1	XAVIER BECERRA	
2	Attorney General of California CHAR SACHSON	
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General LESLIE E. BRAST	
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 203296	
	455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000	
5	San Francisco, CA 94102-7004 Telephone: (415) 510-3373	•
6	Facsimile: (415) 703-5480 Attorneys for Complainant	
7	. , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
8	BEFORE 1	
9	DEPARTMENT OF CON FOR THE BUREAU OF AU	
10	STATE OF CAL	IFORNIA
11 ·		
12	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 7 9 116-16114
13	MARTIN HERNANDEZ – OWNER,	ACCUSATION
14	D.B.A. TRI VALLEY CAR CARE 1412 Portola Ave.	
15	Livermore, CA 94551 <u>Mailing Address</u> :	
16	1739 First St. Livermore, CA 94550	
17	Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 250215	
18	Smog Check Station License No. RC 250215	·
19	MARTIN HERNANDEZ – OWNER,	
	D.B.A. TRI VALLEY CAR CARE 1737 First St.	
20	Livermore, CA 94550  Automotive Repair Dealer	
21	Registration No. ARD 250216 Smog Check Station License No. RC 250216	
22	MARTIN HERNANDEZ – OWNER,	
23 .	D.B.A. TRI VALLEY CAR CARE 4212 First Street	
24	Pleasanton, CA 94566	
25	Mailing Address: 1739 First St.	
26	Livermore, CA 94550 Automotive Repair Dealer	
27	Registration No. ARD 263831 Smog Check Station License No. TC 263831	
28		

Ţ	MAGNO RAMON ANGEL
2 ·	331 Beall Cir. Westley, CA 95387
3	Mailing Address: PO Box 273
4	Westley, CA 95387 Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635174
5	NICK NOEL ANKLAM
6	474 Humboldt Way Livermore, CA 94551
.7	Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635425 Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 635425
8	
9	JONATHAN EZEQUIEL VILLEGAS 849 E. Stanley Blvd. #191
10	Livermore, CA 94550 Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635766
11	CHRISTOPHER MARTIN HERNANDEZ
12	1737 First St. Livermore, CA 94550
13	Mailing Address: 1070 Glenn Canyon
14	Livermore, CA 94551 Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 631794
15	Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 631794
16 17	Respondents.
18	Complainant alleges:
19	<u>PARTIES</u>
20	1. Patrick Dorais (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as
21	the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair (Bureau), Department of Consumer Affairs.
22	2. On or about May 18, 2007, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer Registration
23	Number ARD 250215 to Martin Hernandez – Owner, d.b.a. Tri Valley Car Care (Respondent
24	Owner). On or about February 23, 2015, the Bureau issued Smog Check Station License Number
25	RC 250215 to Respondent Owner. The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration and the Smog
26	Check Station License were in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought
27	herein and will expire on April 30, 2019, unless renewed.
28	

III

///

1//

///

25

26

27

	li ·
1	8. In February 2010, Advanced Emission Specialist Technician License Number EA
2	631794 was issued to Christopher Martin Hernandez (Respondent Hernandez), and cancelled on
3	December 30, 2013. Thereafter, the license was renewed pursuant to Respondent's election as
4	Smog Check Inspector License Number EO 631794, effective December 30, 2013, and Smog
5	Check Repair Technician License Number EI 631794, effective October 1, 2014. Both licenses
6	were in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on
7	December 31, 2019, unless renewed.
8	<u>JURISDICTION</u>
9	9. This Accusation is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer
10	Affairs (Director) for the Bureau under the authority of the following laws.
11	10. Section 9884.13 of the Business and Professions Code (Code) provides, in pertinent
12	part, that the expiration of a valid registration shall not deprive the Director or Bureau Chief of
13	jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary proceeding against an automotive repair dealer or to
14	render a decision invalidating a registration temporarily or permanently.
15	11. Section 44072.6 of the Health and Safety Code provides, in pertinent part, that the
16	expiration or suspension of a license by operation of law, or by order or decision of the Director,
17	or a court of law, or the voluntary surrender of the license, shall not deprive the Director of
18	jurisdiction to proceed with disciplinary action.
19	12. Section 44002 of the Health and Safety Code provides, in pertinent part, that the
20	Director has all the powers and authority granted under the Automotive Repair Act for enforcing
21	the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.
22	111
23	111
24	
25	
26	
27.	<sup>1</sup> Effective August 1, 2012, California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.28, 3340.29 and 3340.30 were amended to implement a license restructure from the Advanced
28	Emission Specialist Technician (EA) license and Basic Area (EB) Technician license to Smog Check Inspector (EO) license and and/or Smog Check Repair Technician (EI) license.

