

**BEFORE THE DIRECTOR OF THE  
DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS  
BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR  
STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

In the Matter of the Accusation Against:

**MS AUTO REPAIR; MOHAMMED SAHID**  
501 South Norfolk Street  
San Mateo, CA 94401

Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No.  
ARD 223079  
Smog Check Station License No. RC 223079

and

**ANDY PHONG TRAN**  
3326 Coachlight Drive  
San Jose, CA 95111

Smog Check Inspector No. EO 636650

Respondents.

Case No.: 79/17-3640

OAH No.: 2018110875

**DECISION**

The attached Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order for MS AUTO REPAIR; MOHAMMED SAHID Only is hereby accepted and adopted by the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs as the Decision in the above-entitled matter.

This Decision shall become effective at 5:00 p.m. on October 1, 2019.

DATED: Aug-19, 2019

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
GRACE ARUPO RODRIGUEZ  
Assistant Deputy Director  
Legal Affairs Division  
Department of Consumer Affairs

1 XAVIER BECERRA  
Attorney General of California  
2 DIANN SOKOLOFF  
Supervising Deputy Attorney General  
3 LAURA PEDICINI  
Deputy Attorney General  
4 State Bar No. 200934  
1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor  
5 P.O. Box 70550  
Oakland, CA 94612-0550  
6 Telephone: (510) 879-0269  
Facsimile: (510) 622-2270  
7 E-mail: Laura.Pedicini@doj.ca.gov  
Attorneys for Complainant  
8

9  
10 BEFORE THE  
DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS  
FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR  
11 STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
12  
13

14 In the Matter of the Accusation Against

15 MS AUTO REPAIR; MOHAMMED  
16 SAHID  
501 South Norfolk Street  
17 San Mateo, CA 94401

18 Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No.  
19 ARD 223079

20 Smog Check Station License No. RC 223079

21 Respondent.  
22

Case No. 79/17-3640

OAH Case No. 2018110875

STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AND  
DISCIPLINARY ORDER FOR

MS AUTO REPAIR; MOHAMMED  
SAHID ONLY

23  
24 IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by and between the parties to the above-  
25 entitled proceedings that the following matters are true;

26 PARTIES

27 1. Patrick Dorals (Complainant) is the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair  
28 (Bureau). He brought this action solely in his official capacity and is represented in this matter by

1 Xavier Becerra, Attorney General of the State of California, by Laura Pedicini, Deputy Attorney  
2 General.

3 2. Respondent MS Auto Repair; Mohammed Sahid (Respondent) is represented in this  
4 proceeding by attorney Robert P. Shatzko, whose address is: 969G Edgewater Blvd., Suite 1007  
5 Foster City, CA 94404.

6 3. On or about October 31, 2002, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer  
7 Registration No. ARD 223079 to MS Auto Repair; Mohammed Sahid (Respondent). The  
8 Automotive Repair Dealer Registration will expire on July 31, 2019, unless renewed.

9 4. On or about October 31, 2002, the Bureau issued Smog Check Station License No.  
10 RC 223079 to MS Auto Repair; Mohammed Sahid (Respondent). The Smog Check Station  
11 License will expire on July 31, 2019, unless renewed.

12 JURISDICTION

13 5. Accusation No. 79/17-3640 was filed before the Director, and is currently pending  
14 against Respondent. The Accusation and all other statutorily required documents were properly  
15 served on Respondent on April 25, 2018. Respondent timely filed his Notice of Defense  
16 contesting the Accusation.

17 6. A copy of Accusation No. 79/17-3640 is attached as exhibit A and incorporated  
18 herein by reference.

19 ADVISEMENT AND WAIVERS

20 7. Respondent has carefully read, fully discussed with counsel, and understands the  
21 charges and allegations in Accusation No. 79/17-3640. Respondent has also carefully read, fully  
22 discussed with counsel, and understands the effects of this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary  
23 Order.

24 8. Respondent is fully aware of his legal rights in this matter, including the right to a  
25 hearing on the charges and allegations in the Accusation; the right to confront and cross-examine  
26 the witnesses against him; the right to present evidence and to testify on his own behalf; the right  
27 to the issuance of subpoenas to compel the attendance of witnesses and the production of  
28

1 documents; the right to reconsideration and court review of an adverse decision; and all other  
2 rights accorded by the California Administrative Procedure Act and other applicable laws.

3 9. Respondent voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently waives and gives up each and  
4 every right set forth above.

5 CULPABILITY

6 10. Respondent admits the truth of each and every charge and allegation in Accusation  
7 No. 79/17-3640.

8 11. Respondent agrees that his Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to  
9 discipline and he agrees to be bound by the Director's probationary terms as set forth in the  
10 Disciplinary Order below.

11 12. Respondent agrees that his Smog Check Station License is subject to discipline and  
12 he agrees to be bound by the Director's probationary terms as set forth in the Disciplinary Order  
13 below.

14 CONTINGENCY

15 13. This stipulation shall be subject to approval by the Director of Consumer Affairs or  
16 the Director's designee. Respondent understands and agrees that counsel for Complainant and the  
17 staff of the Bureau of Automotive Repair may communicate directly with the Director and staff of  
18 the Department of Consumer Affairs regarding this stipulation and settlement, without notice to  
19 or participation by Respondent or his counsel. By signing the stipulation, Respondent  
20 understands and agrees that he may not withdraw his agreement or seek to rescind the stipulation  
21 prior to the time the Director considers and acts upon it. If the Director fails to adopt this  
22 stipulation as the Decision and Order, the Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order shall be of  
23 no force or effect, except for this paragraph, it shall be inadmissible in any legal action between  
24 the parties, and the Director shall not be disqualified from further action by having considered  
25 this matter.

26 14. The parties understand and agree that Portable Document Format (PDF) and facsimile  
27 copies of this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order, including PDF and facsimile  
28 signatures thereto, shall have the same force and effect as the originals.

1           15. This Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is intended by the parties to be an  
2 integrated writing representing the complete, final, and exclusive embodiment of their agreement.

3 It supersedes any and all prior or contemporaneous agreements, understandings, discussions,  
4 negotiations, and commitments (written or oral). This Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary  
5 Order may not be altered, amended, modified, supplemented, or otherwise changed except by a  
6 writing executed by an authorized representative of each of the parties.

7           16. In consideration of the foregoing admissions and stipulations, the parties agree that  
8 the Director may, without further notice or formal proceeding, issue and enter the following  
9 Disciplinary Order:

10                                   DISCIPLINARY ORDER

11           IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 223079  
12 and Smog Check Station License No. RC 223079 issued to Respondent MS Auto Repair;  
13 Mohammed Sahid is revoked. However, the revocation is stayed and Respondent is placed on  
14 probation for five (5) years with an actual suspension of ten (10) days on the following terms and  
15 conditions.

16           1. Obey All Laws. During the period of probation, Respondent shall comply with all  
17 federal and state statutes, regulations and rules governing all BAR registrations and licenses held  
18 by Respondent.

19           2. Posting of Sign. (Applicable only when actual suspension of a registration or station  
20 license is ordered): During the period of suspension (10 days), Respondent shall prominently  
21 post a sign or signs, provided by BAR, indicating the beginning and ending dates of the  
22 suspension and indicating the reason for the suspension. The sign or signs shall be conspicuously  
23 displayed in a location or locations open to and frequented by customers. The location(s) of the  
24 sign(s) shall be approved by BAR and shall remain posted during the entire period of actual  
25 suspension.

26           3. Quarterly Reporting. During the period of probation, Respondent shall report either  
27 by personal appearance or in writing as determined by BAR on a schedule set by BAR, but no  
28 more frequently than once each calendar quarter, on the methods used and success achieved in

1 maintaining compliance with the terms and conditions of probation.

2 4. ~~Report Financial Interests.~~ Respondent shall, within 30 days of the effective date

3 of the decision and within 30 days from the date of any request by BAR during the period of  
4 probation, report any financial interest which any Respondent or any partners, officers, or owners  
5 of any Respondent facility may have in any other business required to be registered pursuant to  
6 Section 9884.6 of the Business and Professions Code.

