#### BEFORE THE DIRECTOR OF THE

#### **DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS**

#### **BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR**

#### STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Accusation Against:

#### RRAT SERVICES, dba ALOHA SMOG, RAMESH THOLLA, PRESIDENT

2720 Artesia Blvd., Ste. B

Redondo Beach, CA 90278

#### **Mailing Address:**

11890 Pyxis Cir.

Rancho Cordova, CA 95742

Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 281987

Smog Check Test Only Station License No. TC 281987

and

#### SAMIR SALIM HADDAD

6209 Reseda Blvd. Ste 228

Reseda, CA 91355

Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 304144

Smog Check Repair Technician License No. El 304144,

Respondents.

Case No. 79/18-7316

OAH No. 20119090649

#### **DECISION**

The attached Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is hereby accepted and adopted by the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs as the Decision in the above-entitled matter.

This Decision shall become effective on March 23, 2020

DATED: Feb. 6,2020

GRACE ARUPO RODRIGUEZ
Assistant Deputy Director
Legal Affairs Division
Department of Consumer Affairs

- 1	,	·	
1	XAVIER BECERRA		
2	Attorney General of California SHAWN P. COOK		
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General ANDREW AMARA		
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 271311		
5	300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 269-6531		
6	Facsimile: (916) 731-2126	•	
7	Attorneys for Complainant		
8	BEFORE THE		
9	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS		
10	FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
11			
12			
13	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 79/18-7316	
14	RRAT SERVICES, dba ALOHA SMOG, Ramesh Tholla, President	OAH No. 20119090649	
15 16 17 18	2720 Artesia Blvd., Ste. B, Redondo Beach, CA 90278 (Business Address) 11890 Pyxis Cir., Rancho Cordova, CA 95742 (Mailing Address) Automotive Repair Dealer No. ARD 281987 Smog Check Station No. TC 281987	STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AND DISCIPLINARY ORDER	
19	AND		
20	SAMIR SALIM HADDAD 6209 Reseda Blvd., Ste. 228		
21	Reseda, CA 91355 Smog Check Inspector No. EO 304144		
22	Smog Check Repair No. EI 304144		
23	Respondents.		
24	) the state of the		
25			
26	IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGR	EED by and between the parties to the above-	
27	entitled proceedings that the following matters are	e true:	
28			
1			

## 

## 

## 

## 

## 

## 

## 

///

#### **PARTIES**

- 1. Patrick Dorais (Complainant) is the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair (Bureau). He brought this action solely in his official capacity and is represented in this matter by Xavier Becerra, Attorney General of the State of California, by Andrew Amara, Deputy Attorney General.
- 2. Respondent RRAT Services, dba Aloha Smog; Ramesh Tholla (Respondent Aloha Smog) is represented in this proceeding by attorney William Ferreira, whose address is: San Francisco Office, 555 California Street, Suite 4925, San Francisco, CA 94104
- 3. On or about November 10, 2015, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 281987 to Respondent Aloha Smog. The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought in Accusation No. 79/18-7316, and will expire on November 30, 2020, unless renewed.
- 4. On or about January 7, 2016, the Bureau issued Smog Check Test Only Station License No. TC 281987 to Respondent Aloha Smog. The Smog Check Test Only Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought in Accusation No. 79/18-7316, and will expire on November 30, 2020, unless renewed.
- 5. On or about April 20, 2016, the Bureau issued STAR Station Certification to Respondent Aloha Smog.
- 6. Pursuant to California Code of Regulations, title 16 section 3340.28, subdivision (e), Samir Salim Haddad's (Respondent Haddad) license was renewed pursuant to his election as Smog Check Inspector (EO) License No. 304144 and Smog Check Repair Technician (El) License No. 304144, effective March 4, 2013. The Smog Check Inspector (EO) License expires on May 31, 2021, unless renewed. The Smog Check Repair Technician (EI) License expires on May 31, 2021, unless renewed. Respondent Haddad is represented in this proceeding by attorney William Ferreira, whose address is listed above.
- 7. Respondent Aloha Smog and Respondent Haddad may be referred to collectively as Respondents herein.

#### **JURISDICTION**

- 8. Accusation No. 79/18-7316 was filed before the Director, and is currently pending against Respondents. The Accusation and all other statutorily required documents were properly served on Respondents on November 9, 2018. Respondents timely filed their Notice of Defense contesting the Accusation.
- 9. A copy of Accusation No. 79/18-7316 is attached as exhibit A and incorporated herein by reference.

#### ADVISEMENT AND WAIVERS

- 10. Respondents have carefully read, fully discussed with counsel, and understand the charges and allegations in Accusation No. 79/18-7316. Respondents have also carefully read, fully discussed with counsel, and understand the effects of this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order.
- 11. Respondents are fully aware of their legal rights in this matter, including the right to a hearing on the charges and allegations in the Accusation; the right to confront and cross-examine the witnesses against them; the right to present evidence and to testify on their own behalf; the right to the issuance of subpoenas to compel the attendance of witnesses and the production of documents; the right to reconsideration and court review of an adverse decision; and all other rights accorded by the California Administrative Procedure Act and other applicable laws.
- 12. Respondents each voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently waive and give up each and every right set forth above.