- (a) The director, where the automotive repair dealer cannot show there was a bona fide error, may deny, suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration of an automotive repair dealer for any of the following acts or omissions related to the conduct of the business of the automotive repair dealer, which are done by the automotive repair dealer or any automotive technician, employee, partner, officer, or member of the automotive repair dealer.
- (1) Making or authorizing in any manner or by any means whatever any statement written or oral which is untrue or misleading, and which is known, or which by the exercise of reasonable care should be known, to be untrue or misleading.
  - (4) Any other conduct that constitutes fraud.

Section 9884.7 of the Code states, in pertinent part:

- (6) Failure in any material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to it.
- (c) Notwithstanding subdivision (b), the director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this state by an automotive repair dealer upon a finding that the automotive repair dealer has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of this chapter, or regulations adopted pursuant to it.
- 14. Section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code requires that tests at smog check stations be performed in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
  - 15. Section 44059 of the Health and Safety Code states, in pertinent part:

The willful making of any false statement or entry with regard to a material matter in any oath, affidavit, certificate of compliance or noncompliance, or application form which is required by this chapter or Chapter 20.3 (commencing with Section 9880) of Division 3 of the Business and Professions Code, constitutes perjury and is punishable as provided in the Penal Code.

16. Section 44072.2 of the Health and Safety Code states, in pertinent part:

The director may suspend, revoke, or take other disciplinary action against a license as provided in this article if the licensee, or any partner, officer, or director thereof, does any of the following:

(a) Violates any section of this chapter and the regulations adopted pursuant to it, which related to the licensed activities.

III

- 25. The Smog Check inspection in certain Enhanced areas of the State is an Acceleration Simulation Mode (ASM) test performed using an Emission Inspection System (EIS), also known as a BAR 97. This is a computer based five-gas analyzer that measures Hydrocarbons, Carbon Monoxide, Oxides of Nitrogen, Carbon Dioxide, and Oxygen. The inspection involves a test of the vehicle's tailpipe emissions on a dynamometer. In Basic areas of the State, or depending on a vehicle's configuration (e.g., all-wheel drive or traction control), a similar test called a Two Speed Idle (TSI) is performed, but instead of applying a load to the vehicle's drive wheels with a dynamometer, the EIS measures the emissions at idle as well as 2500 RPM.
- 26. The inspector also performs visual and functional tests on the vehicle as outlined in the Smog Check Manual. The visual inspection of the emission control components verifies that the required emission control devices are present and properly connected. Functional tests are also performed which, depending on the vehicle, may include checking the vehicle's various controls and systems (e.g., ignition timing, malfunction indicator light, exhaust gas recirculation system, etc.).

#### The BAR-OIS

- 27. On March 9, 2015, the Bureau implemented a statewide regulatory change requiring the use of the On Board Diagnostic Inspection System (BAR-OIS) instead of the Emission Inspection System (EIS) for the smog testing of 2000 model year and newer gas powered and hybrid vehicles.
- 28. The new BAR-OIS smog inspection utilizes a Data Acquisition Device (DAD), a computer, a bar code scanner, and printer. The DAD is a scan tool that retrieves data from a vehicle's On Board Diagnostic-generation II (OBD II) computer. The DAD connects the BAR-OIS computer to the vehicle's diagnostic link connector (DLC) to retrieve the data from the vehicle. The bar code scanner is used to input technician information, the vehicle identification number (VIN), and DMV renewal information. The printer is used to print Vehicle Inspection Reports.

- 29. Data retrieved and recorded during an BAR-OIS smog check can include: the eVIN, which is the digitally stored VIN programmed into the vehicle's Powertrain Control Module (PCM); the communication protocol, which is the manufacturer/vehicle's specific "language" that the PCM uses to relay information; and the number of Parameter Identifications (PIDs), which is the number of specific data values that vehicle's PCM provides related to emission controls. <sup>2</sup>
- 30. As part of BAR-OIS smog inspections, the technician also performs a visual and functional test on the vehicle. The BAR-OIS software makes the determination whether or not the vehicle passes the inspection based on the results of the data and the visual and functional tests. If the vehicle passes the inspection, a certificate of compliance is issued. The information from the smog inspection is then transmitted to the Vehicle Information Data (VID). The technician affirms a statement for each inspection that the inspection performed complied with all applicable laws and regulations.
- 31. The Bureau can access the VID to view test data on smog check inspections performed at any Smog Check station. The Bureau can also search for, retrieve, and print the test record for any particular vehicle which has been tested.
- 32. The Bureau has become aware of several methods used by Smog Check stations and Smog Check technicians to issue improper/fraudulent smog certificates of compliance. One method is known as clean plugging. Clean plugging involves using another vehicle's properly functioning OBD II system, or another source, to generate passing diagnostic readings for a vehicle that is not in smog compliance or not even present for testing.