7 5. Access to Examine Vehicles and Records. Respondent shall provide BAR  
8 representatives unrestricted access to examine all vehicles (including parts) undergoing service,  
9 inspection, or repairs, up to and including the point of completion. Respondent shall also provide  
10 BAR representatives unrestricted access to all records pursuant to BAR laws and regulations.

11 6. Tolling of Probation. If, during probation, Respondent leaves the jurisdiction of  
12 California to reside or do business elsewhere or otherwise ceases to do business in the jurisdiction  
13 of California, Respondent shall notify BAR in writing within 10 days of the dates of departure  
14 and return, and of the dates of cessation and resumption of business in California. All provisions  
15 of probation other than cost reimbursement requirements, restitution requirements, training  
16 requirements, and that Respondent obey all laws, shall be held in abeyance during any period of  
17 time of 30 days or more in which Respondent is not residing or engaging in business within the  
18 jurisdiction of California. All provisions of probation shall recommence on the effective date of  
19 resumption of business in California. Any period of time of 30 days or more in which Respondent  
20 is not residing or engaging in business within the jurisdiction of California shall not apply to the  
21 reduction of this probationary period or to any period of actual suspension not previously  
22 completed. Tolling is not available if business or work relevant to the probationary license or  
23 registration is conducted or performed during the tolling period.

24 7. Violation of Probation. If Respondent violates or fails to comply with the terms and  
25 conditions of probation in any respect, the Director, after giving notice and opportunity to be  
26 heard may set aside the stay order and carry out the disciplinary order provided in the decision.  
27 Once Respondent is served notice of BAR's intent to set aside the stay, the Director shall maintain  
28 jurisdiction, and the period of probation shall be extended until final resolution of the matter.

1           8.    **Maintain Valid License.** Respondent shall, at all times while on probation, maintain  
2 a current and active registration and/or license(s) with BAR, including any period during which  
3 suspension or probation is tolled. If Respondent's registration or license is expired at the time the  
4 decision becomes effective, the registration or license must be renewed by Respondent within 30  
5 days of that date. If Respondent's registration or license expires during a term of probation, by  
6 operation of law or otherwise, then upon renewal Respondent's registration or license shall be  
7 subject to any and all terms and conditions of probation not previously satisfied. Failure to  
8 maintain a current and active registration and/or license during the period of probation shall also  
9 constitute a violation of probation.

10           9.    **Cost Recovery.** Respondent shall pay the Bureau of Automotive Repair \$11,250.00  
11 or the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of case No. 79/17-3640. Respondent  
12 shall make such payment as follows: Forty-eight monthly payments to be paid in equal monthly  
13 installments over the course of the first 48 months of probation. Any agreement for a scheduled  
14 payment plan shall require full payment to be completed no later than six (6) months before  
15 probation terminates. Respondent shall make payment by check or money order payable to the  
16 Bureau of Automotive Repair and shall indicate on the check or money order that it is for cost  
17 recovery payment for case No. 79/17-3640. Any order for payment of cost recovery shall remain  
18 in effect whether or not probation is tolled. Probation shall not terminate until full cost recovery  
19 payment has been made. BAR reserves the right to pursue any other lawful measures in collecting  
20 on the costs ordered and past due, in addition to taking action based upon the violation of  
21 probation.

22           10.   **Completion of Probation.** Upon successful completion of probation, Respondent's  
23 affected registration and/or license will be fully restored or issued without restriction, if  
24 Respondent meets all current requirements for registration or licensure and has paid all  
25 outstanding fees, monetary penalties, or cost recovery owed to BAR.

26           11.   **License Surrender.** Following the effective date of a decision that orders a stay of  
27 invalidation or revocation, if Respondent ceases business operations or is otherwise unable to  
28 satisfy the terms and conditions of probation, Respondent may request that the stay be vacated.

1 Such request shall be made in writing to BAR. The Director and the BAR Chief reserve the right  
2 to evaluate the Respondent's request and to exercise discretion whether to grant the request or  
3 take any other action deemed appropriate or reasonable under the circumstances. Upon formal  
4 granting of the request, the Director will vacate the stay order and carry out the disciplinary order  
5 provided in the decision. Respondent may not petition the Director for reinstatement of the  
6 surrendered registration and/or license, or apply for a new registration or license under the  
7 jurisdiction of BAR at any time before the date of the originally scheduled completion of  
8 probation. If Respondent applies to BAR for a registration or license at any time after that date,  
9 Respondent must meet all current requirements for registration or licensure and pay all  
10 outstanding fees or cost recovery owed to BAR and left outstanding at the time of surrender.

11 12. Actual Suspension. Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 223079 and  
12 Smog Check Station License No. RC 223079 issued to Respondent Mohammed Sahid are  
13 suspended for ten (10) consecutive days beginning on the effective date of the Decision and  
14 Order.

15 13. Supervision Requirements - Respondent shall not delegate his or her supervisory  
16 duties, as they relate to the business activities relevant to the probationary registration and/or  
17 license, to another person during the period of probation. Any persons employed by Respondent  
18 to carry out such business activities shall be directly supervised by Respondent. In the event that a  
19 bona fide medical condition arises during the period of probation, which temporarily prevents  
20 Respondent from exercising direct supervision over employees, notice and medical substantiation  
21 of the condition shall be submitted to BAR within ten (10) days of the medical affirmation of the  
22 condition.

#### 23 24 ACCEPTANCE

25 I have carefully read the above Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order and have fully  
26 discussed it with my attorney, Robert P. Shatzko. I understand the stipulation and the effect it  
27 will have on my Automotive Repair Dealer Registration, and Smog Check Station License. I  
28 enter into this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order voluntarily, knowingly, and