#### **CULPABILITY**

- 13. Respondents each understand and agree that the charges and allegations in Accusation No. 79/18 - 7316, if proven at a hearing, constitute cause for imposing discipline upon their Contractor's Licenses.
- 14. For the purpose of resolving the Accusation without the expense and uncertainty of further proceedings, Respondents agree that, at a hearing, Complainant could establish a factual basis for the charges in the Accusation, and that Respondents each hereby give up their right to contest those charges.

15. Respondents agree that their registration and licenses are subject to discipline and they agree to be bound by the Director's probationary terms as set forth in the Disciplinary Order below.

#### RESERVATION

16. The admissions made by Respondents herein are only for the purposes of this proceeding, or any other proceedings in which the Director of Consumer Affairs, Bureau of Automotive Repair, or other professional licensing agency is involved, and shall not be admissible in any other criminal or civil proceeding.

#### AMENDMENT TO ACCUSATION

- 17. Complainant agrees and stipulates to amend Accusation No. 79/18-7316 to remove/drop/dismiss the following fraud counts:
  - a) Second Cause for Discipline, pg. 11, paragraph 40, as to Respondent Aloha Smog;
  - b) Sixth Cause for Discipline, pg. 13, paragraph 44, as to Respondent Aloha Smog;
  - c) Ninth Cause for Discipline, pg. 15, paragraph 46, as to Respondent Haddad.

Complainant shall amend, serve, and file the First Amended Accusation, with these fraud counts removed, within 30 days of approval of this stipulation.

#### **NEW LICENSE APPLICATION**

18. A corporate officer of Respondent Aloha Smog recently applied for a license issued by Complainant, and was denied. Complainant agrees and stipulates to allowing that corporate officer to immediately submit a new application, pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 486(a), which allows the Bureau to prescribe an earlier date for re-application. Complainant does **NOT** stipulate to the outcome of that re-application, but agrees and stipulates that the allegations contained in the subject Accusation shall not be used as a basis for denial.

#### **CONTINGENCY**

19. This stipulation shall be subject to approval by the Director of Consumer Affairs or the Director's designee. Respondents each understand and agree that counsel for Complainant and the staff of the Bureau of Automotive Repair may communicate directly with the Director

and staff of the Department of Consumer Affairs regarding this stipulation and settlement, without notice to or participation by Respondents or their counsel. By signing the stipulation, Respondents understand and agree that they may not withdraw his agreement or seek to rescind the stipulation prior to the time the Director considers and acts upon it. If the Director fails to adopt this stipulation as the Decision and Order, the Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order shall be of no force or effect, except for this paragraph, it shall be inadmissible in any legal action between the parties, and the Director shall not be disqualified from further action by having considered this matter.

- 20. The parties understand and agree that Portable Document Format (PDF) and facsimile copies of this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order, including PDF and facsimile signatures thereto, shall have the same force and effect as the originals.
- 21. This Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is intended by the parties to be an integrated writing representing the complete, final, and exclusive embodiment of their agreement. It supersedes any and all prior or contemporaneous agreements, understandings, discussions, negotiations, and commitments (written or oral). This Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order may not be altered, amended, modified, supplemented, or otherwise changed except by a writing executed by an authorized representative of each of the parties.
- 22. In consideration of the foregoing admissions and stipulations, the parties agree that the Director may, without further notice or formal proceeding, issue and enter the following Disciplinary Order:

#### **DISCIPLINARY ORDER**

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 281987 issued on November 10, 2015, and Smog Check Test Only Station License No. TC 281987 issued to RRAT Services, dba Aloha Smog; and Smog Check Inspector (EO) License No. 304144 and Smog Check Repair Technician (El) License No. 304144 issued to Samir Salim Haddad, are each and both revoked. However, the revocation is stayed and Respondents are placed on probation for three (3) years on the following terms and conditions.

1. Obey All Laws. During the period of probation, Respondents shall comply with all

12

10

20

25

federal and state statutes, regulations and rules governing all BAR registrations and licenses held by Respondent.

- 2. Quarterly Reporting. During the period of probation, Respondents shall report either by personal appearance or in writing as determined by BAR on a schedule set by BAR, but no more frequently than once each calendar quarter, on the methods used and success achieved in maintaining compliance with the terms and conditions of probation.
- 3. Report Financial Interests. Respondents shall, within 30 days of the effective date of the decision and within 30 days from the date of any request by BAR during the period of probation, report any financial interest which any Respondent or any partners, officers, or owners of any Respondents facility may have in any other business required to be registered pursuant to Section 9884.6 of the Business and Professions Code.
- 4. Access to Examine Vehicles and Records. Respondents shall provide BAR representatives unrestricted access to examine all vehicles (including parts) undergoing service, inspection, or repairs, up to and including the point of completion. Respondents shall also provide BAR representatives unrestricted access to all records pursuant to BAR laws and regulations.
- 5. Tolling of Probation. If, during probation, either Respondent leaves the jurisdiction of California to reside or do business elsewhere or otherwise ceases to do business in the jurisdiction of California, the Respondent shall notify BAR in writing within 10 days of the dates of departure and return, and of the dates of cessation and resumption of business in California. All provisions of probation other than cost reimbursement requirements, restitution requirements, training requirements, and that Respondents obey all laws, shall be held in abeyance during any period of time of 30 days or more in which either Respondent is not residing or engaging in business within the jurisdiction of California. All provisions of probation shall recommence on the effective date of resumption of business in California. Any period of time of 30 days or more in which either Respondent is not residing or engaging in business within the jurisdiction of California shall not apply to the reduction of this probationary period or to any period of actual suspension not previously completed. Tolling is not available if business or work relevant to the probationary license or registration is conducted or performed during the tolling period.

