is fixed at the same 11.4% opening, the MAF is fixed at the same 5.5 gps, the MAP is fixed at the same 35 kPa and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is also still fixed at the same 16 degrees BTDC.
- 63. During the entire period the dynamic data was collected, the only parameter that changed was engine RPM. The throttle position, MAF, MAP, and ignition timing advance readings remained unchanged even though the engine speed was increased. These readings are not characteristic or expected for normal engine operation. The discrepancies in the OIS Test Data prove the DAD was not connected to the 2003 Escalade being certified, causing the issuance of a fraudulent Smog Check Certificate of Compliance.

- 64. On or about August 2, 2023, a 2003 Chevrolet Tahoe C1500, CA License No. 8XXY616, VIN No. 1GNEC13V03R224497 (2003 Tahoe), was tested and Smog Certificate No. TK823836C was issued by Respondent Waterman Smog 1 under the license of Smog Check Inspector No. EO641956, Respondent Prieto.
- 65. The Dynamic PID Chart for the 2003 Tahoe shows between time stamp 111 and 17278, engine speed is steady at approximately 700 RPM. During this time, the throttle is fixed

at 7.5% opening, the MAF is fixed at 4.78 gps, the MAP is fixed at 35 kPa, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is fixed at 20.5 degrees BTDC. After time stamp 17278, the engine speed accelerates to approximately 2100 RPM. From the time the engine RPM increases off idle to the higher RPMs, the throttle is fixed at the same 7.5% opening, the MAF is fixed at the same 4.78 gps, the MAP is fixed at the same 35 kPa and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is also still fixed at the same 20.5 degrees BTDC.

66. During the entire period the dynamic data was collected, the only parameter that changed was engine RPM. The throttle position, MAF, MAP, and ignition timing advance readings remained unchanged even though the engine speed was increased. These readings are not characteristic or expected for normal engine operation. The discrepancies in the OIS Test Data prove the DAD was not connected to the 2003 Tahoe being certified, causing the issuance of a fraudulent Smog Check Certificate of Compliance.

- 67. On or about August 8, 2023, a 2003 Chevrolet Silverado C2500 Heavy Duty, CA License No. 8E16159, VIN No. 1GCHC29U83E307886 (2003 Silverado), was tested and Smog Certificate No. IV238613C was issued by Respondent Waterman Smog 1 under the license of Smog Check Inspector No. EO641956, Respondent Prieto.
- 68. The Dynamic PID Chart for the 2003 Silverado shows between time stamp 146 and 17426, engine speed is steady at approximately 675 RPM. During this time the throttle is fixed at 13.7% opening, the MAF is fixed at 6.92 gps, the MAP is fixed at 38 kPa, and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is fixed at 15.5 degrees BTDC. After time stamp 17426, the engine speed accelerates to approximately 1950 RPM. From the time the engine RPM increases off idle to the higher RPMs, the throttle is fixed at the same 13.7% opening, the MAF is fixed at the same 6.92 gps, the MAP is fixed at the same 38 kPa and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is also still fixed at the same 15.5 degrees BTDC.
- 69. During the entire period the dynamic data was collected, the only parameter that changed was engine RPM. The throttle position, MAF, MAP, and ignition timing advance readings remained unchanged even though the engine speed was increased. These readings are

not characteristic or expected for normal engine operation. The discrepancies in the OIS Test Data prove the DAD was not connected to the 2003 Silverado being certified, causing the issuance of a fraudulent Smog Check Certificate of Compliance.

Clean Plug No. 10

- 70. On or about September 9, 2023, a 2006 Chevrolet Express G3500, CA License No. 8Z99972, VIN No. 1GBHG31U761270397 (2006 Express), was tested and Smog Certificate No. TO009713C was issued by Respondent Waterman Smog 1 under the license of Smog Check Inspector No. EO641956, Respondent Prieto.
- 71. The Dynamic PID Chart for the 2006 Express shows between time stamp 94 and 17535, engine speed is steady at approximately 675 RPM. During this time, the throttle is fixed at 0% opening, the MAF is fixed at 5.55 gps, the MAP is fixed at 35 kPa, and the ignition timing advance for #1 cylinder is fixed at 14 degrees BTDC. After time stamp 17535, the engine speed accelerates to approximately 1700 RPM. From the time the engine RPM increases off idle to the higher RPMs, the throttle is fixed at the same 0% opening, the MAF is fixed at the same 5.55 gps, the MAP is fixed at the same 35 kPa and the ignition timing advance for the No. 1 cylinder is also still fixed at the same 14 degrees BTDC.
- 72. During the entire period the dynamic data was collected, the only parameter that changed was engine RPM. The throttle position, MAF, MAP, and ignition timing advance readings remained unchanged even though the engine speed was increased. These readings are not characteristic or expected for normal engine operation. The discrepancies in the OIS Test Data prove the DAD was not connected to the 2006 Express being certified, causing the issuance of a fraudulent Smog Check Certificate of Compliance.

FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Untrue or Misleading Statements – Respondent Waterman Smog 1)

73. Respondent Waterman Smog 1's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action under Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(1), in that, with respect to the 10 vehicles identified above, Respondent Waterman Smog 1 made or authorized statements which they knew, or in the exercise of reasonable care should have known to be untrue or misleading, as

follows: Respondent Waterman Smog 1 certified that these vehicles had passed inspection and were in compliance with applicable laws and regulations, when in fact, Respondent Waterman Smog 1 conducted the inspections on the vehicles using the clean plugging method in order to issue smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 41-72, as though fully set forth herein.

SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Fraud – Respondent Waterman Smog 1)

74. Respondent Waterman Smog 1's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action under Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(4), in that, with respect to the 10 vehicles identified above, Respondent Waterman Smog 1 committed acts which constitute fraud by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for these vehicles without performing bona fide inspections of the emissions control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 41-72, as though fully set forth herein.

THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Material Violation of Automotive Repair Act – Respondent Waterman Smog 1)

75. Respondent Waterman Smog 1's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action under Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(6), in that, with respect to the 10 vehicles identified above, Respondent Waterman Smog 1 failed in a material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to it by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for these vehicles without performing bona fide inspections of the emissions control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 41-72, as though fully set forth herein.

///

FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Waterman Smog 1)

- 76. Respondent Waterman Smog 1's Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License is subject to disciplinary action under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that, with respect to the 10 vehicles identified above, Respondent Waterman Smog 1 failed to comply with the following sections of the Health and Safety Code:
- a. <u>Section 44012:</u> Respondent Waterman Smog 1 failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on the vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the Bureau.
- b. <u>Section 44015, subdivision (b):</u> Respondent Waterman Smog 1 issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles without ensuring that the vehicles were properly tested and inspected to determine if they were in compliance with Health and Safety Code section 44012.
- c. <u>Section 44059:</u> Respondent Waterman Smog 1 willfully made false entries for the electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles by certifying that the vehicles had been inspected as required when, in fact, they had not.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 41-72, as though fully set forth herein.

FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Waterman Smog 1)

- 77. Respondent Waterman Smog 1's Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License is subject to disciplinary action under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that, with respect to the 10 vehicles identified above, Respondent Waterman Smog 1 failed to comply with provisions of the California Code of Regulations, title 16, as follows:
- a. <u>Section 3340.24, subdivision (c):</u> Respondent Waterman Smog 1 issued false or fraudulent certificates of compliance for the vehicles.

28 | ///

- b. <u>Section 3340.35, subdivision (c):</u> Respondent Waterman Smog 1 issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles even though the vehicles had not been inspected in accordance with section 3340.42 of the California Code of Regulations, title 16.
- c. <u>Section 3340.41, subdivision (c):</u> Respondent Waterman Smog 1 knowingly entered false information into the emissions inspection system for the vehicles.
- d. <u>Section 3340.42:</u> Respondent Waterman Smog 1 failed to ensure that the required smog tests were conducted on the vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.
- e. <u>Section 3373:</u> Respondent Waterman Smog 1 withheld or inserted statements or information in an estimate, invoice, work order, or record required to be maintained by California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.15, subdivision (e), which caused the document to be false or misleading for the vehicles.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 41-72, as though fully set forth herein.

SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud, or Deceit – Respondent Waterman Smog 1)

78. Respondent Waterman Smog 1's Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License is subject to disciplinary action under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in conjunction with Health and Safety Code section 44072.10, subdivision (c), in that, with respect to the 10 vehicles identified above, Respondent Waterman Smog 1 committed dishonest, fraudulent, or deceitful acts whereby another was injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 41-72, as though fully set forth herein.

///

27 | ///

28 | ///

SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Prieto)

- 79. Respondent Prieto's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to disciplinary action under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that, with respect to the 10 vehicles identified above, Respondent Prieto violated the following Health and Safety Code sections:
- a. <u>Section 44012, subdivision (a):</u> Respondent Prieto failed to determine that all emission control devices and systems required by law were installed and functioning correctly on the vehicles in accordance with test procedures prescribed by the Bureau.
- b. <u>Section 44012, subdivision (f):</u> Respondent Prieto failed to perform emission control tests on the vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the Bureau.
- c. <u>Section 44032:</u> Respondent Prieto failed to perform tests of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles identified above in accordance with section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code, in that the vehicles had been clean plugged.
- d. <u>Section 44059:</u> Respondent Prieto willfully made false entries for the electronic certificates of compliance by certifying that the vehicles had been inspected as required when, in fact, they had not.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 41-72, as though fully set forth herein.

EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Prieto)

- 80. Respondent Prieto's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to disciplinary action under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that, with respect to the 10 vehicles identified above, Respondent Prieto failed to comply with provisions of the California Code of Regulations, title 16, as follows:
- a. <u>Section 3340.24, subdivision (c):</u> Respondent Prieto issued false or fraudulent electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles.

- b. <u>Section 3340.30, subdivision (a):</u> Respondent Prieto failed to inspect and test the vehicles in accordance with Health and Safety Code sections 44012 and 44035 and California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42.
- c. <u>Section 3340.41, subdivision (c):</u> Respondent Prieto knowingly entered false information into the emissions inspection system for the vehicles.
- d. <u>Section 3340.42:</u> Respondent Prieto failed to ensure that the required smog tests were conducted on the vehicles identified above in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 41-72, as though fully set forth herein.

NINTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud, or Deceit – Respondent Prieto)

81. Respondent Prieto's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to disciplinary action under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in conjunction with Health and Safety Code section 44072.10, subdivision (c), in that, with respect to the 10 vehicles identified above, Respondent Prieto committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit when she issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations set forth above in paragraphs 41-72, as though fully set forth herein.

OTHER MATTERS

- 82. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 9884.7, subdivision (c), the Director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this state by Respondent Waterman Smog 1, upon a finding that it has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of the laws and regulations pertaining to an automotive repair dealer.
- 83. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License No. RC 294660, issued to Respondent Waterman Smog 1, is revoked or

7. Taking such other and further action	as deemed necessary and proper.
DATED: As of digital signature date	TRICK DORAIS
Chi	ief
Dej Sta	reau of Automotive Repair partment of Consumer Affairs te of California
Con	mplainant
I A 2024604091	
67225546_2.docx	
	26
	DATED: As of digital signature date PA Chi Bui Dep Sta Coi

(GABRIELA PRIETO, DBA WATERMAN SMOG 1 and GABRIELA PRIETO) ACCUSATION