1	ROB BONTA			
2	Attorney General of California ERIN M. SUNSERI			
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General GREGORY J. SALUTE			
4	Supervising Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 164015			
5	600 West Broadway, Suite 1800 San Diego, CA 92101			
6	Telephone: (619) 738-9431 Facsimile: (916) 732-7920			
7	E-mail: Gregory.Salute@doj.ca.gov  Attorneys for Complainant			
8	BEFORE THE			
9	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR			
10	STATE OF CALIFORNIA			
11	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. <b>79/24-21809</b>		
12	JAVIER IGNACIO MENDEZ DBA SURF CITY SMOG CHECK			
13	1974 Placentia Ave Unit C Costa Mesa, CA 92627	ACCUSATION		
14	Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No.			
15	ARD 303499 Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License No.			
16	TC 303499,			
17	and			
18 19	RENE TRUJILLO PEREZ 16538 Lake Shore Dr Lake Elsinore, CA 92530			
20	Smog Check Inspector License No. EO			
21	634379, Smog Check Repair Technician (EI) License No. 634379			
22	Respondents.			
23				
24	<u>PARTIES</u>			
25	1. Patrick Dorais (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as			
26	the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair, Department of Consumer Affairs.			
27	2. On or about August 19, 2022, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Automotive			
28	Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 303499 to Javier Ignacio Mendez dba Surf City Smog			
	(JAVIER IGNACIO MENDEZ DBA SURI	F CITY SMOG CHECK and RENE TRUJILLO PEREZ) ACCUSATION		

Check (Respondent Surf City Smog Check). The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on August 31, 2026, unless renewed.

- 3. On or about October 20, 2022, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License Number TC 303499 to Javier Ignacio Mendez dba Surf City Smog Check. The Smog Check, Test-Only, Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on August 31, 2026, unless renewed.
- 4. On or about February 27, 2014, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Smog Check Inspector License Number EO 634379 to Rene Trujillo Perez (Respondent Perez). The Smog Check Inspector License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on February 28, 2026, unless renewed.
- 5. On or about February 27, 2014, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Smog Check Repair Technician License Number (EI) 634379 to Rene Trujillo Perez (Respondent Perez). The Smog Check Repair Technician (EI) License expired on February 28, 2016, and has not been renewed.

### **JURISDICTION**

- 6. This Accusation is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs ("Director") for the Bureau, under the authority of the following laws.
- 7. Section 9884.7 of the Business and Professions Code<sup>1</sup> provides that the Director may revoke an ARD registration.
- 8. Section 9884.13 of the Code provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration of a valid registration shall not deprive the director or chief of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary proceeding against an automotive repair dealer or to render a decision invalidating a registration temporarily or permanently.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> All statutory references herein shall be to the Business and Professions Code unless specifically stated otherwise.

1					
2	13. Section 44072.10 of the Health and Safety Code states, in pertinent part:				
3					
4	(c) The department shall revoke the license of any smog check technician or				
5	station license who fraudulently certifies vehicles or participates in the fraudulent inspection of vehicles. A fraudulent inspection includes, but is not limited to, all of the following:				
6					
7	(1) Clean piping, as defined by the department.				
8	•••				
9	(4) Intentional or willful violation of this chapter or any regulation, standard, or				
10	procedure of the department implementing this chapter.				
11					
12	REGULATORY PROVISIONS				
13	14. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.24, subdivision (c), states:				
14 15	The bureau may suspend or revoke the license of or pursue other legal action against a licensee, if the licensee falsely or fraudulently issues or obtains a certificate of compliance or a certificate of noncompliance.				
16	15. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.30, states:				
17	A smog check technician shall comply with the following requirements at all times while licensed.				
18 19	(a) A licensed technician shall inspect, test and repair vehicles in accordance with section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code, section 44035 of the Health and Safety Code, and section 3340.42 of this article"				
20	16. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.35, states, in pertinent part:				
21	•••				
22	(c) A licensed station shall issue a certificate of compliance or noncompliance				
to the owner or operator of any vehicle that has been inspected in accordance we procedures specified in section 3340.42 of this article and has all the required emission control equipment and devices installed and functioning correctly					
		25	17. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42, sets forth specific emissions		
26	test methods and procedures which apply to all vehicles inspected in the State of California.				
27					
28					
	4				

9

10

6

1415

13

1617

18

19 20

2122

23

2425

26

2728

### COST RECOVERY

18. Section 125.3 of the Code provides, in pertinent part, that the Board may request the administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed a violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case, with failure of the licentiate to comply subjecting the license to not being renewed or reinstated. If a case settles, recovery of investigation and enforcement costs may be included in a stipulated settlement.

