1	ROB BONTA						
2	Attorney General of California ARMANDO ZAMBRANO						
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General WILLIAM D. GARDNER						
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 244817						
5	300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, CA 90013						
6 7	Telephone: (213) 269-6292 Facsimile: (916) 731-2126 E-mail: William.Gardner@doj.ca.gov Attorneys for Complainant						
8							
	BEFOR DEPARTMENT OF CO						
9	FOR THE BUREAU OF A STATE OF C						
10	STATE OF C.	ALIFURNIA					
11	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 79/24-15584					
12	OSCAR ANTONIO FLORES, DBA						
13	DANIEL SMOG CHECK TEST ONLY 450 N Waterman Ave., Unit D	ACCUSATION					
14	San Bernardino, CA 92410	THE COUNTY OF THE PROPERTY OF					
15	Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 287850						
16	Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License No. TC 287850,						
17	and						
18	OSCAR ANTONIO FLORES						
19	450 N Waterman Ave., Unit D San Bernardino, CA 92410						
20	Smog Check Inspector License No. EO						
21	640105						
22	Respondent.						
23	DAD	riec					
24	PART						
25	1. Patrick Dorais (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as						
26	the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair, Department of Consumer Affairs.						
27	2. On or about June 26, 2017, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Automotive						
28	Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 287850	to Oscar Antonio Flores (Respondent), dba					
		1					

Daniel Smog Check Test Only. The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on June 30, 2026, unless renewed.

- 3. On or about August 10, 2017, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License Number TC 287850 to Respondent, dba Daniel Smog Check Test Only. The Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on June 30, 2026, unless renewed.
- 4. On or about October 30, 2017, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued a STAR station certification to Respondent, dba Daniel Smog Check Test Only. The STAR station certification was suspended on September 14, 2023.
- 5. On or about March 10, 2017, Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Smog Check Inspector License Number EO 640105 to Respondent. The Smog Check Inspector License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on October 31, 2026, unless renewed.

JURISDICTION

- 6. Business and Professions Code ("BPC") section 9884.13 provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration of a valid registration shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary proceeding against an automotive repair dealer or to render a decision temporarily or permanently invalidating (suspending or revoking) a registration.
- 7. Health and Safety Code ("HSC") section 44002 provides, in pertinent part, that the Director has all the powers and authority granted under the Automotive Repair Act for enforcing the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.
- 8. Section 44072.6 of the HSC provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration or suspension of a license by operation of law, or by order or decision of the Director of Consumer Affairs, or a court of law, or the voluntary surrender of the license shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with disciplinary action.

///

R || ///

STATUTORY PROVISIONS

- 9. Section 9884.7 of the BPC states, in pertinent part:
- "(a) The director, where the automotive repair dealer cannot show there was a bona fide error, may refuse to validate, or may invalidate temporarily or permanently, the registration of an automotive repair dealer for any of the following acts or omissions related to the conduct of the business of the automotive repair dealer, which are done by the automotive repair dealer or any automotive technician, employee, partner, officer, or member of the automotive repair dealer.
 - (1) Making or authorizing in any manner or by any means whatever any statement written or oral which is untrue or misleading, and which is known, or which by the exercise of reasonable care should be known, to be untrue or misleading
 - (4) Any other conduct which constitutes fraud.

. . . .

- (6) Failure in any material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to it."
- 10. Section 44012 of the HSC provides, in pertinent part, that tests at smog check stations shall be performed in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- 11. Section 44015, subdivision (b), of the HSC provides that a certificate of compliance shall be issued if a vehicle meets the requirements of HSC section 40012.
- 12. Section 44032 of the HSC states, in pertinent part, that: (1) no person may perform tests or repairs of emission control devices or systems of motor vehicles required by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program unless the person performing the test or repair is a licensed qualified smog check technician; and (2) all tests must be conducted in accordance with section 44012 (i.e. Motor Vehicle Inspection Program Requirements).
 - 13. Section 44059 of the HSC provides:

"The willful making of any false statement or entry with regard to a material matter in any oath, affidavit, certificate of compliance or noncompliance, or application form which is required by this chapter or Chapter 20.3 (commencing with Section 9880) of Division 3 of the Business and Professions Code, constitutes perjury and is punishable as provided in the Penal Code."