1  
2  
3  
4 DATED: 5/28/2019

5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268  
269  
270  
271  
272  
273  
274  
275  
276  
277  
278  
279  
280  
281  
282  
283  
284  
285  
286  
287  
288  
289  
290  
291  
292  
293  
294  
295  
296  
297  
298  
299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323  
324  
325  
326  
327  
328  
329  
330  
331  
332  
333  
334  
335  
336  
337  
338  
339  
340  
341  
342  
343  
344  
345  
346  
347  
348  
349  
350  
351  
352  
353  
354  
355  
356  
357  
358  
359  
360  
361  
362  
363  
364  
365  
366  
367  
368  
369  
370  
371  
372  
373  
374  
375  
376  
377  
378  
379  
380  
381  
382  
383  
384  
385  
386  
387  
388  
389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412  
413  
414  
415  
416  
417  
418  
419  
420  
421  
422  
423  
424  
425  
426  
427  
428  
429  
430  
431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466  
467  
468  
469  
470  
471  
472  
473  
474  
475  
476  
477  
478  
479  
480  
481  
482  
483  
484  
485  
486  
487  
488  
489  
490  
491  
492  
493  
494  
495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515  
516  
517  
518  
519  
520  
521  
522  
523  
524  
525  
526  
527  
528  
529  
530  
531  
532  
533  
534  
535  
536  
537  
538  
539  
540  
541  
542  
543  
544  
545  
546  
547  
548  
549  
550  
551  
552  
553  
554  
555  
556  
557  
558  
559  
560  
561  
562  
563  
564  
565  
566  
567  
568  
569  
570  
571  
572  
573  
574  
575  
576  
577  
578  
579  
580  
581  
582  
583  
584  
585  
586  
587  
588  
589  
590  
591  
592  
593  
594  
595  
596  
597  
598  
599  
600  
601  
602  
603  
604  
605  
606  
607  
608  
609  
610  
611  
612  
613  
614  
615  
616  
617  
618  
619  
620  
621  
622  
623  
624  
625  
626  
627  
628  
629  
630  
631  
632  
633  
634  
635  
636  
637  
638  
639  
640  
641  
642  
643  
644  
645  
646  
647  
648  
649  
650  
651  
652  
653  
654  
655  
656  
657  
658  
659  
660  
661  
662  
663  
664  
665  
666  
667  
668  
669  
670  
671  
672  
673  
674  
675  
676  
677  
678  
679  
680  
681  
682  
683  
684  
685  
686  
687  
688  
689  
690  
691  
692  
693  
694  
695  
696  
697  
698  
699  
700  
701  
702  
703  
704  
705  
706  
707  
708  
709  
710  
711  
712  
713  
714  
715  
716  
717  
718  
719  
720  
721  
722  
723  
724  
725  
726  
727  
728  
729  
730  
731  
732  
733  
734  
735  
736  
737  
738  
739  
740  
741  
742  
743  
744  
745  
746  
747  
748  
749  
750  
751  
752  
753  
754  
755  
756  
757  
758  
759  
760  
761  
762  
763  
764  
765  
766  
767  
768  
769  
770  
771  
772  
773  
774  
775  
776  
777  
778  
779  
780  
781  
782  
783  
784  
785  
786  
787  
788  
789  
790  
791  
792  
793  
794  
795  
796  
797  
798  
799  
800  
801  
802  
803  
804  
805  
806  
807  
808  
809  
810  
811  
812  
813  
814  
815  
816  
817  
818  
819  
820  
821  
822  
823  
824  
825  
826  
827  
828  
829  
830  
831  
832  
833  
834  
835  
836  
837  
838  
839  
840  
841  
842  
843  
844  
845  
846  
847  
848  
849  
850  
851  
852  
853  
854  
855  
856  
857  
858  
859  
860  
861  
862  
863  
864  
865  
866  
867  
868  
869  
870  
871  
872  
873  
874  
875  
876  
877  
878  
879  
880  
881  
882  
883  
884  
885  
886  
887  
888  
889  
890  
891  
892  
893  
894  
895  
896  
897  
898  
899  
900  
901  
902  
903  
904  
905  
906  
907  
908  
909  
910  
911  
912  
913  
914  
915  
916  
917  
918  
919  
920  
921  
922  
923  
924  
925  
926  
927  
928  
929  
930  
931  
932  
933  
934  
935  
936  
937  
938  
939  
940  
941  
942  
943  
944  
945  
946  
947  
948  
949  
950  
951  
952  
953  
954  
955  
956  
957  
958  
959  
960  
961  
962  
963  
964  
965  
966  
967  
968  
969  
970  
971  
972  
973  
974  
975  
976  
977  
978  
979  
980  
981  
982  
983  
984  
985  
986  
987  
988  
989  
990  
991  
992  
993  
994  
995  
996  
997  
998  
999  
1000

I have read and fully understand with Respondent MS Anne Hagan; Mohammed Rafi  
and other respondents and other respondents and in the above signed Settlement and  
Agreement. I agree to the terms and conditions.

DATED: 5/30/2019

Signature of Respondent

WITNESSES:

I, the undersigned, Subscribed and sworn and the undersigned, I hereby respectfully  
attest to the truth of the above.

Respectfully submitted,  
[Signature]  
[Name]  
[Title]  
[Address]  
[City]  
[State]  
[Zip]

[Signature]  
[Name]  
[Title]  
[Address]  
[City]  
[State]  
[Zip]

**Exhibit A**

**Accusation No, 79/17-3640**

1 XAVIER BECERRA  
Attorney General of California  
2 DIANN SOKOLOFF  
Supervising Deputy Attorney General  
3 TIMOTHY J. McDONOUGH  
Deputy Attorney General  
4 State Bar No. 235850  
1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor  
5 P.O. Box 70550  
Oakland, CA 94612-0550  
6 Telephone: (510) 879-0294  
Facsimile: (510) 622-2270  
7 E-mail: Tim.McDonough@doj.ca.gov  
*Attorneys for Complainant*

8  
9 **BEFORE THE**  
**DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS**  
10 **FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR**  
**STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

11  
12 In the Matter of the Accusation Against:

Case No. *79/17-3040*

13 **MS AUTO REPAIR; MOHAMMED**  
**SAHID**  
14 **501 South Norfolk Street**  
**San Mateo, CA 94401**

**A C C U S A T I O N**

15 **Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No.**  
16 **ARD 223079**

17 **Smog Check Station License No. RC 223079**

18 **and**

19 **ANDY PHONG TRAN**  
**3326 Coachlight Drive**  
20 **San Jose, CA 95111**

21 **Smog Check Inspector No. EO 636650**

22  
23 Respondent.

24  
25 Complainant alleges:

26 **PARTIES**

27 1. Patrick Dorais (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as  
28 the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair, Department of Consumer Affairs.

2. In 2002, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 223079 to Mohammed Sahid, doing business as MS Auto Repair (Respondent MS Auto). The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought in this Accusation and will expire on July 31, 2018, unless renewed.

3. On or about October 31, 2002, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Smog Check Station License Number RC 223079 to MS Auto Repair; Mohammed Sahid (Respondent MS Auto). The Smog Check Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought in this Accusation and will expire on July 31, 2018, unless renewed.

4. On or about March 18, 2014, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Smog Check Inspector Number EO 636650 to Andy Phong Tran (Respondent Tran). The Smog Check Inspector License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought in this Accusation and will expire on May 31, 2018, unless renewed.

## JURISDICTION

5. This Accusation is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs (Director) for the Bureau of Automotive Repair, under the authority of the following laws.

6. Business and Professions Code (Code) section 118, subdivision (b), provides that the suspension, expiration, surrender, or cancellation of a license shall not deprive the Board, Registrar, or Director of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary action during the period within which the license may be renewed, restored; reissued or reinstated.

7. Section 9884.13 of the Code provides, in relevant part, that the expiration of a valid registration shall not deprive the director or chief of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary proceeding against an automotive repair dealer or to render a decision invalidating a registration temporarily or permanently.

8. Section 44002 of the Health and Safety Code provides, in relevant part, that the Director has all the powers and authority granted under the Automotive Repair Act for enforcing the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

1       9.    Section 44072.6 of the Health and Safety Code provides, in relevant part, that the  
2   expiration or suspension of a license by operation of law, or by order or decision of the Director  
3   of Consumer Affairs, or a court of law, or the voluntary surrender of the license shall not deprive  
4   the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with disciplinary action.

5       10.   Code section 477 provides, in pertinent part, that "Board" includes "bureau,"  
6   "commission," "committee," "department," "division," "examining committee," "program," and  
7   "agency." "License" includes certificate, registration or other means to engage in a business or  
8   profession regulated by the code.

#### 9                                   STATUTES AND REGULATIONS

10       11.   Section 9884.7 of the Code states, in relevant part:

11       "(a) The director, where the automotive repair dealer cannot show there was a bona fide  
12   error, may deny, suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration of an automotive repair  
13   dealer for any of the following acts or omissions related to the conduct of the business of the  
14   automotive repair dealer, which are done by the automotive repair dealer or any automotive  
15   technician, employee, partner, officer, or member of the automotive repair dealer.

16       (1) Making or authorizing in any manner or by any means whatever any statement written  
17   or oral which is untrue or misleading, and which is known, or which by the exercise of reasonable  
18   care should be known, to be untrue or misleading.

19       ...

20       (4) Any other conduct which constitutes fraud.

21       ...

22       (6) Failure in any material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or  
23   regulations adopted pursuant to it."

24       12.   Section 9889.22 of the Code states:

25       "The willful making of any false statement or entry with regard to a material matter in any  
26   oath, affidavit, certificate of compliance or noncompliance, or application form which is required  
27   by this chapter or Chapter 5 (commencing with Section 44000) of Part 5 of Division 26 of the  
28   Health and Safety Code constitutes perjury and is punishable as provided in the Penal Code."