### **VID DATA REVIEW**

- 19. Beginning March 9, 2015, California's Smog Check Program was updated to require the use of an On-Board Diagnostic Inspection System ("OIS"). OIS is the Smog Check equipment required in all areas of the State when inspecting most model-year 2000 and newer gasoline and hybrid vehicles and most 1998 and newer diesel vehicles. The system consists of a certified Data Acquisition Device ("DAD"), computer, bar code scanner, and printer. The DAD is an On Board Diagnostic ("OBD") scan tool that, when requested by the California OIS software, retrieves OBD data from the vehicle. All OBD data that the vehicle indicates it supports is requested by the California OIS software and will be retrieved. The DAD connects between the OIS computer and the vehicle's DLC. The California OIS software requires a continuous Internet connection when performing a Smog Check inspection and the OIS software communicates with BAR's central database through the Internet connection. The bar code scanner is used to input technician information, the vehicles identification number ("VIN"), and DMV renewal information. The printer provides a Vehicle Inspection Report ("VIR") containing inspection results for motorists and a Smog Check Certificate of Compliance number for passing vehicles.
- 20. Data retrieved and recorded during an OIS smog check includes; the eVIN, which is the digitally stored VIN programmed into the vehicle's Powertrain Control Module ("PCM"); the communication protocol, which is the manufacturer/vehicle specific language the PCM uses to relay information; and the number of Parameter Identifications ("PIDs"), which is the number of specific data values each PCM uses related to emissions controls.

- 21. During an OIS inspection, engine operating parameters are retrieved from the vehicle's OBD II system and recorded to the VID. This is accomplished during the functional portion of the OIS Smog Check inspection by plugging the DAD into the vehicle's DLC when prompted by the OIS analyzer screen prompt. Some of the parameters recorded are:
  - Engine speed in revolutions per minute (RPM)
  - Throttle position as measured by a throttle position sensor (TPS) mounted onto the throttle shaft. Measured in a percentage of opening from 0% at idle and near or up to 100% at full throttle.
  - Manifold absolute pressure as measured by a manifold air pressure sensor (MAP) connected to an intake manifold source, measured in kilo pascals (kpa). Typical readings for a normally aspirated vehicle as follows: 0 kpa being absolute vacuum, 25kpa to 45kpa at idle, 101 kpa at full throttle, same as atmospheric pressure at sea level.
  - Mass air flow as measured by a mass air flow sensor (MAF) mounted in the engine's air intake tract. Measured in grams per second (gps).<sup>2</sup>
  - Ignition timing is set by the vehicle PCM based on engine speed and load, and is measured in degrees Before Top Dead Center (BTDC).
- 22. During normal engine operation at idle, engine speed is relatively steady around its target idle speed. With the engine idling, the TPS is steady and at or near 0%. The MAP and/or MAF readings are also steady. For the engine speed to increase, the throttle would have to be opened to increase airflow through the engine. The engine's management systems supply fuel and spark timing appropriate to any changes in throttle position and engine speed. An increase in throttle, measured by the TPS, which increases engine RPM, would result in corresponding increases in MAF as well as a change in MAP. Stated another way, any movement in the throttle from the idle position will result in an increase of airflow through the engine with corresponding increases RPM and/or MAF along with changes in MAP.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Not all vehicles include both MAP and MAF parameters. Many vehicles will have either MAP or MAF parameters separately.