#### Clean Plugging Allegations

33. The Bureau initiated an investigation of Respondents. A review of the data revealed that the following vehicles purportedly tested by Respondents at three of Respondent Owner's shops were clean plugged and issued fraudulent certificates of compliance as detailed below.

, II , ,

26 | ///

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> For PID count and communication protocol, the "Expected Value" reported on the charts, below, is the value generated by like vehicles.

5<sub>.</sub>

1412 PORTOLA	<b>AVENUE</b>
LIVERMO	RE

Between December 2015 and February 2017, Respondents Owner, Hernandez, Villegas, and Angel clean plugged and issued fraudulent certificates of compliance to the following 11 vehicles at Respondent Owner's Portola Avenue shop in Livermore, California:

CLEAN	2004 HONDA ACCORD EX, VIN 1HGCM725X4A010152				
PLUG #1	Technician: Respondent Hernandez				
·	Cert. # QA872266C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
•	Fraudulent Inspection	IHGCP26469A066124 <sup>3</sup>	ICAN29bt500	37   19	
.	(12/16/2015)	· .	,		
	Expected Value	Not Reported	I914	20	

CLEAN PLUG #2	2010 NISSAN SENTRA/S/SR/SL, VIN 3N1AB6AP1AL679040  Technician: Respondent Villegas				
1 LOO #2	Cert. # YZ134479C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection (2/26/2016)	Not Reported	I9140808	18	
	Expected Value	3N1AB6AP1AL679040	ICAN11BT5	39	

///

<sup>3</sup> The OIS data also showed that a 2009 Honda Accord LX-P, VIN 1HGCP26469A066124, was certified at Tri Valley Car Care on December 19, 2015, and was the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent Smog Certificate of Compliance for the 2004 Honda Accord EX.

CLEAN	2001 NISSAN MAXIMA GXE/SE/GLE/20ANNIV, VIN JN1CA31A21T317266				
PLUG #3	Technician: Respondent Angel				
	Cert. # QC639766C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection (6/20/2016)	1FMJK1H52EEF27841 <sup>4</sup>	ICAN11bt500	43	
-	Expected Value	Not Reported	I914	22	

CLEAN	2007 CHEVROLET AVALANCHE C1500, VIN 3GNEC12077G196337 <sup>5</sup>				
PLUG #4	Technician: Respondent Angel				
	Cert. # ZJ106903C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection	2GCEC19T311135981 <sup>6</sup>	JVPW1850	23	
	(8/13/2016)		***************************************		
	Expected Value	3GNEC12077G196337	ICAN11bt5	44   7	

	CLEAN	2005 SUBARU IMPREEZA WRX STI, VIN JF1GD70605L511008			
_F	PLUG #5	Technician: Respondent Angel			
	****	Cert. # ZJ302906C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count
	•	Fraudulent Inspection	Not Reported	I9140808	21
		(8/20/2016)			
		Expected Value	JF1GD70605L511008	KWPF	19

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The OIS data also showed that a 2014 Ford Expedition EL XLT/KING RA, VIN 1FMJK1H52EEF27841, was certified at Tri Valley Car Care by Respondent Angel on the same day, and was the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2001 Nissan Maxima.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> OIS data showed that the same 2007 Chevrolet Avalanche C1500 failed an OIS smog check inspection at A+ Auto Service Center the same day the fraudulent inspection was performed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The OIS data also showed that a 2001 Chevrolet Silverado C1500, VIN 2GCEC19T311135981, was certified at Tri Valley Car Care by Respondent Angel on the same day, and was the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2007 Chevrolet Avalanche.

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·					
CLEAN 2008 GMC SIERRA C1500, VIN 1GTEC14X78Z112702					
PLUG #6		Technician: Respondent	Angel		
· 	Cert. # ZJ302920C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection	Not Reported	19140808	17	
	(8/22/2016)			•	
	Expected Value	1GTEC14X78Z112702	ICAN11bt5	43   7	
		-		-	
CLEAN	2005 HYUNDA	I ELANTRA GLS/GT, VIN	KMHDN46D25U	J069904	
PLUG #7		·Technician: Respondent	Angel		
	Cert. # ZJ522038C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
•	Fraudulent Inspection	1J4RS6GT4BC503904 <sup>7</sup>	ICAN11bt500	41	
	(8/31/2016)				
	Expected Value	KMHDN46D25U069904	KWPF	15   17   1, 16	
•				[1, 17 or 17]	
CLEAN	2006 TOY	OTA SCION XB, VIN JTI	LKT324X6403561	9	
PLUG #8		Technician: Respondent	Angel		
	Cert. # QE143512C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
		1J4RS6GT4BC503904 <sup>8</sup>	ICAN11bt500	، 41	
	Fraudulent Inspection	134130014100303504			
,	Fraudulent Inspection (9/13/2016)	11410001410002304			

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> DMV records show that the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2005 Hyundai Elantra was a 2011 Jeep Grand Cherokee Overland, VIN 1J4RS6GT4BC503904, registered to Respondent Angel.