- 6. Violation of Probation. If Respondents violate or fail to comply with the terms and conditions of probation in any respect, the Director, after giving notice and opportunity to be heard may set aside the stay order and carry out the disciplinary order provided in the decision. Once Respondent is served notice of BAR's intent to set aside the stay, the Director shall maintain jurisdiction, and the period of probation shall be extended until final resolution of the matter.
- 7. Maintain Valid License. Respondents shall, at all times while on probation, maintain a current and active registration and/or license(s) with BAR, including any period during which suspension or probation is tolled. If Respondents' registration or license is expired at the time the decision becomes effective, the registration or license must be renewed by Respondents within 30 days of that date. If Respondents' registration or license expires during a term of probation, by operation of law or otherwise, then upon renewal Respondents' registration or license shall be subject to any and all terms and conditions of probation not previously satisfied. Failure to maintain a current and active registration and/or license during the period of probation shall also constitute a violation of probation.
- 8. Cost Recovery. Respondents shall pay the Bureau of Automotive Repair \$6,333.75 for the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of case No. 79/18-7316.

  Respondents shall make such payment as follows: eight (8) installment payments, to begin thirty (30) days after the Bureau's approval of this agreement. Any agreement for a scheduled payment plan shall require full payment to be completed no later than six (6) months before probation terminates. Respondents shall make payment by check or money order payable to the Bureau of Automotive Repair and shall indicate on the check or money order that it is for cost recovery payment for case No. 79/18-7316. Any order for payment of cost recovery shall remain in effect whether or not probation is tolled. Probation shall not terminate until full cost recovery payment has been made. BAR reserves the right to pursue any other lawful measures in collecting on the costs ordered and past due, in addition to taking action based upon the violation of probation.
- 9. Completion of Probation. Upon successful completion of probation, Respondents' affected registration and/or license will be fully restored or issued without restriction, if Respondents meet all current requirements for registration or licensure and have paid all

outstanding fees, monetary penalties, or cost recovery owed to BAR.

10. License Surrender. Following the effective date of a decision that orders a stay of invalidation or revocation, if Respondents cease business operations or are otherwise unable to satisfy the terms and conditions of probation, Respondents may request that the stay be vacated. Such request shall be made in writing to BAR. The Director and the BAR Chief reserve the right to evaluate the Respondent's request and to exercise discretion whether to grant the request or take any other action deemed appropriate or reasonable under the circumstances. Upon formal granting of the request, the Director will vacate the stay order and carry out the disciplinary order provided in the decision. Respondents may not petition the Director for reinstatement of the surrendered registration and/or license, or apply for a new registration or license under the jurisdiction of BAR at any time before the date of the originally scheduled completion of probation. If Respondents apply to BAR for a registration or license at any time after that date, Respondents must meet all current requirements for registration or licensure and pay all outstanding fees or cost recovery owed to BAR and left outstanding at the time of surrender.

| ///

16 | ///

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

17 | ///

18 | ///

19 || ///

20 | ///

21 | ///

22 | ///

23 ///

24 ///

25 ///

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

#### **ACCEPTANCE**

I have carefully read the above Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order and have fully discussed it with my attorney, William Ferreira. Lunderstand the stipulation and the effect it will have on my Automotive Repair Dealer Registration, and Smog Check Test Only Station License. Smog Check Inspector License, and Smog Check Repair Technician License, Lenter into this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order voluntarily, Knowingly, and intelligently, and agree to be bound by the Decision and Order of the Director of Consumer Affairs.

DATED: 01/01/2010	RIAT SERVICES DBA ALGHA SMOG RAMESH.
	RIAT SEKVIGES: DBA ALOHA: SMOGNRAMESH. THOLIA
	X G Pavaretac Beby Ceangren By
	(signature and title) Respondent
DATED: 1 4 2000	SAMR SALIM HADDAD
	Responden

I have read and fully discussed with Respondent RRAT/Services, dba Aloha Smog and Respondent Samir Salim Haddad the terms and conditions and other matters contained in the above Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order. Lappyove its form and content.

4 6 60

DATED: 1.8.20 20 20 AUGINETREURAS AUGINEVIOUS Respondent

1.7

### **ENDORSEMENT** The foregoing Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is hereby respectfully submitted for consideration by the Director of Consumer Affairs. Respectfully submitted, DATED: January 27, 2020 XAVIER BECERRA Attorney General of California SHAWN P. COOK Supervising Deputy Attorney General Andrew Amara ANDREW AMARA Deputy Attorney General Attorneys for Complainant LA2018502077 53968268.docx

