1	XAVIER BECERRA		
2	Attorney General of California THOMAS L. RINALDI		
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General M. TRAVIS PEERY		
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 261887		
5	300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, CA 90013		
6	Telephone: (213) 269-6309 Facsimile: (916) 731-2126		
7	Attorneys for Complainant		
8	BEFORE THE		
9	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR		
10	STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
11			
12			
13	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 79/20-6135	
14	MC & AR, INC. DBA PALMDALE RADIATOR & EXPRESS MUFFLER,		
15	MARISA ELANE CHAVEZ, PRESIDENT/SECRETARY/TREASURER	ACCUSATION	
16	2641 E. Palmdale Blvd, #18-20 Palmdale, CA 93550		
17	Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 277773		
18	Smgo Check, Station License No. RC 277773,		
19	and		
20	ROGELIO ROSALES		
21	10042 East Ave S10 Littlerock, CA 93543		
22	Smog Check Inspector License No.		
23	EO 637163		
24	Respondents.		
25			
26	///		
27			
28		1	
		1 & EXPRESS MUFFLER, MARISA ELANE CHAVEZ,	
	PRESIDENT/SECRETARY/TREASURER, and ROGELIO ROSALES) ACCUSATION		

## **PARTIES**

1. Patrick Dorais (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair (Bureau), Department of Consumer Affairs.

MC & AR, Inc. dba Palmdale Radiator & Express Muffler, Marisa Elane Chavez,
President/Secretary/Treasurer

- 2. On or about September 9, 2014, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 277773 to MC & AR, Inc. dba Palmdale Radiator & Express Muffler, Marisa Elane Chavez, President/Secretary/Treasurer (Respondent Palmdale Radiator). The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on September 30, 2021, unless renewed.
- 3. On or about September 29, 2014, the Bureau issued Smog Check Test and Repair Station License Number RC 277773 to MC & AR, Inc. dba Palmdale Radiator & Express Muffler, Marisa Elane Chavez, President/Secretary/Treasurer. The Smog Check Test and Repair Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on September 30, 2021, unless renewed.
- 4. On or about August 30, 2017, the Bureau certified Palmdale Radiator & Express Muffler as a STAR Station. The certification will remain active unless the Automotive Repair Dealer registration and/or Smog Check Test and Repair Station License is revoked, canceled, licenses become delinquent, or the certification is invalidated.

#### Rogelio Rosales

5. On or about July 30, 2014, the Bureau issued Smog Check Inspector License Number EO 637163 to Rogelio Rosales (Respondent Rosales). The Smog Check Inspector License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on May 31, 2022, unless renewed.

#### **JURISDICTION**

6. Business and Professions Code section 9884.7 provides that the Director may revoke an automotive repair dealer registration.

28 | ///

16. Health and Safety Code section 44072.8 states that when a license has been revoked or suspended following a hearing under this article, any additional license issued under this chapter in the name of the licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the director.

#### **REGULATORY PROVISIONS**

17. California Code of Regulations (CCR), title 16, section 3340.24, subdivision (c), states:

"The bureau may suspend or revoke the license of or pursue other legal action against a licensee, if the licensee falsely or fraudulently issues or obtains a certificate of compliance or a certificate of noncompliance."

- 18. CCR, title 16, section 3340.30, subdivision (a), states that a licensed smog technician shall at all times "[i]nspect, test and repair vehicles, as applicable, in accordance with section 44012 of the Health & Saf. Code, section 44035 of the Health & Saf. Code, and section 3340.42 of this article."
- 19. CCR, title 16, section 3340.35, subdivision (c), states that a licensed smog check station "shall issue a certificate of compliance or noncompliance to the owner or operator of any vehicle that has been inspected in accordance with the procedures specified in section 3340.42 of this article and has all the required emission control equipment and devices installed and functioning correctly."
- 20. CCR, title 16, section 3340.41, subdivision (c), states that "[n]o person shall enter into the emissions inspection system any vehicle identification information or emission control system identification data for any vehicle other than the one being tested. Nor shall any person knowingly enter into the emissions inspection system any false information about the vehicle being tested."
- 21. CCR, title 16, section 3340.42, sets forth specific emissions test methods and procedures which apply to all vehicles inspected in the State of California.

| ///

27 II //

28 | //

#### COST RECOVERY

22. Business and Professions Code section 125.3 provides, in pertinent part, that a Board may request the administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed a violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case.