26

27

28

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> DMV records show that the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2006 Toyota Scion XB was a 2011 Jeep Grand Cherokee Overland, VIN 1J4RS6GT4BC503904, registered to Respondent Angel.

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
. 7	ı
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

27

CLEAN	2005 CHEVROLET CORVETTE, VIN 1G1YY24U0551049789				
PLUG #9	Technician: Respondent Angel				
	Cert. # QG578670C.	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection (10/29/2016)	Not Reported	JVPW1850	22	
	Expected Value	1G1YY24U055104978	ICAN11bt5	43, 43   7, or	
				43   7   15,	

CLEAN	2000 TOYOTA RAV4, VIN JT3GP10V6Y7066779				
PLUG #10	Technician: Respondent Angel				
	Cert. # ZJ994074C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection	1J4RS6GT4BC503904 <sup>10</sup>	ICAN11bt500	41	
	(11/12/2016)			•	
	Expected Value	Not Reported	I914	16 or 17	

CLEAN	2002 CHEVROLET SUBURBAN C1500, VIN 1GNEC16T22J110380			
PLUG #11	Technician: Respondent Angel			
. ,	Cert. # ZP275312C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count
	Fraudulent Inspection (2/4/2017)	1HGCP3F85BA018421 <sup>11</sup>	ICAN29bt500	44
	Expected Value	1GNEC16T22J110380	JVPW	21, 22 or 23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> OIS data showed that the same 2005 Chevrolet Corvette failed an OIS smog check inspection at Hi Tech Automotive on October 18, 2016.

DMV records show that the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2000 Toyota RAV4 was a 2011 Jeep Grand Cherokee Overland, VIN 1J4RS6GT4BC503904, registered to Respondent Angel.

The OIS data also showed that a 2011 Honda Accord EX-L, VIN 1HGCP3F85BA018421, was certified at Tri Valley Car Care by Respondent Angel on the same day, and was the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2002 Chevy Suburban.

#### 

# 

## 

# 

# 

## 

## 

# 

## 

. 18

# 

## 

#### TRI VALLEY CARE CARE

#### 1737 FIRST STREET LIVERMORE

Between March and September 2016, Respondent Owner and Respondent Angel clean plugged and issued fraudulent certificates of compliance to the following 4 vehicles at Respondent Owner's 1737 First Street shop in Livermore, California:

C	LEAN	2005 VOLKSWAGEN NEW JETTA 2.5, VIN 3VWRG71K05M632879				
PI	LUG #1	Technician: Respondent Angel				
		Cert. # YZ802490C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
Ī		Fraudulent Inspection (3/17/2016)	1J4RS6GT4BC503904 <sup>12</sup>	ICAN11bt500	41	
		Expected Value	3VWRG71K05M632879	KWPS	19   12, 20,	
<u></u>				4	or 20   12	

CLEAN	2006 CHRYSLER 300 TOURING, VIN 2C3KA53G96H324715				
PLUG #2	Technician: Respondent Angel				
	Cert. # ZB668164C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection (4/9/2016)	1HGCP3F84AA020109 <sup>13</sup>	ICAN29bt500	44	
	Expected Value	2C3KA53G96H324715	ICAN11bt5	43   6 or 43   8	

DMV records show that the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2005 Volkswagen New Jetta was a 2011 Jeep Grand Cherokee Overland, VIN 1J4RS6GT4BC503904, registered to Respondent Angel.

<sup>13</sup> The OIS data also showed that a 2010 Honda Accord EX-L, VIN 1HGCP3F84AA020109, was certified at Tri Valley Car Care by Respondent Angel on the same day, and was the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2006 Chrysler 30 Touring.