Exhibit A

**Accusation No. 79/18-7316** 

1		
1	XAVIER BECERRA Attorney General of California	
.	SHAWN P. COOK	<i>:</i>
2	Supervising Deputy Attorney General DANIEL G. ESKUE	
3	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 117093	
4	300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702	
5	Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 269-6491	
6	Facsimile: (213) 897-2810	
: 1	E-mail: Daniel.Eskue@doj.ca.gov Attorneys for Complainant	
7	BEFOR	: TETTIME
8	DEPARTMENT OF CO	ONSUMER AFFAIRS
9	FOR THE BUREAU OF A STATE OF C.	
10	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 79/18 - 7316
11	RRAT SERVICES, dba ALOHA SMOG,	ACCUSATION
12	Ramesh Tholla, President	TROODINITION (
13	2720 Artesia Blvd., Ste. B, Redondo Beach,	
- f	CA 90278 (Business Address) 11890 Jpyxis Cir., Rancho Cordova, CA	
14	95742 (Mailing Address) Automotive Repair Dealer No. ARD 281987	
15	Smog Check Station No. TC 281987	
16	AND	
17 .	SAMIR SALIM HADDAD	
18	6209 Reseda Blvd., Ste. 228 Reseda, CA 91355	
19	Smog Check Inspector No. EO 304144	
,	Smog Check Repair No. EI 304144	
20	Respondents.	
21		•••
22	Complainant alleges:	
23	<u>PAR'</u>	<u>TIES</u>
24	1. Patrick Dorais (Complainant) brings	this Accusation solely in his official capacity a
25	the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair, D	epartment of Consumer Affairs (BAR).
26	2. On or about November 10, 2015, the	Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer
27	Registration Number ARD 281987 to RRAT Ser	vices, dba Aloha Smog; Ramesh Tholla
28	(Respondent). The Automotive Repair Dealer Re	egistration was in full force and effect at all

times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on November 30, 2018, unless renewed.

- 3. On or about January 7, 2016, the Bureau issued Smog Check Test Only Station
  License Number TC 281987 to RRAT Services, dba Aloha Smog; Ramesh Tholla (Respondent).
  The Smog Check Test Only Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on November 30, 2018, unless renewed.
- 4. In 1997, Advanced Emission Specialist (EA) Technician License No. 304144 was issued to Samir Salim Haddad, under SB 1997, the biennial Smog Check Program implemented January 1, 1990. License number EA 304144 was due to expire on May 31, 2013, however, was cancelled on March 4, 2013. Pursuant to California Code of Regulations, title 16 section 3340.28, subdivision (e), said license was renewed pursuant to Samir Salim Haddad's election as Smog Check Inspector (EO) License No. 304144 and Smog Check Repair Technician (El) License No. 304144, effective March 4, 2013. The Smog Check Inspector (EO) License expires on May 31, 2019. The Smog Check Repair Technician (El) License expires on May 31, 2019, unless renewed. The Smog Check Inspector (EO) License and Smog Check Repair Technician (El) License were in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein.

#### JURISDICTION .

- 5. Business and Professions Code (BPC) section 9884.13 provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration of a valid registration shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary proceeding against an automotive repair dealer or to render a decision temporarily or permanently invalidating (suspending or revoking) a registration.
- 6. Health and Safety Code (HSC) section 44002 provides, in pertinent part, that the Director has all the powers and authority granted under the Automotive Repair Act for enforcing the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.
- 7. Section 44072.6 of the HSC provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration or suspension of a license by operation of law, or by order or decision of the Director of Consumer Affairs, or a court of law, or the voluntary surrender of the license shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with disciplinary action.

#### STATUTORY PROVISIONS

- 8. Section 9884.7 of the BPC states, in pertinent part:
- "(a) The director, where the automotive repair dealer cannot show there was a bona fide error, may refuse to validate, or may invalidate temporarily or permanently, the registration of an automotive repair dealer for any of the following acts or omissions related to the conduct of the business of the automotive repair dealer, which are done by the automotive repair dealer or any automotive technician, employee, partner, officer, or member of the automotive repair dealer.
  - (1) Making or authorizing in any manner or by any means whatever any statement written or oral which is untrue or misleading, and which is known, or which by the exercise of reasonable care should be known, to be untrue or misleading.

\*\*\*

(4) Any other conduct which constitutes fraud.

\*\*

- (6) Failure in any material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to it."
- 9 Section 44012 of the HSC provides, in pertinent part, that tests at smog check stations shall be performed in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- Section 44015, subdivision (b), of the HSC provides that a certificate of compliance shall be issued if a vehicle meets the requirements of HSC section 40012.
- 11. Section 44032 of the HSC states, in pertinent part, that: (1) no person may perform tests or repairs of emission control devices or systems of motor vehicles required by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program unless the person performing the test or repair is a licensed qualified smog check technician; and (2) all tests must be conducted in accordance with section 44012 (i.e. Motor Vehicle Inspection Program Requirements).
  - 12. Section 44059 of the HSC provides:

"The willful making of any false statement or entry with regard to a material matter in any oath, affidavit, certificate of compliance or noncompliance, or application form which is required by this chapter or Chapter 20.3 (commencing with Section 9880) of Division 3 of the Business

and Professions Code, constitutes perjury and is punishable as provided in the Penal Code."

13. Section 44072.2 of the HSC states, in pertinent part:

"The director may suspend, revoke, or take other disciplinary action against a license as provided in this article if the licensee, or any partner, officer, or director thereof, does any of the following:

"(a) Violates any section of this chapter [the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program (Health and Saf. Code, sec. 44000, et seq.)] and the regulations adopted pursuant to it, which related to the licensed activities

\*\*\*

- "(c) Violates any of the regulations adopted by the director pursuant to this chapter
- "(d) Commits any act involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another is injured.
- 14. Section 44072.8 of the HSC states that when a license has been revoked or suspended following a hearing under this article, any additional license issued under this chapter in the name of the licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the director.