1       13. Section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code states, in relevant part:

2       "The test at the smog check stations shall be performed in accordance with procedures  
3       prescribed by the department, pursuant to Section 44013, shall require, at a minimum, loaded  
4       mode dynamometer testing in enhanced areas, and two-speed testing in all other program areas,  
5       and shall ensure all of the following:

6       ...  
7       "(f) A visual or functional check is made of emission control devices specified by the  
8       department, including the catalytic converter in those instances in which the department  
9       determines it to be necessary to meet the findings of Section 44001. The visual or functional  
10      check shall be performed in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department."

11      14. Section 44032 of the Health and Safety Code states, in relevant part:

12      "No person shall perform, for compensation, tests or repairs of emission control devices or  
13      systems of motor vehicles required by this chapter unless the person performing the test or repair  
14      is a qualified smog check technician and the test or repair is performed at a licensed smog check  
15      station. Qualified technicians shall perform tests of emission control devices and systems in  
16      accordance with Section 44012."

17      15. Section 44059 of the Health and Safety Code states:

18      "The willful making of any false statement or entry with regard to a material matter in any  
19      oath, affidavit, certificate of compliance or noncompliance, or application form which is required  
20      by this chapter or Chapter 20.3 (commencing with Section 9880) of Division 3 of the Business  
21      and Professions Code, constitutes perjury and is punishable as provided in the Penal Code."

22      16. Health and Safety Code, section 44072.2, states, in relevant part:

23      "The director may suspend, revoke, or take other disciplinary action against a license as  
24      provided in this article if the licensee, or any partner, officer, or director thereof, does any of the  
25      following:

26      "(a) Violates any section of this chapter [the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program (Health and  
27      Saf. Code, § 44000, et seq.)) and the regulations adopted pursuant to it, which related to the  
28      licensed activities.

1 ...

2 "(d) Commits any act involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another is injured."

3 17. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.35, states:

4 "(a) A licensed station shall purchase certificates of compliance and noncompliance from  
5 the bureau or an authorized agent of the bureau only, and under the following terms and  
6 conditions:

7 "(1) A certificate of compliance or noncompliance shall be purchased by a licensed station  
8 for a fee determined pursuant to section 3340.35.1 of these regulations; and

9 "(2) Full payment is required at the time the certificates are ordered.

10 "(b) A licensed station shall not sell or otherwise transfer unused certificates to another  
11 licensed station, to a new owner of the business, or to any person other than a customer whose  
12 vehicle has been inspected in accordance with the procedures specified in section 3340.42 of this  
13 article.

14 "(c) A licensed station shall issue a certificate of compliance or noncompliance to the  
15 owner or operator of any vehicle that has been inspected in accordance with the procedures  
16 specified in section 3340.42 of this article and has all the required emission control equipment  
17 and devices installed and functioning correctly. The following conditions shall apply:

18 "(1) Customers shall be charged the same price for certificates as that paid by the licensed  
19 station; and

20 "(2) Sales tax shall not be assessed on the price of certificates.

21 "(d) No person shall sell, issue, cause or permit to be issued any certificate purported to be  
22 a valid certificate of compliance or noncompliance unless duly licensed to do so.

23 "(e) A repair cost waiver or an economic hardship extension shall be the same fee as a  
24 certificate of compliance or noncompliance."

25 18. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.41, states:

26 "(a) A licensed station shall give a copy of the test report printed from the emissions  
27 inspection system to the customer. The report shall be attached to the customer's invoice.

1       "(b) No person shall enter into the emissions inspection system any access or qualification  
2 number other than as authorized by the bureau, nor in any way tamper with the emissions  
3 inspection system.

4       "(c) No person shall enter into the emissions inspection system any vehicle identification  
5 information or emission control system identification data for any vehicle other than the one being  
6 tested. Nor shall any person knowingly enter into the emissions inspection system any false  
7 information about the vehicle being tested.

8       "(d) The specifications and procedures required by Section 44016 of the Health and Safety  
9 Code shall be the vehicle manufacturer's recommended procedures for emission problem  
10 diagnosis and repair or the emission diagnosis and repair procedures found in industry-standard  
11 reference manuals and periodicals published by nationally recognized repair information  
12 providers. Smog check stations and smog check technicians shall, at a minimum, follow the  
13 applicable specifications and procedures when diagnosing defects or performing repairs for  
14 vehicles that fail a smog check test.

15       "(e) A smog check station shall not perform an initial test, except for an official pre-test, on  
16 or issue a certificate of compliance to any vehicle that has been directed to a test-only station for  
17 its biennial smog check pursuant to Sections 44010.5 or 44014.7 of the Health and Safety Code,  
18 unless the station is licensed as a test-only station pursuant to subdivision (b) of Section 44014 of  
19 the Health and Safety Code. The reinspection and certification of a test-only directed vehicle that  
20 has failed an initial test at a test-only station and has undergone subsequent repairs to correct the  
21 cause of the failure, may be performed by a test-only station, or by a test-and- repair station that  
22 performs those repairs and that is also certified as a Gold Shield station pursuant to Section  
23 44014.2 of the Health and Safety Code and Article 10 (commencing with section 3392.1) of this  
24 chapter.

25       19. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42, states:

26       "Smog check inspection methods are prescribed in the Smog Check Manual, referenced by  
27 section 3340.45.



1       “(a) All vehicles subject to a smog check inspection, shall receive one of the following test  
2 methods:

3       “(1) A loaded-mode test shall be the test method used to inspect 1976 - 1999 model-year  
4 vehicle, except diesel-powered, registered in the enhanced program areas of the state. The  
5 loaded-mode test shall measure hydrocarbon, carbon monoxide, carbon dioxide and oxides of  
6 nitrogen emissions, as contained in the bureau's specifications referenced in subsection (a) of  
7 Section 3340.17 of this article. The loaded-mode test shall use Acceleration Simulation Mode  
8 (ASM) test equipment, including a chassis dynamometer, certified by the bureau.

9       “On and after March 31, 2010, exhaust emissions from a vehicle subject to this inspection  
10 shall be measured and compared to the emissions standards shown in the Vehicle Look-up Table  
11 (VLT) Row Specific Emissions Standards (Cutpoints) Table, dated March 2010, which is hereby  
12 incorporated by reference. If the emissions standards for a specific vehicle are not included in this  
13 table then the exhaust emissions shall be compared to the emissions standards set forth in TABLE  
14 I or TABLE II, as applicable. A vehicle passes the loaded-mode test if all of its measured  
15 emissions are less than or equal to the applicable emission standards specified in the applicable  
16 table.

17       “(2) A two-speed idle mode test shall be the test method used to inspect 1976 - 1999 model-  
18 year vehicles, except diesel-powered, registered in all program areas of the state, except in those  
19 areas of the state where the enhanced program has been implemented. The two-speed idle mode  
20 test shall measure hydrocarbon, carbon monoxide and carbon dioxide emissions at high RPM and  
21 again at idle RPM, as contained in the bureau's specifications referenced in subsection (a) of  
22 Section 3340.17 of this article. Exhaust emissions from a vehicle subject to this inspection shall  
23 be measured and compared to the emission standards set forth in this section and as shown in  
24 TABLE III. A vehicle passes the two-speed idle mode test if all of its measured emissions are  
25 less than or equal to the applicable emissions standards specified in Table III.

26       “(3) An OBD-focused test, shall be the test method used to inspect gasoline-powered  
27 vehicles 2000 model-year and newer, and diesel-powered vehicles 1998 model-year and newer.  
28 The OBD test failure criteria are specified in section 3340.42.2.

1       “(b) In addition to subsection (a), all vehicles subject to the smog check program shall  
2 receive the following:

3       “(1) A visual inspection of emission control components and systems to verify the vehicle's  
4 emission control systems are properly installed.

5       “(2) A functional inspection of emission control systems as specified in the Smog Check  
6 Manual, referenced by section 3340.45, which may include an OBD test, to verify their proper  
7 operation.