	11						
1	CLEAN	2007 CHEVROLET	T SILVERADO K2500HD,	VIN 1GCHK23E	037F107574		
2	PLUG #3		Technician: Respondent	Angel			
3		Cert. #ZF954157C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count		
4		Fraudulent Inspection	IGCHK23255F938599	JVPW1850	12   2		
5		(7/11/2016)					
6		Expected Value	1GCHK23D37F107574	ICAN11bt5	28   9   3		
7							
8	CLEAN	2002 TOYOTA	. CAMRY LE/XLE/SE, VIN	4T1BF30K02U	001747		
9	PLUG #4	Technician: Respondent Angel					
10		Cert. #QE362099C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count		
11		Fraudulent Inspection	IN4AL11D05C201332 <sup>14</sup>	19140808	18		
12		(9/22/2016)	,				
13		Expected Value	Not Reported	I914	21 or 22		
14							
15			I VALLEY CARE CARE				
16			4212 FIRST STREET LIVERMORE				
17	Between June 2015 and February 2017, Respondents Owner, Angel, Anklam, and Villegas						
18	clean plugged and issued fraudulent certificates of compliance to the following 10 vehicles at						
19	Respondent	Respondent Owner's 4212 First Street shop in Livermore, California:					
20	111		·				
21	///						

23

24

25

26

27

28

The OIS data also showed that a 2005 Nissan Altima S/SL, VIN 1N4AL11D05C201332 was certified at Tri Valley Car Care on September 15, 2016, and was the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2002 Toyota Camry.

	<del></del>		<del></del>		
CLEAN	2009 HONDA CIVIC LX, VIN 19XFA16559E038201				
PLUG #1	Technician: Respondent Anklam				
	Cert. # PS676188C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Coun	
	Fraudulent Inspection	5FNRL38628B056799	ICAN29bt500	44   19	
	(6/22/2015)				
	Expected Value	19XFA16559E038201	ICAN29bt5	39   19	
•			·		
CLEAN	2005 TO	DYOTA PRIUS, VIN JTDK	B20U253107770		
PLUG #2		Technician: Respondent A	unklam		
	Cert. # YT960506C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Coun	
	Fraudulent Inspection	JTEEW41A582025765	ICAN11bt500	45   21	
	(8/20/2015)				
	Expected Value	JTDKB20U253107770	ICAN11bt5	37   21, 37   2	
				17 or 37   21	
CLEAN			ntt		
CLEAN	2001 FOR	D ESCAPE XLT, VIN 1FM	CU04181KF5387	73	
PLUG #3	2001 FOR	D ESCAPE XLT, VIN 1FM  Technician: Respondent A		73	
	2001 FOR Cert. # PY670783C	·			
		Technician: Respondent A	nklam		
	Cert. # PY670783C	Technician: Respondent A	anklam Protocol	PID Cour	
	Cert. # PY670783C Fraudulent Inspection	Technician: Respondent A	anklam Protocol	PID Cour	
PLUG #3	Cert. # PY670783C Fraudulent Inspection (10/30/2015) Expected Value	Technician: Respondent A  eVIN Number  1FMCU9DG4AKA03725  1FMCU04181KF53873	Protocol ICAN11bt500 JPWM	45 20 or 23	
PLUG #3 CLEAN	Cert. # PY670783C Fraudulent Inspection (10/30/2015) Expected Value	Technician: Respondent A eVIN Number  1FMCU9DG4AKA03725  1FMCU04181KF53873  FA HIGHLANDER, VIN J	Protocol ICAN11bt500  JPWM TEGD21A750122	45 20 or 23	
PLUG #3 CLEAN	Cert. # PY670783C Fraudulent Inspection (10/30/2015) Expected Value	Technician: Respondent A  eVIN Number  1FMCU9DG4AKA03725  1FMCU04181KF53873  FA HIGHLANDER, VIN J  Technician: Respondent V	Protocol ICAN11bt500  JPWM  TEGD21A750122	45 20 or 23	
PLUG #3	Cert. # PY670783C  Fraudulent Inspection (10/30/2015)  Expected Value  2005 TOYO  Cert. #ZB810057C	Technician: Respondent A eVIN Number  1FMCU9DG4AKA03725  1FMCU04181KF53873  FA HIGHLANDER, VIN J Technician: Respondent V eVIN Number	Protocol ICAN11bt500  JPWM FEGD21A750122 Villegas Protocol	PID Cour 45 20 or 23 2475	
PLUG #3 CLEAN	Cert. # PY670783C  Fraudulent Inspection (10/30/2015)  Expected Value  2005 TOYO  Cert. #ZB810057C  Fraudulent Inspection	Technician: Respondent A  eVIN Number  1FMCU9DG4AKA03725  1FMCU04181KF53873  FA HIGHLANDER, VIN J  Technician: Respondent V	Protocol ICAN11bt500  JPWM  TEGD21A750122	45 20 or 23	
PLUG #3 CLEAN	Cert. # PY670783C  Fraudulent Inspection (10/30/2015)  Expected Value  2005 TOYO  Cert. #ZB810057C	Technician: Respondent A eVIN Number  1FMCU9DG4AKA03725  1FMCU04181KF53873  FA HIGHLANDER, VIN J Technician: Respondent V eVIN Number	Protocol ICAN11bt500  JPWM FEGD21A750122 Villegas Protocol	PID Coun 45 20 or 23 2475 PID Coun	