14. Section 44072.2 of the HSC states, in pertinent part:

"The director may suspend, revoke, or take other disciplinary action against a license as provided in this article if the licensee, or any partner, officer, or director thereof, does any of the following:

- "(a) Violates any section of this chapter [the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program (Health and Saf. Code, sec. 44000, et seq.)] and the regulations adopted pursuant to it, which related to the licensed activities
 - "(c) Violates any of the regulations adopted by the director pursuant to this chapter.
- "(d) Commits any act involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another is injured.
- 15. Section 44072.10, subdivision (c), of the HSC states:

The department shall revoke the license of any smog check technician or station licensee who fraudulently certifies vehicles or participates in the fraudulent inspection of vehicles. A fraudulent inspection includes, but is not limited to, all of the following:

- (1) Clean piping, clean plugging, clean glassing, clean tanking, or any other fraudulent inspection practice, as defined by the department.
 - (2) Tampering with a vehicle emission control system or test analyzer system.
- (3) Tampering with a vehicle in a manner that would cause the vehicle to falsely pass or falsely fail an inspection.
- (4) Intentional or willful violation of [the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program] or any regulation, standard, or procedure of the department implementing [the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program].
- 16. Section 44072.8 of the HSC states that when a license has been revoked or suspended following a hearing under this article, any additional license issued under this chapter in the name of the licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the director.

REGULATORY PROVISIONS

17. California Code of Regulations ("CCR"), title 16, section 3340.24, subdivision (c), states:

"The bureau may suspend or revoke the license of or pursue other legal action against a licensee, if the licensee falsely or fraudulently issues or obtains a certificate of compliance or a certificate of noncompliance."

18. California Code of Regulations ("CCR"), title 16, section 3340.30, subdivision (a), states in pertinent part:

"A licensed smog check inspector and/or repair technician shall comply with the following requirements at all times while licensed:

"(a) Inspect, test and repair vehicles, as applicable, in accordance with section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code, section 44035 of the Health and Safety Code, and section 3340.42 of this article.

. . . .

- 19. CCR, title 16, section 3340.35, subdivision (c), states that a licensed smog check station "shall issue a certificate of compliance or noncompliance to the owner or operator of any vehicle that has been inspected in accordance with the procedures specified in section 3340.42 of this article and has all the required emission control equipment and devices installed and functioning correctly."
- 20. CCR, title 16, section 3340.41, subdivision (b), provides: "No person shall enter into the emissions inspection system any access or qualification number other than as authorized by the bureau, nor in any way tamper with the emissions inspection system."
- 21. CCR, title 16, section 3340.42, sets forth specific emissions test methods and procedures which apply to all vehicles inspected in the State of California.

COST RECOVERY

22. Section 125.3, subdivision (a), of the BPC provides, in pertinent part, that a Board "may request the administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case."

///

///

SUMMARY OF OIS SMOG CHECK INSPECTION PROGRAM

- 23. Beginning March 9, 2015, California's Smog Check Program was updated to require the use of an On-Board Diagnostic Inspection System (OIS). OIS is the Smog Check equipment required in all areas of the State when inspecting most model-year 2000 and newer gasoline and hybrid vehicles and most 1998 and newer diesel vehicles. The system consists of a certified Data Acquisition Device (DAD), computer, bar code scanner, and printer. The DAD is an On Board Diagnostic (OBD) scan tool that, when requested by the California OIS software, retrieves OBD data from the vehicle. All OBD data that the vehicle indicates it supports is requested by the California OIS software and will be retrieved.
- 24. The DAD connects between the OIS computer and the vehicle's Diagnostic Link Connector (DLC) located in the vehicle's passenger compartment, which allows for the retrieval of information from the vehicle's on-board computer system. The California OIS software requires a continuous Internet connection when performing a Smog Check inspection and the OIS software communicates with BAR's central database through the Internet connection. The bar code scanner is used to input technician information, the vehicle's identification number (VIN), and DMV renewal information. The printer provides a Vehicle Inspection Report (VIR) containing inspection results for motorists and a Smog Check Certificate of Compliance number for passing vehicles.
- 25. Data retrieved and recorded during an OIS smog check includes: the eVIN, which is the digitally stored VIN programmed by the manufacturer into the vehicle's Powertrain Control Module (PCM); the communication protocol, which is the manufacturer/vehicle specific language the PCM uses to Relay or communicate information. The communication protocol is programmed into the vehicle's on-board computer during manufacture and does not change.
- 26. Other data retrieved and recorded during an OIS smog check includes the number of Parameter Identifications (PIDs), which refers to the number of specific data values that the vehicle's PCM uses related to emissions controls. The specific data values associated with a vehicle's PIDs are also retrieved and recorded during an OIS smog check inspection. That data include things such as the vehicle's engine speed, throttle position, manifold absolute pressure

and the engine's mass air flow readings throughout an inspection. Accordingly, the following types of data are recorded during an OIS smog check inspection:

- Engine speed in revolutions per minute (RPM)
- Throttle position as measured by a throttle position sensor (TPS) mounted onto the throttle shaft. Measured in a percentage of opening from 0% at idle and near or up to 100% at full throttle.
- Manifold absolute pressure as measured by a manifold air pressure sensor (MAP)
 connected to an intake manifold source, measured in kilo pascals (kpa). Typical
 readings for a normally aspirated vehicle as follows: 0 kpa being absolute vacuum,
 25kpa to 45kpa at idle, 101 kpa at full throttle, same as atmospheric pressure at sea
 level.
- Mass air flow as measured by a mass air flow sensor (MAF) mounted in the engine's air intake tract. Measured in grams per second (gps).
- Ignition timing is set by the vehicle PCM based on engine speed and load, and is measured in degrees Before Top Dead Center (BTDC).
- 27. BAR has become aware of methods that some Smog Check stations and Smog Check inspectors use to fraudulently issue smog certificates to vehicles that will not pass a Smog Check test, or in some instances, are not even present during the time that the test is performed. One such method, which is known as "clean plugging", involves using another vehicle's properly functioning OBD II system, or another source such as a defeat device/simulator, to generate passing data readings or diagnostic information for the purpose of fraudulently issuing smog certificates to vehicles that are not in smog compliance and/or are not present for testing.
- 28. Defeat devices attempt to simulate engine operation during a Smog Check inspection by transmitting OBD II data to the VID that has been modified or replaced entirely for the purportedly inspected vehicle during the functional portion of the OIS inspection. The use of a defeat device/simulator during a Smog Check inspection constitutes clean plugging and is strictly prohibited. As described in more detail below, BAR is able to utilize the data retrieved and

recorded during an OIS smog check to identify inspections in which a defeat device/simulator was used.

29. During an OIS Smog Check inspection, the vehicle is monitored and PID data readings are obtained while the engine is idling and also when the smog check inspector is prompted to increase the engine speed to a certain level and then maintain that speed for a period of time. In order for the engine speed to increase, the throttle must be opened to increase airflow through the engine. An increase in the throttle position, increases the engine speed as measured in RPM and results in a corresponding increase in the mass air flow rate (MAF) as well as a change in the manifold absolute pressure (MAP).

FACTUAL BACKGROUND

- 30. Clean plugging is apparent in cases where the data recorded during an OIS smog check shows that the engine speed as measured in RPM increases during the test but the throttle position remains unchanged, the mass air flow rate is unchanged and the manifold absolute pressure is unchanged. Because engine speed as measured in RPM cannot increase without corresponding increases in the throttle position and MAF, changes in the MAP and ignition timing advances, test data in such cases shows that a defeat device was used to simulate engine speed (RPM) readings for a vehicle that was not actually tested.
- 31. A Bureau program representative initiated an investigation in which he reviewed specific OIS Test Data for inspections performed at Respondent's smog check station from October 6, 2023 to May 27, 2024. The investigation revealed that the data related to certain vehicles certified by Respondent contained a pattern of unmistakable discrepancies between the PID information transmitted during the inspections and the recognized and scientifically established characteristics of internal combustion engine operation.
- 32. Specifically, the Bureau program representative identified 10 instances in which the throttle position, ignition timing advance, MAP and/or MAF¹ readings all remained unchanged when the vehicle's engine RPM was increased off idle to the higher RPMs. Such conditions

¹ Not all vehicle manufacturers include both MAP and MAF parameters. As a result, many vehicles will have either MAP or MAF parameters rather than both.

could not have occurred if the DAD had been connected to the vehicles that were purportedly being tested instead of a defeat device that simulated engine RPM.

The documented discrepancies in the data related to the tests at issue confirm that Respondents engaged in the illegal activity of clean plugging in order to issue fraudulent certificates of compliance for the vehicles at issue. The following chart ("Table 1") illustrates the documented clean plugging activities by Respondents during the period reviewed.

Table 1

Test Date	Vehicle Certified & License No./VIN	Certificate No.	Test Details
October 6, 2023	2000 Toyota Corolla VE VIN # 1NXBR12E2YZ310924	TO243369C	Inspection performed by Respondent. Throttle position, MAF, and ignition timing advance readings unchanged when engine RPM was increased off idle to 1850.
November 4, 2023	2003 Toyota Camry LE VIN # 4T1BF30K13U043765	TO411315C	Inspection performed by Respondent. Throttle position, MAF and ignition timing advance readings unchanged when engine RPM was increased off idle to 1850.
November 12, 2023	2002 Toyota RAV4 VIN # JTEGH20V420054074	TO411323C	Inspection performed by Respondent. Throttle position, MAF and ignition timing advance readings unchanged when engine RPM was increased off idle to 2050.
December 1, 2023	2000 Toyota 4Runner Limited VIN # JT3GN87R4Y0151846	TO411339C	Inspection performed by Respondent. Throttle position, MAF and ignition timing advance readings unchanged when engine RPM was increased off idle to 2250.