#### REGULATORY PROVISIONS

15. California Code of Regulations (CCR), title 16, section 3340.24, subdivision (c), states:

"The bureau may suspend or revoke the license of or pursue other legal action against a licensee, if the licensee falsely or fraudulently issues or obtains a certificate of compliance or a certificate of noncompliance."

16. CCR, title 16, section 3340.30, subdivision (a), states in pertinent part:

"A licensed smog check inspector and/or repair technician shall comply with the following requirements at all times while licensed:

- "(a) Inspect, test and repair vehicles, as applicable, in accordance with section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code, section 44035 of the Health and Safety Code, and section 3340.42 of this article.
  - 17. CCR, title 16, section 3340.35, subdivision (c), states that a licensed smog check

station "shall issue a certificate of compliance or noncompliance to the owner or operator of any vehicle that has been inspected in accordance with the procedures specified in section 3340.42 of this article and has all the required emission control equipment and devices installed and functioning correctly."

- 18. CCR, title 16, section 3340.41, subdivision (b), provides: "No person shall enter into the emissions inspection system any access or qualification number other than as authorized by the bureau, nor in any way tamper with the emissions inspection system."
- 19. CCR, title 16, section 3340.42, sets forth specific emissions test methods and procedures which apply to all vehicles inspected in the State of California.

#### COST RECOVERY

20. Section 125.3, subdivision (a), of the BPC provides, in pertinent part, that a Board "may request the administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case."

#### SMOG CHECK PROGRAM

- 21. California's Smog Check Program requires the owners of most motor vehicles in the Enhanced and Basic areas of the State, subject their vehicles to and pass a Smog Check inspection and receive a Certificate of Compliance every two years when renewing their registration and also when the vehicle's title is transferred. These inspections are performed by Smog Check inspectors at Smog Check Stations, both of which are licensed by BAR. The Smog Check Program is designed and intended to reduce air pollution by identifying and requiring the repair of polluting motor vehicles.
- 22. The Smog Check inspection in certain Enhanced areas of the State is an Acceleration Simulation Mode (ASM) test performed using an Emission Inspection System (EIS), also known as a BAR 97. This is a computer based five-gas analyzer that measures Hydrocarbons (HC), Carbon Monoxide (CO), Oxides of Nitrogen (NO x), Carbon Dioxide (CO,) and Oxygen (0,). The first part of the test is a loaded mode test of the vehicle's tailpipe emissions on a dynamometer. This puts the vehicle's drive wheels on rollers and the vehicle is driven at speeds of fifteen and

twenty-five miles per hour to simulate driving conditions while the emissions are sampled by the EIS.

- 23. In Basic areas, or depending on a vehicle's configuration (all-wheel drive, traction control issue), a similar test called a Two Speed Idle (TSI) test is performed, but instead of applying a load to the vehicle's drive wheels with a dynamometer, the EIS measures the emissions of HC, CO, O, and CO, at idle as well as 2500 revolutions per minute (RPM).
- 24. The inspector also performs visual and functional tests on the vehicle as outlined in the Smog Check Manual. The visual inspection of the emission control components verifies the required emission control devices are present and properly connected. Functional tests are also performed which, depending on the vehicle, may include checking the ignition timing, malfunction indicator light (MIL), Exhaust Gas Recirculation (EGR) system, a low-pressure test of the evaporative emissions controls (LPRET), a visible smoke test, and a pressure test of the gas cap.
- 25. An On-Board Diagnostics (OBD II) functional test is also performed on most 1996 to 1999 model year vehicles. The inspector is required to connect a test cable from the EIS to a Diagnostic Link Connector (DLC) which is located in the vehicle's passenger compartment. Through the DLC, the EIS retrieves information from the vehicle's on-board computer about its ability to communicate, the status of the 1/M readiness monitors and the MIL light command, as well as diagnostic trouble codes (DTC). The 1/M readiness monitors tell whether or not the OBDII system has run a sufficient number of self-tests on the vehicle's emission and engine control systems. A failure of one or more of the OBD II functional criteria, depending on model year, will result in the vehicle failing its Smog Check inspection. In addition to reporting the outcome of the OBDII functional test, the Smog Check inspection results also show DTC's if there are any in the vehicle's on-board computer memory.
- 26. The inspector enters the results of the visual and functional inspections into the EIS. The EIS unit makes the determination whether or not the vehicle passes the inspection based on the results of the tailpipe, visual and functional tests.
  - 27. The EIS is connected by telephone modem to BAR's Vehicle Information Database

26

27

28

(VID), which is maintained by a state contractor. If the vehicle passes the visual, functional and tailpipe tests, it passes the overall inspection and a Certificate of Compliance is issued and transmitted electronically to the VID. Additionally, all data gathered during a Smog Check inspection, regardless of the type of inspection, is transmitted to and retained in the VID.