## **UNDERCOVER OPERATIONS: MAY 19, 2020**

- 23. On or about March 19, 2020, Bureau Representative Allen Palad documented a 2007 Dodge (2007 Dodge) with two (2) hollowed out catalytic converters rendering them inoperative and defective. This resulted in the illumination of the vehicle's malfunction indicator light (MIL), a condition which will cause the vehicle to fail a properly performed California OIS Smog Check Inspection<sup>1</sup>.
- 24. From on or about March 10, 2020, through March 13, 2020, Bureau Representative Ricardo Pantoja documented a 2002 Honda (2002 Honda) with a hollowed out catalytic converter rendering it inoperative and defective. This resulted in the illumination of the vehicle's MIL, a condition which will cause the vehicle to fail a properly performed California OIS Smog Check Inspection.
- 25. On or about May 12, 2020, a Bureau undercover operator (operator) telephoned and text messaged Respondent Rosales advising him that he had a 2007 Dodge and a 2002 Honda, both with illuminated malfunction indicator lamps, that needed to have Smog Check Inspections performed. Respondent Rosales advised the operator to bring the vehicles to Palmdale Radiator & Express Muffler on May 19, 2020 at 1000 hours. Respondent Rosales advised the operator that the cost for each Smog Check Inspection would be \$180.00, and the operator agreed.

///

///

5 || ///

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Beginning March 9, 2015, California's Smog Check Program was updated to require the use of an On-Board Diagnostic Inspection System (BAR-OIS) when inspecting most model-year 2000 and newer gasoline and hybrid vehicles and 1998 and never diesel vehicles subject to the program.

26. On or about May 19, 2020, the operator drove the 2007 Dodge to Palmdale Radiator
& Express Muffler, arriving at approximately 1022 hours. The operator met with Respondent
Rosales and requested a Smog Check Inspection. At approximately 1154 hours, Respondent
Rosales advised the operator that the 2007 Dodge had passed the Smog Check Inspection, and
handed him a Vehicle Inspection Report (VIR) with certificate of compliance number
RI886429C. At Respondent Rosales's request, the operator paid him \$180.00 in cash for the
Smog Check Inspection, and let Respondent Rosales know that he would return shortly with the
2002 Honda. When the operator entered the 2007 Dodge to leave Respondent's facility, he
observed that the MIL was still illuminated.
27. On or about May 19, 2020, the operator drove the 2002 Honda to Palmdale Radiator

- 27. On or about May 19, 2020, the operator drove the 2002 Honda to Palmdale Radiator & Express Muffler, arriving at approximately 1242 hours. The operator met with Respondent Rosales and requested a Smog Check Inspection.
- 28. While waiting at Respondent's facility, the operator observed Respondent Rosales performing a Smog Check Inspection on what he later determined to be a 1997 Acura Integra, California License # 3WVF876 (1997 Acura), in the test bay of Palmdale Radiator & Express Muffler. The operator observed Respondent Rosales drive a late model green Ford Ranger in front of the test bay, and behind the 1997 Acura which was still inside the bay. The operator then observed Respondent Rosales insert an emissions sample probe into the exhaust tailpipe of the Ford Ranger while continuing to perform the Smog Check Inspection on the 1997 Acura. These actions are consistent with an illegal Smog Check Inspection known as clean piping<sup>2</sup>.
- 29. At approximately 1403 hours Respondent Rosales advised the operator that the 2002 Honda had passed the Smog Check Inspection, and handed him a VIR with certificate of compliance number RI886431C. At Respondent Rosales's request, the operator paid him \$180.00 in cash for the Smog Check Inspection. When the operator entered the 2002 Honda to leave Respondent's facility, he observed that the MIL was still illuminated.

///

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "Clean piping" refers to the use of the emission sample of a known clean vehicle to substitute for the emissions of a vehicle that will not pass a smog inspection or is not present at the time of the test.

30. On or about May 27, 2020, Bureau Representatives Kenneth Harsla and Timothy Fowler performed a station inspection at Palmdale Radiator & Express Muffler. Upon entering the facility, Bureau Representative Harsla observed Respondent Rosales exit a vehicle and pick up a black backpack located on the OIS cabinet. Respondent Rosales then walked with the backpack towards the front of the shop, where Bureau Representative Harsla asked if he could see what was inside. Respondent Rosales handed the backpack to Bureau Representative Harlsa and consented to him viewing the contents. In the bag, Bureau Representative Harsla found an On Board Diagnostic (OBD) defeat device which is commonly used in illegal clean plugging<sup>3</sup> activities, and which Respondent Rosales admitted belonged to him. Respondent Rosales admitted to using the defeat device to perform fraudulent Smog Check Inspections at Palmdale Radiator & Express Muffler, and specifically admitted to performing the fraudulent Smog Check Inspections on the Bureau documented 2007 Dodge and 2002 Honda. Respondent also admitted to performing a clean pipe on the 1997 Acura just prior to his inspection of the Bureau's 2002 Honda.

## FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Untrue or Misleading Statements)

31. Respondent Palmdale Radiator's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(1), in that it made or authorized statements which it knew or in the exercise of reasonable care should have known to be untrue or misleading when it issued electronic smog certificates of compliance to the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, certifying those vehicles as being in compliance with applicable laws and regulations when, in fact, those vehicles had not been properly inspected. Respondent did not inspect any of the 3 vehicles as required by Health and Safety Code section 44012. Complainant hereby incorporates paragraphs 23 through 30, above, as though set forth fully herein.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> "Clean plugging" refers to the use of another vehicle's properly functioning On Board Diagnostic, generation II, (OBD II) system, or another source, to generate passing diagnostic readings for the purpose of issuing fraudulent smog Certificates of Compliance to vehicles that are not in smog compliance and/or not present for testing.

#### SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Fraud)

32. Respondent Palmdale Radiator's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(4), in that it committed acts that constitute fraud by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant hereby incorporates paragraphs 23 through 30, above, as though set forth fully herein.

#### THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

## (Material Violation of Automotive Repair Act)

33. Respondent Palmdale Radiator's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(6), in that it failed in a material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to it when it issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant hereby incorporates paragraphs 23 through 30, above, as though set forth fully herein.

#### **FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

## (Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

- 34. Respondent Palmdale Radiator's Smog Check Test and Repair Station License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that it failed to comply with the following sections of that Code:
- a. <u>Section 44012</u>: Respondent failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.

b. <u>Section 44015, subdivision (b)</u>: Respondent issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, without ensuring that the vehicles were properly tested and inspected to determine if they were in compliance with Health and Safety Code section 44012.

Complainant hereby incorporates paragraphs 23 through 30, above, as though set forth fully herein.

### FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

- 35. Respondent Palmdale Radiator's Smog Check Test and Repair Station License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that it failed to comply with provisions of CCR, title 16, as follows:
- a. <u>Section 3340.24, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent falsely or fraudulently issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura.
- b. <u>Section 3340.30, subdivision (a)</u>: Respondent failed to inspect and test the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, in accordance with Health and Safety Code sections 44012 and 44035, and CCR, title 16, section 3340.42.
- c. <u>Section 3340.35, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, even though the vehicles had not been inspected in accordance with section 3340.42.
- d. <u>Section 3340.41, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent knowingly entered false information into the emissions inspection system for the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura.
- e. <u>Section 3340.42</u>: Respondent failed to ensure that the required smog tests were conducted on the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

Complainant hereby incorporates paragraphs 23 through 30, above, as though set forth fully herein.

///

## SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE 1 (Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit) 2 36. Respondent Palmdale Radiator's Smog Check Test and Repair Station License is 3 subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision 4 5 (d), in that it committed dishonest, fraudulent, or deceitful acts whereby another was injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 6 Acura, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on 7 8 the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by 9 the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant hereby incorporates paragraphs 23 through 30, above, as though set forth fully herein. 10 SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE 11 (Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program) 12 37. Respondent Rosales's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to disciplinary action 13 14 pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that he failed to comply with the following sections of that code: 15 Section 44012: Respondent failed to ensure that the emission control tests were 16 a. performed on the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, in accordance with procedures 17 prescribed by the department. 18 19 b. Section 44015: Respondent issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, without ensuring that the vehicles were properly 20 tested and inspected to determine if they were in compliance with Health and Safety Code section 21 44012. 22 Complainant hereby incorporates paragraphs 23 through 30, above, as though set forth fully 23 24 herein. /// 25 26 /// 27 28

#### **EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

## (Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant

## to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

- 38. Respondent Rosales's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that he failed to comply with provisions of CCR, title 16, as follows:
- a. <u>Section 3340.24, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent falsely or fraudulently issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura.
- b. <u>Section 3340.30, subdivision (a)</u>: Respondent failed to inspect and test the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, in accordance with Health and Safety Code sections 44012 and 44035, and CCR, title 16, section 3340.42.
- c. <u>Section 3340.35, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, even though the vehicles had not been inspected in accordance with section 3340.42
- d. <u>Section 3340.41, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent knowingly entered false information into the emissions inspection system for the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura.
- e. <u>Section 3340.42</u>: Respondent failed to conduct the required smog tests on the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

Complainant hereby incorporates paragraphs 23 through 30 above, as though set forth fully.

## NINTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit)

39. Respondent Rosales's Smog Check Inspector License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in that Respondent committed dishonest, fraudulent, or deceitful acts whereby another was injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 2007 Dodge, 2002 Honda, and 1997 Acura, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the

Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant hereby incorporates paragraphs 23 through 30, above, as though set forth fully herein.

#### OTHER MATTERS

- 40. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 9884.7, subdivision (c), the Director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this state by Respondent MC & AR, Inc., upon a finding that it has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of the laws and regulations pertaining to an automotive repair dealer.
- 41. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Test and Repair Station License No. RC 277773, issued to Respondent MC & AR, Inc. dba Palmdale Radiator & Express Muffler, Marisa Elane Chavez, President/Secretary/Treasurer, is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the director.
- 42. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 637163, issued to Rogelio Rosales, is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the director.

#### **PRAYER**

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- Revoking or suspending Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 277773, issued to MC & AR, Inc. dba Palmdale Radiator & Express Muffler, Marisa Elane Chavez, President/Secretary/Treasurer;
- 2. Revoking or suspending any other automotive repair dealer registration issued to MC & AR, Inc.;
- 3. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Test and Repair Station License No. RC 277773, issued to MC & AR, Inc. dba Palmdale Radiator & Express Muffler, Marisa Elane Chavez, President/Secretary/Treasurer;