CLEÁN	2000 CHEVROLET S10, VIN 1GCCS1443Y8163152 <sup>15</sup> Technician: Respondent Angel				
PLUG #5					
	Cert. # QE595912C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection	IJ4RS6GT4BC503904 <sup>16</sup>	ICAN11bt500	41	
	(9/26/2016)				
	Expected Value	Not Reported	JVPW	16 or 17	

CLEAN	2010 TOYOTA VENZA, VIN 4T3ZK3BB3AU027451			
PLUG #6	Technician: Respondent Villegas			
	Cert. # QE595913C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count
	Fraudulent Inspection	Not Reported	19140808	20
	(9/27/2016)	,		
	Expected Value	4T3ZK3BB3AU027451	ICAN11bt5	47   17

CLEAN	2006 NISSAN 350Z ROADSTER, VIN JN1AZ36A36M454016				
PLUG #7	Technician: Respondent Angel				
	Cert. # ZN513581C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection	1J4RS6GT4BC503904 <sup>17</sup>	ICAN11bt50	41	
	(1/16/2017)	•			
	Expected Value	JN1AZ36A36M454016	I914	22	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> OIS data showed that the same 2000 Chevrolet S10 failed an OIS smog check inspection at Buls Auto Service & Smog the same day the fraudulent inspection was performed.

DMV records show that the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2000 Chevrolet S10 was a 2011 Jeep Grand Cherokee Overland, VIN 1J4RS6GT4BC503904, registered to Respondent Angel.

<sup>17</sup> DMV records show that the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2006 Nissan 350Z Roadster was a 2011 Jeep Grand Cherokee Overland, VIN 1J4RS6GT4BC503904, registered to Respondent Angel.

CLEAN	AN 2000 HONDA CIVIC BASE, VIN 2HGEJ6615YH506664				
PLUG #8	Technician: Respondent Angel				
	Cert. # ZN513582C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection (1/16/2017)	1J4RS6GT4BC503904 <sup>18</sup>	ICAN11bt500	41	
	Expected Value	Not Reported	I914	16	

CLEAN	2007 CHEVROLET COBALT LT, VIN 1G1AL55F977307117				
PLUG #9	Technician: Respondent Angel				
	Cert. # ZP087950C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection (2/3/2017)	1HGCM56795A101513 <sup>19</sup>	19140808	21	
	Expected Value	1G1AL55F977307117	ICAN11bt5	38, 38   7, 39,	
		,		or 39   7 ·	

CLEAN	2001 CHEVROLET SILVERADO C1500, VIN IGCEC19V11Z204174  Technician: Respondent Angel			
PLUG #10				
	Cert. # ZP773238C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count
	Fraudulent Inspection (2/24/2017)	5UXFA93525LE83002 <sup>20</sup>	KWPF8FEF	21   7
	Expected Value	IGCEC19V11Z204174	JVPW	22 or 23

DMV records show that the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2007 Chevrolet Cobalt was a 2011 Jeep Grand Cherokee Overland, VIN 1J4RS6GT4BC503904, registered to Respondent Angel.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> The OIS data also showed that a 2005 Honda Accord EX, VIN IHGCM56795A101513, was certified at Tri Valley Car Care by Respondent Angel on the same day, and was the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2007 Chevrolet Cobalt.

The OIS data also showed that a 2005 BMW X4 4.8IS, VIN 5UXFA93525LE83002, was certified at Tri Valley Car Care by Respondent Angel on the same day, and was the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent certificate of compliance for the 2001 Chevrolet Silverado.

#### FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Misleading Statements - Registration)

34. Respondent Owner has subjected his registration to discipline under Code section 9884.7(a)(1), in that Respondent Owner made statements which he knew or which by the exercise of reasonable care he should have known were untrue or misleading, as set forth above in Factual Summary. Respondent Owner purported to test the 25 vehicles and certified that the 25 vehicles passed inspection and were in compliance with applicable laws and regulations. In fact, Respondent Owner conducted the inspections on those vehicles using clean-plugging methods.

#### SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Fraud - Registration)

35. Respondent Owner has subjected his registration to discipline under Code section 9884.7(a)(4), in that he committed acts which constitute fraud, as set forth above in Factual Summary.

#### THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Violation of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program - Station License)

- 36. Respondent Owner has subjected his station license to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(a) and (c), in that he violated sections of the Health and Safety Code and applicable regulations, as set forth above in Factual Summary, as follows:
- a. **Health and Safety Code Section 44012**: Respondent Owner failed to ensure that the 25 emission control tests were performed on the vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- b. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.24(c): Respondent Owner falsely or fraudulently issued electronic certificates of compliance for the 25 vehicles without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles as required by Health and Safety Code section 44012.
- d. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.41(c): Respondent Owner entered into the emissions inspection system vehicle identification information or emission control system identification data for a vehicle other than the one being tested. Respondent

C	c. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.30(a): Respondent Angel
failed t	to inspect and test the vehicles in accordance with Health and Safety Code sections 44012
and 44	035 and/or California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42.

- d. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.41(c): Respondent Angel entered into the emissions inspection system vehicle identification information or emission control system identification data for a vehicle other than the one being tested, and/or knowingly entered into the emissions inspection system false information about the vehicles being tested.
- e. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.42: Respondent Angel failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on the vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

#### SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit - Respondent Angel's Smog Check Inspector License)

39. Respondent Angel has subjected his Smog Check Inspector License to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(d), in that he committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another was injured, when he willfully made false entries on the electronic certificates of compliance and certified that the vehicles had been inspected as required when, in fact, they had not, depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. The circumstances are described in more detail above in Factual Summary.

#### SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

## (Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Anklam Smog Check Inspector License)

40. Respondent Anklam has subjected his Smog Check Inspector License and his Smog Check Repair Technician License to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(a) and (c), in that he violated sections of the Health and Safety Code and applicable regulations, as set forth above in Factual Summary, as follows:

28 || ///

III

- a. **Health and Safety Code Section 44012**: Respondent Anklam failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on the vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- b. Health and Safety Code Section 44059: Respondent Anklam willfully made false entries on the electronic certificates of compliance by certifying that the vehicles had been inspected as required when, in fact, they had not.
- c. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.30(a): Respondent Anklam failed to inspect and test the vehicles in accordance with Health and Safety Code sections 44012 and 44035 and/or California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42.
- d. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.41(c): Respondent Anklam entered into the emissions inspection system vehicle identification information or emission control system identification data for a vehicle other than the one being tested, and/or knowingly entered into the emissions inspection system false information about the vehicles being tested.
- e. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.42: Respondent Anklam failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on the vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

#### EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit - Respondent Anklam's Smog Check Inspector License)

41. Respondent Anklam has subjected his Smog Check Inspector License and his Smog Check Repair Technician License to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(d), in that he committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another was injured, when he willfully made false entries on the electronic certificates of compliance and certified that the vehicles had been inspected as required when, in fact, they had not, depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. The circumstances are described in more detail above in Factual Summary.

26	/
26	/

27 | /

28 | ///

#### NINTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

## (Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Villegas Smog Check Inspector License)

- 42. Respondent Villegas has subjected his Smog Check Inspector License to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(a) and (c), in that he violated sections of the Health and Safety Code and applicable regulations, as set forth above in Factual Summary, as follows:
- a. **Health and Safety Code Section 44012**: Respondent Villegas failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on the vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- b. **Health and Safety Code Section 44059**: Respondent Villegas willfully made false entries on the electronic certificates of compliance by certifying that the vehicles had been inspected as required when, in fact, they had not.
- c. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.30(a): Respondent Villegas failed to inspect and test the vehicles in accordance with Health and Safety Code sections 44012 and 44035 and/or California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42.
- d. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.41(c): Respondent Villegas entered into the emissions inspection system vehicle identification information or emission control system identification data for a vehicle other than the one being tested, and/or knowingly entered into the emissions inspection system false information about the vehicles being tested.
- e. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.42: Respondent Villegas failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on the vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

#### TENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit - Respondent Villegas's Smog Check Inspector License)

43. Respondent Villegas has subjected his Smog Check Inspector License to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(d), in that he committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another was injured, when he willfully made false entries on the

electronic certificates of compliance and certified that the vehicles had been inspected as required when, in fact, they had not, depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. The circumstances are described in more detail above in Factual Summary.