8       “(c) The bureau may require any combination of the inspection methods in sections (a) and  
9 (b) under any of the following circumstances:

10       “(1) Vehicles that the department randomly selects pursuant to Health and Safety Code  
11 section 44014.7 as a means of identifying potential operational problems with vehicle OBD  
12 systems.

13       “(2) Vehicles identified by the bureau as being operationally or physically incompatible  
14 with inspection equipment.

15       “(3) Vehicles with OBD systems that have demonstrated operational problems.

16       “(d) Pursuant to section 39032.5 of the Health and Safety Code, gross polluter standards are  
17 as follows:

18       “(1) A gross polluter means a vehicle with excess hydrocarbon, carbon monoxide, or oxides  
19 of nitrogen emissions pursuant to the gross polluter emissions standards included in the tables  
20 described in subsection (a), as applicable.

21       “(2) Vehicles with emission levels exceeding the emission standards for gross polluters  
22 during an initial inspection will be considered gross polluters and the provisions pertaining to  
23 gross polluting vehicles will apply, including, but not limited to, sections 44014.5, 44015, and  
24 44081 of the Health and Safety Code.

25       “(3) A gross polluting vehicle shall not be passed or issued a certificate of compliance until  
26 the vehicle's emissions are reduced to or below the applicable emissions standards for the vehicle  
27 included in the tables described in subsection (a), as applicable. However, the provisions  
28 described in section 44017 of the Health and Safety Code may apply.

1       “(4) This subsection applies in all program areas statewide to vehicles requiring inspection  
2 pursuant to sections 44005 and 44011 of the Health and Safety Code.”

3       20. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3371, states:

4       “No dealer shall publish, utter, or make or cause to be published, uttered, or made any false  
5 or misleading statement or advertisement which is known to be false or misleading, or which by  
6 the exercise of reasonable care should be known to be false or misleading. Advertisements and  
7 advertising signs shall clearly show the following:

8       “(a) Firm Name and Address. The dealer's firm name and address as they appear on the  
9 State registration certificate as an automotive repair dealer; and

10       “(b) Telephone Number. If a telephone number appears in an advertisement or on an  
11 advertising sign, this number shall be the same number as that listed for the dealer's firm name  
12 and address in the telephone directory, or in the telephone company records if such number is  
13 assigned to the dealer subsequent to the publication of such telephone directory.”

14       21. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3373, states:

15       “No automotive repair dealer or individual in charge shall, in filling out an estimate,  
16 invoice, or work order, or record required to be maintained by section 3340.15(f) of this chapter,  
17 withhold therefrom or insert therein any statement or information which will cause any such  
18 document to be false or misleading, or where the tendency or effect thereby would be to mislead  
19 or deceive customers, prospective customers, or the public.”

#### 20                                   COST RECOVERY

21       22. Section 125.3 of the Code provides, in relevant part, that the Board may request the  
22 administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed a violation or violations of  
23 the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and  
24 enforcement of the case, with failure of the licentiate to comply subjecting the license to not being  
25 renewed or reinstated. If a case settles, recovery of investigation and enforcement costs may be  
26 included in a stipulated settlement.

27       ///

28       ///

## FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

23. In 2017, Bureau representative Fidel Reyes (Reyes) reviewed the OIS Data for vehicles inspected by Respondent Tran using the BAR-OIS at MS Auto Repair between February 22, 2017, and March 8, 2017. During Reyes's investigation, he accessed the Vehicle Information Database (VID), and performed a focused review of BAR-OIS test data for MS Auto Repair. BAR-OIS test data is the OBD information transmitted during a smog inspection from the computer of the vehicle being inspected to the BAR-OIS. Beginning March 9, 2015, California's Smog Check Program was updated and now requires smog inspectors and stations to use the BAR-OIS computer system during smog inspections, for most model year 2000 and newer gasoline and hybrid vehicles, and most 1998 and newer diesel vehicles. The BAR-OIS consists of a BAR-certified Data Acquisition Device (DAD), computer, bar code scanner, and printer. The DAD serves as an on-board diagnostic (OBD) scan tool. The DAD is an interface box that connects the computer containing the BAR-OIS software to the diagnostic link connector (DLC) of the vehicle being inspected. When requested by the BAR-OIS software, the DAD retrieves data from the vehicle's on-board computer system (OBD II).

24. The information obtained by the BAR-OIS software during a smog inspection is organized in a detailed inspection report for each vehicle inspected and is known as a BAR-OIS Test Detail. The BAR-OIS Test Detail contains information segregated into eight different blocks titled as follows: Station, Vehicle, Test Status, Visual Details, Functional Details, OBDII Details, OBDII Readiness Monitor Status, and OBDII DTC Details. For the purposes of Reyes's investigation of Respondent MS Auto, he focused on information in the "Vehicle" and "OBDII Details" blocks because they contain a unique combination of information for the vehicle being inspected and "like vehicles" inspected. Like vehicles are vehicles of the same manufacturer, model, and model year that were inspected on the BAR-OIS. The unique combination of information analyzed by Reyes includes the eVIN, PID count, and protocol. Reyes compared the eVIN, communication protocol, and PID count for a vehicle that was certified to like vehicles.

25. Reyes identified twelve vehicles certified by Respondents MS Auto and Tran between approximately February 22, 2017, and March 8, 2017, that failed to transmit the expected

1 eVIN, protocol, and PID count. The data transmitted during Respondent Tran's inspections either  
2 differed from the OIS data the vehicles transmitted during other inspections, or the data was  
3 inconsistent with the OIS data transmitted by "like vehicles" inspected, or both.

4 26. The OIS Data transmitted by the vehicles during the other inspections was  
5 consistent with the OIS Data transmitted by like vehicles inspected. The OIS Data transmitted by  
6 the twelve vehicles identified by Reyes was not consistent with OIS Data for like vehicles  
7 inspected.

8 27. Reyes's review of The BAR-OIS data for the vehicles certified by Respondents  
9 MS Auto and Tran during the above time period revealed a pattern of fraudulent smog inspections  
10 that resulted in the issuance of fraudulent certificates of compliance. There were at least twelve  
11 instances in which Respondent Tran certified vehicles that were not connected to the DAD during  
12 the smog inspection. Therefore, Respondent Tran clean-plugged twelve vehicles, resulting in  
13 Respondent MS Auto issuing twelve fraudulent Certificates of Compliance between  
14 approximately February 22, 2017, and March 8, 2017. The details of each instance of clean-  
15 plugging is as follows:

16 28. **Clean Plug Number 1:**

17 a. Reyes's review of the OIS test OBD Inspection List for MS Auto Repair indicated  
18 that on February 22, 2017, Respondent Tran inspected a 2009 Ford F350 Super Duty Truck, VIN  
19 1FTWW31R09EA80276, and Respondent MS Auto issued Smog Certificate of Compliance No.  
20 ZP889405C. The OIS Test Data shows that during Tran's inspection, an eVIN was not  
21 transmitted, the communication protocol was listed as I914, and the PID count was 19.  
22 Comparative OIS Test Data for approximately 228 like 2009 Ford F350 Super Duty trucks show  
23 that 98.7% of the time they transmit their eVIN, they transmit a communication protocol of  
24 ICAN11bt5, and they transmit a PID count of 29 or 29/15<sup>1</sup>.

25  
26  
27 <sup>1</sup> Some vehicles will report two or more PID counts. In those instances, multiple  
28 electronic control units are reporting their respective PID counts. In most cases the first number  
reported is the PID count from the vehicle's OBD II Electronic Control Unit.

1           b.       Furthermore, on February 10, 2017, the same 2009 Ford F350 Super Duty truck,  
2 VIN 1FTWW31R09EA80276, failed a BAR-OIS inspection at another station. During that  
3 inspection, the correct eVIN was reported, the communication protocol was through the designed  
4 protocol of ICAN11bt5, and the expected PID count of 29/15 was transmitted.