- Beginning March 9, 2015, California's Smog Check Program was updated to keep 28. pace with advancing vehicle technology. The program update requires use of an On-Board Diagnostic Inspection System (BAR-OIS). BAR-OIS is the Smog Check equipment required in all areas of the State when inspecting most model-year 2000 and newer gasoline and hybrid vehicles and 1998 and newer diesel vehicles subject to the program. The system consists of a certified Data Acquisition Device (DAD), computer, bar code scanner, and printer. The DAD is an On-Board Diagnostic (OBD) scan tool that, when requested by the California BAR-OIS software, retrieves OBD data from the vehicle. All OBD data that the vehicle indicates it supports is requested by the California BAR-OIS software and will be retrieved. Sensitive data, such as vehicle location (GPS) and accident-related information (air bag deployment), is not retrieved. The DAD connects between the BAR-OIS computer and the vehicle's DLC. The DAD is the only BAR-certified component of the BAR-OIS. The California BAR-OIS software requires a continuous Internet connection when performing a Smog Check inspection. The BAR-OIS uses the California BAR-OIS software to communicate with the YID through the Internet connection. The bar code scanner is used to input inspector information, the vehicle identification number (VIN), and Department of Motor Vehicles (DMV) renewal information. The printer provides a Vehicle Inspection Report (VIR) containing inspection results for motorists and a Smog Check Certificate of Compliance number for passing vehicles.
- 29. Data retrieved, captured and recorded to the YID during a BAR-OIS Smog Check inspection includes; the electronic vehicle identification number (eVIN), which is the digitally stored VIN programmed into the vehicles Powertrain Control Module (PCM); the communication protocol, which is the specific "language" the PCM uses to relay or communicate information to scan tools and other computers or devices such as the BAR-OIS; and the number of Parameter Identifications (PIDs), which is the number of specific data values each PCM reports related to

emissions controls.

- 30. The eVIN is required to be programmed into the vehicle's PCM on 2005 and newer vehicles, and on many occasions was programmed into the on-board computers on earlier model year vehicles.
- 31. The communication protocol is programmed into the vehicle's on-board computer during manufacture and does not change. The protocol can be recorded in its basic characters or in an expanded form that includes additional characters. The basic form is primary and is always contained within the expanded form.
- 32. PIDs are data points reported by the vehicle on-board computer to a scan tool or BAR-OIS. Examples of PIDs are engine speed, vehicle speed, engine temperature, and other input and output values utilized by the vehicle's on-board computer. The PID count is the number of data points reported by the vehicle's on-board computer and is programmed during manufacture.
- 33. As with the EIS, inspectors also perform a visual and functional test on the vehicle. The visual inspection of the emission control components verifies the required emission control devices are present and properly connected, and a functional test is performed of the MIL. The BAR-OIS software makes the determination whether or not the vehicle passes the inspection based on the results of the OBD, visual and functional tests.
- 34. The EIS or BAR-OIS, depending on the test type, prints a VIR, which is a physical record of the test results and shows the Certificate of Compliance number that was issued if the vehicle passed the Smog Check inspection. The Smog Check inspector must sign the VIR to indicate that the inspection was performed within BAR guidelines. Licensed Smog Check Inspectors are the only persons authorized by the BAR to perform official inspections. They are issued a license and a personal access code which are used to gain access to the EIS and used to set up a username and password within the BAR-OIS to perform smog check inspections. Unauthorized use of another inspector's license, access code, or username and password is prohibited.

- 35. The VID contains registration data from DMV plus emission standards, vehicle Smog Check inspections, smog check stations and inspectors, and Certificates of Compliance. The VID has an internal clock that is set to Pacific Standard Time and records the time and date for each inspection. Each Certificate of Compliance has a unique control number so that it can be tracked to determine which Smog Check Station purchased the Certificate of Compliance and to which vehicle it was issued. The VID receives the Smog Check results immediately following the inspection. BAR can access the VID to view test data on Smog Check inspections performed at any Smog Check Station, or search for, retrieve, and print a test record for a particular vehicle which has been tested. If a vehicle passes the Smog Inspection, the vehicle information and test results are electronically transmitted to DMV.
- 36. BAR has become aware of methods some Smog Check stations and Smog Check inspectors use to fraudulently issue smog certificates to vehicles that will not pass a Smog Check test on their own, or in some instances, are not even present during the time the test is performed. One such method is "clean plugging." "Clean plugging" is a method by which another vehicle's properly functioning OBDII system, or another source, is used to generate passing data readings or diagnostic information for the purpose of fraudulently issuing smog certificates to vehicles that are not in smog compliance and or not present for testing.

### DATA ANALYSIS OF CLEAN PLUGGING ACTIVITIES

- 37. BAR conducted a detailed review of the VID data for Smog Check inspections performed at Aloha Smog. The review showed a pattern of vehicles being certified with a different eVIN. The data for the vehicles also contains different communication protocols, and different PID amounts. This confirms the vehicles receiving smog certificates were not tested during the OBD II functional test, which constitutes clean plugging.
- 38. The review into the Smog Check activities at Aloha Smog confirmed four (4) Smog Check Certificates of Compliance were fraudulently issued to vehicles using the clean plugging method. The investigation revealed that the data related to certain vehicles certified by Respondent Samir Salim Haddad contained a pattern of unmistakable discrepancies between the information transmitted during the inspections and documented information known about the

subject vehicles. Specifically, the representative compared the data received from the certified vehicles to data from vehicles of the same year, make, and model and determined that the data from at least four (4) of the certified vehicles contained unmistakable discrepancies, including the transmission of incorrect eVIN data, incorrect vehicle communication protocols and an incorrect number of PID counts. In addition, all four vehicles failed to report their expected eVIN numbers. These documented discrepancies confirm that, in performing the inspections at issue, Respondents engaged in the illegal activity known as clean plugging in order to issue fraudulent certificates of compliance for the vehicles. The following chart (Table 1) illustrates the documented clean plugging activities by Respondents during the period reviewed.