1 2 3 4 5	January 11, 2024	2004 Toyota Sienna CE VIN # 5TDZA23C64S088478	IX897831C	Inspection performed by Respondent. Throttle position, MAF and ignition timing advance readings unchanged when engine RPM was increased off idle to 1825.
6 7 8 9 10	January 19, 2024	2000 Subaru Legacy Outback Limited VIN # 4S3BE6867Y7204173	IX897834C	Inspection performed by Respondent. Throttle position, MAP, MAF and ignition timing advance readings unchanged when engine RPM was increased off idle to 1725.
11 12 13 14 15	January 27, 2024	2001 Honda Accord EX VIN # JHMCG66871C011925	IX897846C	Inspection performed by Respondent. Throttle position, MAP and ignition timing advance readings unchanged when engine RPM was increased off idle to 2125.
16 17 18 19 20	February 12, 2024	2000 Toyota Camry CE VIN # JT2BG22K7Y0392929	TS312012C	Inspection performed by Respondent. Throttle position, MAP and ignition timing advance readings unchanged when engine RPM was increased off idle to 2000.
21 22 23 24 25	February 26, 2024	2000 Lexus ES 300 VIN # JT8BF28GXY0266723	TS312035C	Inspection performed by Respondent. Throttle position, MAF and ignition timing advance readings unchanged when engine RPM was increased off idle to 1825.
26 27 28				

1 2 3	May 27, 2024	2000 GMC New Sierra K1500 VIN # 1GTEK19VXYZ272311	TW070134C	Inspection performed by Respondent. Throttle position, MAP, MAF and ignition timing	
4 5		1012117 111127 2 511		advance readings unchanged when engine RPM was increased off idle to 1775.	
6					
7		FIRST CAUSE FO	OR DISCIPLINE		
8	(Misleading Statements: Automotive Repair Dealer Registration)				
9	34. Respondent has subjected his registration to discipline under BPC section 9884.7,				
10	subdivision (a)(1), in that Respondent made statements which were known to be untrue or				
11	misleading or, which by exercise of reasonable care should have been known to be untrue or				
12	misleading, when issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles set forth in				
13	Table 1, above, certifying that those vehicles were in compliance with applicable laws and				
14	regulations when, in fact, those vehicles had not been so inspected. Complainant refers to, and by				
15	this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 30 through 33, inclusive, as				
16	though set forth fully herein.				
17	SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE				
18	(Fraud: Automotive Repair Dealer Registration)				
19	35. Respondent has subjected his registration to discipline under BPC section 9884.7,				
20	subdivision (a)(4), in that Respondent committed acts that constitute fraud by issuing electronic				
21	smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above, without performing				
22	bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby				
23	depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle				
24	Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations				
25	contained in paragraphs 30 through 33, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.				
26					
27					
28	///				
Į.	i				

- Section 3340.24, subdivision (c): Respondent falsely or fraudulently issued electronic smog certificates of compliance without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles as required by HSC section 44012.
- Section 3340.35, subdivision (c): Respondent issued electronic smog certificates of compliance even though those vehicles had not been inspected in accordance with section
- Section 3340.42: Respondent failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on those vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud and/or Deceit: Station License)

Respondent has subjected his station license to discipline under HSC section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in conjunction with HSC section 44072.10, subdivision (c), in that, with respect to the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above, Respondent committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another was injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for those vehicles without performing bona fide inspections and functional testing of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs

SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Violation of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program: Inspector License)

- Respondent has subjected his smog check inspector license to discipline under HSC section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that, with respect to the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above,
- Section 44012: Respondent failed to ensure that the onboard diagnostic system tests were performed on those vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.

///

28

NINTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit: Inspector License)

42. Respondent has subjected his smog check inspector license to discipline under HSC section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in conjunction with HSC section 44072.10, subdivision (c), in that, with respect to the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above, Respondent committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud or deceit whereby another was injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for those vehicles without performing bona fide inspections and functional testing of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 30 through 33, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

OTHER MATTERS

- 43. Section 9884.7, subdivision (c), of the BPC states that "the director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this state by an automotive repair dealer upon a finding that the automotive repair dealer has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of this chapter, or regulations adopted pursuant to."
- 44. Section 44072.8 of the HSC states that when a license has been revoked or suspended following a hearing, any additional license issued under the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program (Health & Saf. Code Sec. 44000, et seq.) in the name of the licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the director.

<u>PRAYER</u>

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- Revoking or suspending Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD
 287850, issued to Oscar Antonio Flores, dba Daniel Smog Check Test Only;
- Revoking or suspending Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License Number TC 287850, issued to Oscar Antonio Flores, dba Daniel Smog Check Test Only;