5           **29.     Clean Plug Number 2:**

6           a.       Reyes's review of the OIS test OBD Inspection List for MS Auto Repair indicated  
7 that on February 22, 2017, Respondent Tran inspected a 2006 Ford F150 Super Crew truck, VIN  
8 1FTRW12W56KD37676, and Respondent MS Auto issued Smog Certificate of Compliance No.  
9 ZP889410C. The OIS Test Data shows that during Tran's inspection, an eVIN was not  
10 transmitted, the communication protocol was listed as I914, and the PID count was 19.  
11 Comparative OIS Test Data for approximately 1,000 like 2006 Ford F150 Super Crew trucks  
12 show that 98.8% of the time they transmit their eVIN, they transmit a communication protocol of  
13 ICAN11bt5, and they transmit a PID count of 47.

14          b.       Furthermore, on April 22, 2015, the same 2006 Ford F150 Super Crew truck, VIN  
15 1FTRW12W56KD37676, passed a BAR-OIS Smog Check inspection at another facility. During  
16 that inspection, the correct eVIN was reported, the communication was through the expected  
17 protocol of ICAN11bt5, and the expected PID count of 47 was transmitted.

18           **30.     Clean Plug Number 3:**

19          a.       Reyes's review of the OIS test OBD Inspection List for MS Auto Repair indicated  
20 that on February 23, 2017, Respondent Tran inspected a 2006 GMC Sierra K2500 Heavy Duty  
21 truck, VIN 1GTHK23D46F151940, and Respondent MS Auto issued Smog Certificate of  
22 Compliance No. ZP889429C. The OIS Test Data shows that during Tran's inspection, an eVIN  
23 was not transmitted, the communication protocol was listed as I914, and the PID count was 19.  
24 Comparative OIS Test Data for approximately 962 like 2006 GMC Sierra K2500 Heavy Duty  
25 trucks show that 99% of the time they transmit the correct eVIN, they transmit a communication  
26 protocol of ICAN11bt5, and they transmit a PID count of 26/9/3 or 28/9/3.

27          b.       Furthermore, on April 23, 2015, the same 2006 GMC Sierra K2500 Heavy Duty  
28 truck, VIN 1GTHK23D46F151940, passed a BAR-OIS inspection at another station. During that

1 inspection; the correct eVIN number of 1GTHK23D46F151940 was reported, the communication  
2 was through the expected protocol of ICAN11bt5, and the expected PID count of 26/9/3 was  
3 transmitted.

4 31. **Clean Plug Number 4:**

5 a. Reyes's review of the OIS test OBD Inspection List for MS Auto Repair indicated  
6 that on February 24 2017, Respondent Tran inspected a 2004 Ford F150 truck, VIN  
7 1FTPX14594NB87219, and Respondent MS Auto issued Smog Certificate of Compliance No.  
8 ZP889439C. The OIS Test Data shows that during Tran's inspection, an eVIN was not reported,  
9 the communication protocol was listed as I914, and the PID count was 19. Comparative OIS Test  
10 Data for approximately 1000 like 2004 Ford F150 trucks show that 98.8% of the time they  
11 transmit the correct eVIN, they transmit a communication protocol of ICAN11bt5, and they  
12 transmit a PID count of 27.

13 b. Furthermore, on February 7, 2017, the same 2004 Ford F150 truck, VIN  
14 1FTPX14594NB87219, failed a BAR-OIS inspection at another station. During that inspection,  
15 the correct eVIN was reported, the communication was through the expected protocol of  
16 ICAN11bt5, and the expected PID count of 27 was transmitted.

17 32. **Clean Plug Number 5:**

18 a. Reyes's review of the OIS test OBD Inspection List for MS Auto Repair indicated  
19 that on February 24, 2017, Respondent Tran inspected a 2008 Chevrolet Tahoe C1500, VIN  
20 1GNFC13098J207924, and Respondent MS Auto issued smog certificate of compliance No.  
21 ZP889447C. The OIS Test Data shows that during Tran's inspection, an eVIN was not reported,  
22 the communication protocol was listed as I914, and the PID count was 19. Comparative OIS Test  
23 Data for approximately 1000 like 2008 Chevrolet Tahoe C1500 show that 99.6 % of the time they  
24 transmit the correct eVIN, they transmit a communication protocol of ICAN11bt5, and they  
25 transmit a PID count of 44/7/8.

26 b. Furthermore, on February 29, 2016, the same 2008 Chevrolet Tahoe C1500, VIN  
27 1GNFC13098J207924, passed a BAR-OIS at another facility. During that inspection, the correct  
28

1 eVIN was reported, the communication was through the expected protocol of ICAN11bt5, and the  
2 expected PID count of 44/7/8 was reported.

3 **33. Clean Plug Number 6:**

4 a. Reyes's review of the OIS test OBD Inspection List for MS Auto Repair indicated  
5 that on February 24, 2017, Respondent Tran inspected a 2008 Mercedes Benz CLK 350, VIN  
6 WDBTJ56H88F239470, and Respondent MS Auto issued Smog Certificate of Compliance No  
7 ZP889450C. The OIS Test Data shows that during Tran's inspection, an eVIN was not reported,  
8 the communication protocol was listed as I914, and the PID count was 19. Comparative OIS Test  
9 Data for approximately 967 like 2008 Mercedes Benz CLK 350, show that 99.8% of the time they  
10 transmit the correct eVIN, they transmit a communication protocol of ICAN11bt5, and they  
11 transmit a PID count of 44 or 44/12.

12 b. Furthermore, on January 2, 2017, the same 2008 Mercedes Benz CLK 350, VIN  
13 WDBTJ56H88F239470, failed a BAR-OIS inspection at another facility. During that inspection,  
14 the correct eVIN was reported, the communication was through the expected protocol of  
15 ICAN11bt5, and the expected PID count of 44/12 was reported.

16 **34. Clean Plug Number 7:**

17 a. Reyes's review of the OIS test OBD Inspection List for MS Auto Repair indicated  
18 that on February 28, 2017, Respondent Tran inspected a 2008 Honda Fit, VIN  
19 JHMGD38438S050921 and Respondent MS Auto issued Smog Certificate of Compliance No.  
20 QI024866C. The OIS Test Data shows that during Tran's inspection, an eVIN was not reported,  
21 the communication protocol was listed as I914, and the PID count was 19. Comparative OIS Test  
22 Data for approximately 1000 like 2008 Honda Fit cars show that 99.1% of the time they transmit  
23 the correct eVIN, they transmit a communication protocol of ICAN29bt5, and they transmit a PID  
24 count of 38.

25 b. Furthermore, on February 22, 2017, the same 2008 Honda Fit, VIN  
26 JHMGD38438S050921, failed a BAR-OIS inspection at another facility. During that inspection,  
27 the correct eVIN was reported, the communication was through the expected protocol of  
28 ICAN29bt5, and the expected PID count of 38 was reported.



1           35.     **Clean Plug Number 8:**

2           a.     Reyes's review of the OIS test OBD Inspection List for MS Auto Repair indicated  
3     that on March 2, 2017, Respondent Tran inspected a 2005 Chevrolet Tahoe C1500, VIN  
4     1GNEC13V65R238259, and Respondent MS Auto issued Smog Certificate of Compliance No.  
5     QI110222C. The OIS Test Data shows that during Tran's inspection, an eVIN was not reported,  
6     the communication protocol was listed as I914, and the PID count was 19. Comparative OIS Test  
7     Data for approximately 1000 like 2005 Chevrolet Tahoe C1500 trucks, show that 97.7% of the  
8     time they transmit the correct eVIN, they transmit a communication protocol of JVPW, and they  
9     transmit a PID count of 22.

10          b.     Furthermore, on August 31, 2016, the same 2005 Chevrolet Tahoe C1500, VIN  
11     1GNEC13V65R238259, failed a BAR-OIS inspection at another facility. During that inspection,  
12     the correct eVIN was reported, the communication was through the expected protocol of JVPW,  
13     and the expected PID count of 22 was reported.