TABLE 1

Date	Vehicle/VIN	Certificate Number	Test Details
3/6/17	2009 Ford Econoline E250 Van	Q1036687C	Certificate issued under EO 304144 (Haddad), eVIN not reported, communication protocol transmitted as JPWM (expected protocol was ICAN11bt5), PID count transmitted was 20 (expected PID count was 47).1
4/13/17	2009 Toyota Camry SE	ZT187648C	Certificate issued under EO 304144 (Haddad), wrong eVIN transmitted, OIS test data shows that a 2007 Toyota Avalon XL was used to generate the smog certificate for the subject 2009 Toyota Camry SE.

On February 12, 2018, a subsequent smog check test was performed on the subject 2009 Ford Econoline E250 Van. This time the eVIN was correctly transmitted (1FTNE24W89DA53049), as was the expected protocol (ICAN11bt5) and the expected PID count (47), which proves the 3/6/17 smog certificate was issued fraudulently by Aloha Smog.

1
2
.3 -
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18,
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27

5/22/17	2011 Toyota Tundra Double Cab SR5	ZV421545C	Certificate issued under EO 304144 (Haddad), wrong eVIN transmitted, OIS test data shows that a 2007 Toyota 4Runner SR5 was used to generate the smog certificate for the subject 2009 Toyota Camry SE.
6/27/17	2007 Honda Accord EX	ZX604634C	Certificate issued under EO 304144 (Haddad), wrong eVIN transmitted <sup>2</sup> , communication protocol transmitted as iCAN29bt5 (expected protocol was I914), PID count transmitted was 39 (expected PID count was 21).

## CAUSES FOR DISCIPLINE SUBJECTING ARD REGISTRATION TO DISCIPLINARY ACTION

#### FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Untrue or Misleading Statements)

39. Respondent Aloha Smog has subjected its registration to discipline under BPC section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(1), in that Respondent aloha Smog made or authorized statements which Respondent Aloha Smog knew or in the exercise of reasonable care should have known to be untrue or misleading when issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above, certifying that those vehicles were in compliance with applicable laws and regulations when, in fact, those vehicles had not been so inspected. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 21 through 38, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Fraud)

40. Respondent Aloha Smog has subjected its registration to discipline under BPC section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(4), in that it committed acts which constitute fraud by issuing electronic

The eVIN transmitted during testing corresponds to 2015 Honda CR-V EXL, which has no history of smog testing and does not require testing until 11/14/21, according to DMV records, which proves the 6/27/17 smog certificate was issued fraudulently by Aloha Smog.

smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 21 through 38, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

#### THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Material Violation of Automotive Repair Act)

41. Respondent Aloha Smog Haddad has subjected its registration to discipline under BPC section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(6), in that it failed in a "material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to it" when issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 21 through 38, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

## CAUSES FOR DISCIPLINE SUBJECTING SMOG CHECK STATION LICENSE TO DISCIPLINARY ACTION

#### FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

### (Violation of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

- 42. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 21 through 38, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein. Respondent Aloha Smog has subjected its station license to discipline under HSC section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that, with respect to the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above, Respondent violated the following sections of the HSC:
- a. Section 44012: Respondent failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on those vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.

b. Section 44015, subdivision (b): Respondent issued electronic smog certificates of compliance without properly testing and inspecting the vehicles to determine if they were in compliance with section 44012 of the HSC.

#### FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Violations of Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

- 43. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 21 through 38, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein. Respondent Aloha Smog has subjected its station license to discipline under HSC section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that, with respect to the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above, Respondent violated the following sections of the CCR, title 16:
- a. Section 3340.24, subdivision (c): Respondent falsely or fraudulently issued electronic smog certificates of compliance without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles as required by HSC section 44012.
- b. Section 3340.35, subdivision (c): Respondent issued electronic smog certificates of compliance even though those vehicles had not been inspected in accordance with section 3340.42 of the HSC.
- c. Section 3340.42: Respondent failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on those vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

#### SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Dishonesty, Fraud and/or Deceit)

44. Respondent Aloha Smog has subjected its station license to discipline under HSC section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in that, with respect to the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above, Respondent committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another was injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for those vehicles without performing bona fide inspections and functional testing of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the

allegations contained in paragraphs 21 through 38, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

## CAUSES FOR DISCIPLINE SUBJECTING SMOG CHECK INSPECTOR LICENSE AND SMOG CHECK REPAIR TECHNICIAN LICENSE TO DISCIPLINARY ACTION

#### SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Violation of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

- 45. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 21 through 38, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein. Respondent Haddad's has subjected his smog check inspector and smog check repair technician licenses to discipline under HSC section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that, with respect to the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above, Respondent violated the following sections of the HSC:
- a. Section 44012: Respondent failed to ensure that the onboard diagnostic system tests were performed on those vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- b. Section 44015, subdivision (b): Respondent issued electronic smog certificates of compliance without properly testing and inspecting the vehicles to determine if they were in compliance with section 44012 of the HSC.
- c. Section 44032: Respondent failed to perform tests of the onboard diagnostic systems on those vehicles in accordance with section 44012 of the HSC.
- d. Section 44059: Respondent willfully made false entries for the electronic smog certificates of compliance by certifying that those vehicles had been inspected as required when, in fact, they had not.