#### **ELEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

## (Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Hernandez Smog Check Inspector License)

- 44. Respondent Hernandez has subjected his Smog Check Inspector License and his Smog Check Repair Technician License to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(a) and (c), in that he violated sections of the Health and Safety Code and applicable regulations, as set forth above in Factual Summary, as follows:
- a. Health and Safety Code Section 44012: Respondent Hernandez failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on the vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- b. **Health and Safety Code Section 44059**: Respondent Hernandez willfully made false entries on the electronic certificates of compliance by certifying that the vehicles had been inspected as required when, in fact, they had not.
- c. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.30(a): Respondent Hernandez failed to inspect and test the vehicles in accordance with Health and Safety Code sections 44012 and 44035 and/or California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42.
- d. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.41(c): Respondent Hernandez entered into the emissions inspection system vehicle identification information or emission control system identification data for a vehicle other than the one being tested, and/or knowingly entered into the emissions inspection system false information about the vehicles being tested.
- e. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.42: Respondent Hernandez failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on the vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

#### 

#### 

## 

## 

### 

### 

#### 

#### 

# 

## 

### 

#### 

### 

#### 

## 

# 

#### 

#### 

### 

# 

## 

III

## 

#### TWELFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

## (Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit – Respondent Hernandez's Smog Check Inspector License)

45. Respondent Hernandez has subjected his Smog Check Inspector License and his Smog Check Repair Technician License to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(d), in that he committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another was injured, when he willfully made false entries on the electronic certificates of compliance and certified that the vehicles had been inspected as required when, in fact, they had not, depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. The circumstances are described in more detail above in Factual Summary.

#### **DISCIPLINE CONSIDERATIONS**

To determine the degree of discipline, if any, to be imposed, Complainant alleges the following:

- 46. Between approximately April 30, 2009 and February 23, 2016, Tri Valley Car Care was issued six (6) citations for violations of Health and Safety Code section 44012.
- 47. On or about February 23, 2016, Respondent Angel was issued Citation Number M2016-0533 for issuing a Certificate of Compliance to a vehicle using a BAR 97 when the OBD Inspection System was required.
- 48. On or about March 6, 2012, Respondent Hernandez was issued Citation Number M2012-1082 for issuing a Certificate of Compliance to a vehicle with a missing fuel evaporative canister; and on or about June 2, 2015, Respondent Hernandez was issued Citation Number M2015-0660 for issuing a Certificate of Compliance to a vehicle using a BAR 97 when the OBD Inspection System was required.
- 49. On or about February 16, 2016, Respondent Villegas was issued Citation Number M2016-0452 for issuing a Certificate of Compliance to a vehicle using a BAR 97 when the OBD Inspection System was required. The citation matter is pending appeal.

#### **OTHER MATTERS**

- 50. Pursuant to Code section 9884.7(c), the Director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the automotive repair dealer registrations for all places of business operated in this state by Respondent Owner upon a finding that Respondent Owner has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of the laws and regulations pertaining to an automotive repair dealer.
- 51. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if Respondent Owner's station license is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Respondent Owner may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.
- 52. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if Respondent Angel's Smog Check Inspector License is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Respondent Angel may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.
- 53. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if either Respondent Anklam's Smog Check Inspector License or Smog Check Repair Technician License is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Respondent Angel may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.
- 54. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if Respondent Villegas's Smog Check Inspector License is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Respondent Angel may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.
- 55. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if either Respondent Hernandez's Smog Check Inspector License or Smog Check Repair Technician License is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Respondent Hernandez may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.

9

12<sup>-</sup>

14 15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

2324

2.5

26

27

28

///

#### **PRAYER**

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- 1. Revoking or suspending Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Numbers ARD 250215, ARD 250216, and ARD 263831, Smog Check Station License No. RC 250215, Smog Check Station License No. RC 250216, and Smog Check Station License No. TC 263831, issued to Martin Hernandez Owner, d.b.a. Tri Valley Car Care (Respondent Owner), and
- 2. Revoking or suspending any other automotive repair dealer registration issued to Martin Hernandez;
- 3. Revoking or suspending any other license issued under Chapter 5, Part 5, Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Martin Hernandez;
- 4. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635174, issued to Magno Ramon Angel (Respondent Angel);
- 5. Revoking or suspending any other license issued under Chapter 5, Part 5, Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Respondent Angel;
- 6. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635425, issued to Nick Noel Anklam (Respondent Anklam);
- 7. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Technician License No. EI 635425, issued to Respondent Anklam;
- 8. Revoking or suspending any other license issued under Chapter 5, Part 5, Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Respondent Anklam;
- 9. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 635766, issued to Jonathan Ezequiel Villegas (Respondent Villegas);
- 10. Revoking or suspending any other license issued under Chapter 5, Part 5, Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Respondent Villegas;
- 11. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 631794, issued to Christopher Martin Hernandez (Respondent Hernandez);