14           36.     **Clean Plug Number 9:**

15          a.     Reyes's review of the OIS test OBD Inspection List for MS Auto Repair indicated  
16     that on March 7, 2017, Respondent Tran inspected a 2001 Chevrolet Suburban K1500, VIN  
17     3GNFK16T51G194301, and Respondent MS Auto issued Smog Certificate of Compliance No.  
18     ZR153108C. The OIS Test Data shows that during Tran's inspection, an eVIN was not reported,  
19     the communication protocol was listed as I914, and the PID count was 19. Comparative OIS Test  
20     Data for approximately 1000 like 2001 Chevrolet Suburban K1500 vehicles, show that 97.1% of  
21     the time they report the correct the eVIN, they transmit a communication protocol of JVPW, and  
22     they transmit a PID count of 22.

23          b.     Furthermore, on December 13, 2016, the same 2001 Chevrolet Suburban K1500,  
24     VIN 3GNFK16T51G194301, failed a BAR-OIS inspection at another facility. During that  
25     inspection, the correct eVIN was reported, the communication was through the expected protocol  
26     of JVPW, and the expected PID count of 22 was reported.

27     ///

28     ///

1           **37. Clean Plug Number 10:**

2           a.       Reyes's review of the OIS test OBD Inspection List for MS Auto Repair indicated  
3       that on March 7, 2017, Respondent Tran inspected a 2005 Ford Mustang GT, VIN  
4       1ZVFT82H755129198, and Respondent MS Auto issued Smog Certificate of Compliance No.  
5       ZR153113C. The OIS Test Data shows that during Tran's inspection, an eVIN was not reported,  
6       the communication protocol was listed as I914, and the PID count was 19. Comparative OIS Test  
7       Data for approximately 1000 like 2005 Ford Mustang GT, show that 95.2% of the time they  
8       report the correct the eVIN, they transmit a communication protocol of ICAN11bt5, and they  
9       transmit a PID count of 42 or 44.

10          b.       Furthermore, on December 30, 2015, the same 2005 Ford Mustang GT, VIN  
11       1ZVFT82H755129198, passed a BAR-OIS inspection at another facility. During that inspection,  
12       the correct eVIN was reported, the communication was through the expected protocol of  
13       ICAN11bt5, and the expected PID count of 44 was reported.

14           **38. Clean Plug Number 11:**

15          a.       Reyes's review of the OIS test OBD Inspection List for MS Auto Repair indicated  
16       that on March 7, 2017, Respondent Tran inspected a 2008 Mazda CX-9, VIN  
17       JM3TB38V580139200, and Respondent MS Auto issued Smog Certificate of Compliance No.  
18       ZR153121C. The OIS Test Data shows that during Tran's inspection, an eVIN was not reported,  
19       the communication protocol was listed as I914, and the PID count was 19. Comparative OIS Test  
20       Data for approximately 735 like 2008 Mazda CX-9, show that 99.9% of the time they report the  
21       correct the eVIN, they transmit a communication protocol of ICAN11bt5, and they transmit a PID  
22       count of 43/15.

23          b.       Furthermore, on December 27, 2016, the same 2008 Mazda CX-9, VIN  
24       JM3TB38V580139200, failed a BAR-OIS inspection at another facility. During that inspection,  
25       the correct eVIN was reported, the communication was through the expected protocol of  
26       ICAN11bt5, and the expected PID count of 43/15 was reported.

27       ///

28       ///

39. **Clean Plug Number 12:**

a. Reyes's review of the OIS test OBD Inspection List for MS Auto Repair indicated that on March 8, 2017, Respondent Tran inspected a 2008 Chevrolet Silverado C1500, VIN 3GCEC13C38G230972, and Respondent MS Auto issued Smog Certificate of Compliance No. ZR153134C. The OIS Test Data shows that during Tran's inspection, an eVIN was not reported, the communication protocol was listed as I914, and the PID count was 19. Comparative OIS Test Data for approximately 1,000 like 2008 Chevrolet Silverado C1500 trucks, show that 98.9% of the time they report the correct the eVIN, they transmit a communication protocol of ICAN11bt5, and they transmit a PID count of 44/7/8.

b. Furthermore, on March 7, 2017, the same 2008 Chevrolet Silverado C1500, VIN 3GCEC13C38G230972, failed a BAR-OIS inspection at another facility. During that inspection, the correct eVIN was reported, the communication was through the expected protocol of ICAN11bt5, and the expected PID count of 44/7/8 was reported.

40. The relevant OIS Test Data analyzed by Reyes is summarized in Table I, below:

**TABLE 1**

Clean Plug	Cert. #	eVIN	Protocol	PID Count
1	ZP889405C			
	Passing Inspection 2/22/2017	None	I914	19
	2/10/2017-Failed Inspection	1FTWW31 R09EA80276	ICAN11bt5	29/15
	Expected Value	eVIN Reported	ICAN11bt5	29 or 29/15
Clean Plug	Cert. #	eVIN	Protocol	PID Count
2	ZP889410C			
	Passing Inspection 2/22/2017	None	I914	19
	4/22/2015-Passing Inspection	1FTRW12W56KD37676	ICAN11bt5	47
	Expected Value	eVIN Reported	ICAN11bt5	47
Clean Plug	Cert. #	eVIN	Protocol	PID Count
3	ZP889429C			
	Passing Inspection 2/23/2017	None	I914	19
	4/23/2015-Passing Inspection	1GTHK23D46F151940	ICAN11bt5	26/9/3
	Expected Value	eVIN Reported	ICAN11bt5	26/9/3 or 28/9/3

1	Clean Plug 4	Cert. # ZP889439C	eVIN	Protocol	PID Count
2		Passing Inspection 2/24/2017	None	I914	19
3		2/7/2017-Failed Inspection	1F1PX14594NB87219	ICAN11bt5	27
4		Expected Value	eVIN Reported	ICAN11bt5	27
5	Clean Plug 5	Cert. #ZP889447C	eVIN	Protocol	PID Count
6		Passing Inspection 2/24/2017	None	I914	19
7		2/29/2016-Passing Inspection	1GNFC13098J207924	ICAN11bt5	44/7/8
8		Expected Value	eVIN Reported	ICAN11bt5	44/7/8
9	Clean Plug 6	Cert. # ZP889450C	eVIN	Protocol	PID Count
10		Passing Inspection 2/24/17	None	I914	19
11		1/2/2017-Failed Inspection	WDBTJ56H88F239470	ICAN11bt5	44/12
12		Expected Value	eVIN reported	ICAN11bt5	44 or 44/12
13	Clean Plug 7	Cert. # QI024866C	eVIN	Protocol	PID Count
14		Passing Inspection 2/28/2017	None	I914	19
15		2/22/2017-Failed Inspection	JHMGD38438S050921	ICAN29bt5	38
16		Expected Value	eVIN Reported	ICAN29bt5	38
17	Clean Plug 8	Cert. # QI110222C	eVIN	Protocol	PID Count
18		Passing Inspection 3/2/2017	None	I914	19
19		8/31/2016-Failed Inspection	1GNEC13V65R238259	JVPW	22
20		Expected Value	eVIN Reported	JVPW	22
21	Clean Plug 9	Cert. # ZR153108C	eVIN	Protocol	PID Count
22		Passing Inspection 3/7/2017	None	I914	19
23		12/13/2016-Failed Inspection	3GNFK16T51G194301	JVPW	22
24		Expected Value	eVIN Reported	I914	22
25	Clean Plug 10	Cert. # ZR153113C	eVIN	Protocol	PID Count
26		Passing Inspection 3/7/2017	None	I914	19
27		12/30/2015-Passed Inspection	1ZVFT82H755129198	ICAN11bt5	44
28					

	Expected Value	eVIN Reported	ICAN11bt5	42 or 44
<b>Clean Plug 11</b>	Cert. # ZR153121C	eVIN	Protocol	PID Count
	Passing Inspection 3/7/2017	None	I914	19
	12/27/2016-Failed Inspection	JM3TB38V580139200	ICAN11bt5	43/15
	Expected Value	eVIN Reported	ICAN11bt5	43/15
<b>Clean Plug 12</b>	Cert. # ZR153134C	eVIN	Protocol	PID Count
	Passing Inspection 3/8/2017	None	I914	19
	3/7/2017-Failed Inspection	3GCEC13C38G230972	ICAN11bt5	44/7/8
	Expected Value	eVIN Reported	ICAN11bt5	44/7/8

**Respondent MS Auto:**

**FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

(Bus. & Prof Code, § 9884.7, subd. (a)(1))

(Making or Authorizing Untrue or Misleading Statements)

41. Respondent MS Auto has subjected its Automotive Repair Dealer Registration to disciplinary action in that Respondent MS Auto made untrue or misleading statements when it issued twelve fraudulent certificates of compliance and failed to comply with the Automotive Repair Act as set forth in paragraphs 23 through 40.

**SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

(Bus. & Prof. Code, § 9884.7, subd. (a)(4))

(Fraud)

42. Respondent MS Auto has subjected its Automotive Repair Dealer Registration to disciplinary action in that Respondent MS Auto engaged in fraud when it issued twelve fraudulent certificates of compliance as set forth in paragraphs 23 through 40. (Bus. & Prof. Code, section 9884.7, subd, (a)(4).)

**THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

(Bus. & Prof Code, § 9884.7, subd. (a)(6); Health & Saf. Code, § 44072.2, subds. (a) & (c))  
(Failure to Comply with the Automotive Repair Act)

43. Respondent MS Auto has subjected its Automotive Repair Dealer Registration and Smog Station License to disciplinary action in that it failed to comply with the Automotive Repair

1 Act, sections of the Code, and applicable regulations as set forth in paragraphs 23 through 40.  
2 (Bus. & Prof Code, § 9884.7, subd. (a)(6); Health & Saf. Code, § 44072.2.) The violations are as  
3 follows:

4 a. **Health & Safety Code, § 44012, subd. (f):** Respondent MS Auto failed to follow  
5 test procedures in accordance with the Onboard Inspection System ("OIS") specifications when it  
6 failed to properly conduct the functional portion of the smog inspection by failing to connect  
7 twelve vehicles to the BAR-OIS when they were being certified.

8 b. **Health & Safety Code, § 44015, subd. (b):** Respondent MS Auto certified  
9 prohibited vehicles when it issued certificates to twelve vehicles that were not connected to the  
10 BAR-OIS when they were being certified.

11 c. **Health & Safety Code, § 44059, subd. (b):** Respondent MS Auto committed  
12 perjury when it failed to properly conduct the functional portion of the smog inspection by failing  
13 to connect twelve vehicles to the BAR-OIS when they were being certified.

14 d. **Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, § 3340.35, subd. (c):** Respondent MS Auto issued  
15 certificates of compliance to twelve vehicles that were not properly inspected in accordance with  
16 California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42.

17 e. **Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, § 3340.42, subd. (b)(2):** Respondent MS Auto failed to  
18 conduct the functional inspection on twelve vehicles in accordance with the smog check manual  
19 referenced in California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.45.

20 f. **Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, § 3373:** Respondent MS Auto issued false or misleading  
21 records when it issued twelve fraudulent certificates of compliance.

22 **FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**  
23 **(Dishonesty, Fraud, or Deceit)**  
24 **(Health & Saf. Code, § 44072.2, subd. (d))**

25 44. Respondent MS Auto has subjected its Smog Station License to discipline in that it  
26 committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud or deceit, whereby another was injured, by issuing  
27 twelve fraudulent certificates of compliance as set forth in paragraphs 23 through 40, above.  
(Health & Saf. Code, § 44072.2, subd. (d).)

28 ///

**Respondent Tran:**

**FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**  
**(Violation of Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)**  
**(Health & Saf. Code, § 44072.2, subds. (a) & (c))**

45. Respondent Tran has subjected his Smog Check Inspector License to discipline in that he failed to comply with the Automotive Repair Act, sections of the Code, and applicable regulations as set forth in paragraphs 23 through 40. (subd. (a)(6); Health & Saf. Code, § 44072.2.) The violations are as follows:

a. **Health & Safety Code, § 44012, subd. (f):** Respondent Tran failed to follow test procedures in accordance with the OIS specifications when he failed to properly conduct the functional portion of the smog inspection by failing to connect twelve vehicles to the BAR-OIS when they were being certified.

b. **Health & Safety Code, § 44032:** Respondent Tran failed to follow test procedures in accordance with the OIS specifications when he failed to properly conduct the functional portion of the smog inspection by failing to connect twelve vehicles to the BAR-OIS when they were being certified in accordance with Health and Safety Code, section 44012.

c. **Health & Safety Code, § 44059, subd. (b):** Respondent Tran committed perjury when he failed to properly conduct the functional portion of the smog inspection by failing to connect twelve vehicles to the BAR-OIS when they were being certified.

d. **Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, § 3340.30, subd. (a):** Respondent Tran failed to inspect or test vehicles in accordance with Health and Safety Code sections 3340.42, 44012, and 44035 when he failed to properly conduct the functional portion of the smog inspection by failing to connect twelve vehicles to the BAR-OIS when they were being certified.

e. **Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, § 3340.41, subd. (c):** Respondent Tran entered in false information about vehicles being tested when he failed to properly conduct the functional portion of the smog inspection by failing to connect twelve vehicles to the BAR-OIS when they were being certified.

1 f. Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, § 3340.42, subd. (b)(2): Respondent Tran failed to conduct  
2 functional inspections on twelve vehicles in accordance with the smog check manual referenced  
3 in California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.45.

4 g. Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, § 3340.45, subd. (b)(2): Respondent Tran failed to inspect  
5 vehicles in accordance with the Smog Check Manual requirements and procedures when he failed  
6 to properly conduct the functional portion of the smog inspection by failing to connect twelve  
7 vehicles to the BAR-OIS when they were being certified.

8 **SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**  
9 **(Fraud)**  
10 **(Health & Saf. Code, § 44072.2, subd. (d))**

11 46. Respondent Tran has subjected his Smog Check Inspector's license to discipline in  
12 that he committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit, whereby another was injured, when  
13 he caused twelve fraudulent certificates of compliance to be issued as set forth in paragraphs 23  
14 through 40, above. (Health & Saf. Code, § 44072.2, subd. (d).)

15 **OTHER MATTERS**

16 47. Pursuant to Code section 9884.7, subdivision (c), the Director may suspend, revoke,  
17 or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this state by  
18 Respondent MS Auto Repair, upon a finding that Respondent MS Auto Repair has, or is, engaged  
19 in a course of repeated and willful violations of the laws and regulations pertaining to an  
20 automotive repair dealer.

21 48. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if Respondent MS Auto Repair's  
22 Station License is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5  
23 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise  
24 revoked or suspended by the director.

25 49. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if Respondent Tran's Smog Check  
26 Inspector License is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5  
27 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise  
28 revoked or suspended by the director.

///



PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters alleged in this Accusation, and that following the hearing, the Director of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

1. Revoking or suspending Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 223079, issued to Mohammed Sahid, owner of MS Auto Repair;
2. Revoking or suspending any other ARD registration issued to Mohammed Sahid;
3. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Test and Repair Station License Number RC 223079, issued to Mohammed Sahid, owner of MS Auto Repair;
4. Revoking or suspending any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Mohammed Sahid;
5. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Inspector License Number EO 636650, issued to Andy Phong Tran;
6. Revoking or suspending any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Andy Phong Tran;
7. Ordering Mohammed Sahid and Andy Phong Tran to pay the Bureau of Automotive Repair the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of this case, pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 125.3; and
8. Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper.

DATED:

April 23, 2018



PATRICK DORAIS  
Chief  
Bureau of Automotive Repair  
Department of Consumer Affairs  
State of California  
Complainant

OK2017901464  
90862844.doc