#### <u>EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE</u>

### (Violations of Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

- 46. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 21 through 38, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein. Respondent Haddad has subjected his smog check inspector and smog check repair technician licenses to discipline under HSC section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that, with respect to the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above, Respondent violated the following sections of title 16 of the CCR:
  - a. Section 3340.24, subdivision (c): Respondent falsely or fraudulently issued

electronic smog certificates of compliance without performing bona fide inspections and functional testing of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles as required by HSC section 44012.

- b. Section 3340.30, subdivision (a): Respondent failed to inspect and test those vehicles in accordance with HSC section 44012.
- c. Section 3340.35, subdivision (c): Respondent issued electronic smog certificates of compliance even though those vehicles had not been inspected in accordance with section 3340.42 of the HSC.
- d. Section 3340.41, subdivision (c): Respondent knowingly entered false information into the EIS about the vehicles being tested.
- e. Section 3340.42: Respondent failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on those vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

#### NINTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit)

46. Respondent Haddad has subjected his smog check inspector and smog check repair technician licenses to discipline under HSC section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in that, with respect to the vehicles set forth in Table 1, above, Respondent committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud or deceit whereby another was injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for those vehicles without performing bona fide inspections and functional testing of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 21 through 37, inclusive, as though set forth fully herein.

### DISCIPLINARY CONSIDERATIONS AS TO RESPONDENT ALOHA SMOG

- 47. To determine the degree of discipline as to Respondent Aloha Smog, Complainant alleges that:
- a. On May 24, 2016, the Bureau issued Ramesh Tholla and RRAT Services dba Aloha Smog Administrative Citation #C2016-I 103 with an order of abatement, for his actions in

violation of section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code, in that Aloha Smog illegally issued a certificate of compliance to a vehicle using the BAR-97 when the OIS test was required. A Citation Service Conference was held on June 22, 2016. The Decision became effective on July 23, 2016.

b. On June 23, 2017, the Bureau issued Ramesh ThoIla and RRAT Services dba Aloha Smog Administrative Citation #C2017-1299, for his actions in violation of section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code, in that Aloha Smog illegally issued a certificate of compliance to a vehicle using the BAR-97 when the OIS test was required. A Citation Service Conference was held on August 3, 2017. A formal appeal request was received on August 31, 2017. The appeal is pending.

# DISCIPLINARY CONSIDERATIONS AS TO RESPONDENT SAMIR SALIM HADDAD

- 48. To determine the degree of discipline as to Respondent Samir Salim Haddad, Complainant alleges that:
- a. On May 24, 2016, the Bureau Issued Samir Salim Haddad, an Administrative Citation and Order of Abatement # M 2016-1104, for his actions in violation of section 44032 of the Health and Safety Code, in that Samir Salim Haddad illegally smog check inspected and certified a vehicle using the BAR-97 when the OIS test was required. A Citation Service Conference was held on June 28, 2016. The Decision became effective on July 29, 2016.
- b. On June 23, 2017, the Bureau issued Samir Salim Haddad, an Administrative Citation and Order of Abatement# M 2017-1305, for his actions in violation of section 44032 of the Health and Safety Code, in that Samir Salim Haddad illegally Smog Check inspected and certified a vehicle using the BAR-97 when the OIS test was required. A Citation Service Conference was held on August 3, 2017. A formal appeal request was received on August 31, 2017. The appeal is pending.

#### OTHER MATTERS.

49. Pursuant to Bus. & Prof. Code section 9884.7, subdivision (c), the Director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this

state by Ramesh Tholla, upon a finding that he has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of the laws and regulations pertaining to an automotive repair dealer.

- 50. Pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Station License No. TC 281987, issued to RRAT Services dba Aloha Smog, or Ramesh Tholla, is revoked or suspended following a hearing, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.
- 51. Pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 304144 and/or Smog Check Repair License No. EI 304144 issued to Samir Salim Haddad is revoked or suspended following a hearing, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.

#### PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- 1. Revoking or suspending Automobile Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 281987 issued to RRAT Services dba Aloha Smog, Ramesh Tholla, President;
- 2. Revoking or suspending Smog Check, Test Only, Station License Number TC 281987 issued to RRAT Services dba Aloha Smog, Ramesh Tholla, President;
- 3. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Inspector License Number EO 304144 issued to Samir Salim Haddad;
- 4. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Repair Technician License Number EI 304144 issued to Samir Salim Haddad;
- 5. Revoking or suspending any and all additional Automotive Repair Dealer Registrations issued in the name of RRAT Services, pursuant to section 9884.7, subdivision (c), of the Business and Professions Code;
- 6. Revoking or suspending any and all licenses issued under the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program (Health & Saf. Code Sec. 44000, et seq.) in the name of RRAT Services,