- 23. During an OIS Smog Check inspection, along with other visual and functional inspections, there is an OBD II query portion of the inspection. The OBD II query is performed with the engine idling and, when requested by the OIS analyzer, and an elevated or increased engine speed.
- 24. If the vehicle passes the visual, functional and tailpipe tests, it passes the overall inspection, and a Certificate of Compliance is issued and transmitted electronically to the Vehicle Information Database ("VID"). These Certificates of Compliance are purchased in blocks of fifty (50) through the EIS or OIS from the VID, using a pre-arranged electronic bank account debit system or by check, via mail, from Bureau Headquarters in Sacramento. Each Certificate of Compliance has a unique control number so that it can be tracked to determine which Smog Check Station purchased the Certificate of Compliance and to which vehicle it was issued.
- 25. The VID contains registration data from Department of Motor Vehicles ("DMV") plus emission standards, vehicle smog check inspections, smog check stations and technicians, and Certificates of Compliance. The VID receives the passing smog check results immediately following the inspection. During the vehicle registration process, the DMV accesses the VID to verify that the vehicle has been tested and certified. The Bureau can also access the VID to view test data on smog check inspections performed at any Smog Check Station, or search for, retrieve, and print a test record for a particular vehicle which has been tested. The EIS or OIS, depending on the test type, also prints a Vehicle Inspection Report ("VIR"), which is a physical record of the test results and shows the Certificate of Compliance number that was issued if the vehicle passed the smog inspection.
- 26. The smog check technician must sign the VIR under penalty of perjury to indicate that the inspection was done within Bureau guidelines. Smog Check Stations are required by law to maintain a copy of the VIR along with a copy of the repair invoice for three years. The consumer's VIR serves as a receipt and proof that the VID was updated, and a Certificate of Compliance was issued. Licensed Smog Check Technicians are the only persons authorized by the Bureau to perform official inspections. They are issued a personal access code and a license,

which are used to gain access to the EIS and OIS to perform smog check inspections.

Unauthorized use of another technician's access code or license is prohibited.

### **Dynamic Mismatch eVIN**

- 27. Bureau Program Representative Salvador Arreola (Arreola) conducted a detailed review of the VID data for Smog Check inspections performed at Surf City Smog Check. This review showed a pattern of vehicles being certified with eVINs that did not match the VIN for the vehicle being tested. The eVIN transmitted during the dynamic portion or the OBDII functional test was different than the eVIN transmitted during the static portion of the OBDII functional test. This confirms the vehicles receiving smog certificates were not tested during the OBD II Dynamic Test of the Smog Check inspection, which constitutes clean plugging.
- 28. During the functional portion of the OIS Smog Check inspection the OIS analyzer collects Static OBDII data that is transmitted from the vehicle through the DAD, while the engine is at idle. During static data collection, the DAD asks the vehicle what OBD data it supports, then proceeds to collect all that data.
- 29. At the completion of the Static OBDII data collection, the OIS analyzer performs a "Dynamic OBDII Test". During the dynamic test, the DAD repeatedly collects a smaller subset of OBD data. The Dynamic test starts with the engine at idle speed, then the technician is prompted by OIS analyzer to increase the engine speed and hold it steady at that speed. During the Dynamic OBDII Test, the OIS analyzer collects Dynamic OBDII data that is being transmitted from the vehicle through the DAD, while the engine is operating at idle, then an increased speed.
  - 30. In the review, Arreola referenced the following data/information:
- VIN Vehicle Identification Number to which the certificate is issued. The sources of the VIN include from the vehicle's body/chassis and from inspector entry using a DMV renewal document. A VIN entry may be a bar code scan or manually entered.
  - Cert ID Smog Check Certificate number issued.
  - Static eVIN Digitally stored VIN number in the vehicle's computer (PCM), transmitted through the DAD and collected by the OIS during the static portion of the OBDII functional test.

///

• Dynamic eVIN – Digitally stored VIN number in the vehicle PCM, transmitted through the DAD and collected by the OIS during the dynamic portion of the OBDII functional test.

31. Arreola's comprehensive review into the Smog Check activities at Surf City Smog Check confirmed the following fifteen (15) Smog Check Certificates were fraudulently issued to vehicles using the clean plugging method by Respondent Perez while employed by Respondent Surf City Smog on the following dates, November 13, 2024, November 19, 2024, November 20, 2024, November 28, 2024, December 3, 2024, December 4, 2024, December 5, 2024, December 7, 2024, December 12, 2024, and December 14, 2024, as set forth below:

Vehicle	DMV VIN / Static eVIN	Dynamic eVIN	Certificate ID #
2013 Ford Mustang	1ZVBP8CF3D5259302	1ZVHT82H875202977	UG049680C
2016 Toyota Tacoma	5TFSX5EN2GX041351	JTLZE4FEODJ041462	UG049691C
2010 Nissan GT-R	JN1AR5EF6AM230482	JN1AR5EF1HM821006	UG049692C
2020 Ford Transit T- 250	1FTBR1Y86LKA08000	NM0LS7CN5CT110419	UG049693C
2016 Subaru Outback	4S4BSAFC9G3277907	JF2SJABC8FH575588	UG049696C
2021 Kia Sorento	5XYRL4LC3MG009805	3KPF34AD0LE219997	UG049697C
2012 Toyota Corolla	5FYBU4EE2CP068528	JTMBD32V776043328	UG649456C
2016 Chevrolet Corvette	1G1YS2D61G5605528	1GKKRTKD9GJ324931	UG649463C
2016 Chevrolet Cruze	1G1BE5SM5G7267801	1GKKRTKD9GJ324931	UG649464C
2020 Ford Mustang	1FA6P8CF2L5177375	1FA6P8CF4M5102999	UG649468C
2013 Cadillac CTS-V	1G6DV5EP5D0116390	1G6DJ5E31C0139138	UG649472C
2010 Chevrolet Silverado	3GCRCREA0AG269620	1GKKRTKD9GJ324931	UG649476C
2013 Chevrolet Malibu	1G11E5SA6DU135466	KL8CB6SA7HC731821	UG649484C
2008 BMW 335i	WBAVB73508P102074	WBAPH5G57ANM70078	UG649491C
2017 Nissan GT-R	JN1AR5EF1HM820325	1N4BL4CV5LC101283	UG649493C

### **FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE**

## (Untrue or Misleading Statements - Respondent Surf City Smog Shop)

32. Respondent Surf City Smog Shop's registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(1), in that Respondents made or authorized statements which they knew or in the exercise of reasonable care should have known to be untrue or misleading, as follows: Respondents certified that the vehicles set forth above in paragraphs 27-31, had passed inspection and were in compliance with applicable laws and regulations. In fact, Respondents conducted the inspections on those vehicles using the clean plugging method in order to issue smog certificates of compliance, and did not test or inspect the vehicles as required by Health and Safety Code section 44012.

### SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

### (Fraud - Respondent Surf City Smog Shop)

33. Respondent Surf City Smog Shop's registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(4), in that Respondent Surf City Smog Shop's employees committed acts which constitute fraud by issuing electronic certificates of compliance for the vehicles set forth above in paragraphs 27-31, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

### THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Failure to Comply with the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Surf City Smog Shop)

- 34. Respondent Surf City Smog Shop's smog station license is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in conjunction with Health and Safety Code section 44072.10 subdivision (c), in that regarding the vehicles set forth above in paragraphs 27-31, Respondents failed to comply with the following sections of the Health and Safety Code:
- (a) <u>Section 44012</u>: Respondent Surf City Smog Shop's employees failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on the vehicles, in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- (b) <u>Section 44015</u>: Respondent Surf City Smog Shop's employees issued electronic certificates of compliance for the vehicles, without ensuring that the vehicles were properly tested and inspected to determine if they were in compliance with Health and Safety Code section 44012.

### FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program - Respondent Surf City Smog Shop)

35. Respondent Surf City Smog Shop's smog station license is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that regarding the

vehicles set forth above in paragraphs 27-31, Respondents failed to comply with the following provisions of the California Code of Regulations, Title 16, as follows:

- (a) <u>Section 3340.35, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent Surf City Smog Shop's employees issued electronic certificates of compliance even though those vehicles had not been inspected in accordance with section 3340.42, Title 16, of the California Code of Regulations.
- (b) <u>Section 3340.42</u>: Respondent Surf City Smog Shop's employees failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on those vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

### FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

### (Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit - Respondent Surf City Smog Shop)

36. Respondent Surf City Smog Shop's smog station license is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in conjunction with Health and Safety Code section 44072.10 subdivision (c), in that regarding the vehicles set forth above in paragraphs 27-31, Respondents employees committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud or deceit whereby another was injured by issuing electronic certificates of compliance for those vehicles without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

### SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

### (Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Perez)

37. Respondent Perez's Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair

Technician License are subject to discipline pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that regarding the vehicles set forth above in paragraphs 27-31, Respondent Perez failed to comply with section 44032 of the Health and Safety Code in a material respect, as follows: Respondent Perez failed to perform the emission control tests on those vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.

///

///

#### SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Perez)

- 38. Respondent Perez's Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician License are subject to discipline pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that regarding the vehicles set forth above in paragraphs 27-31, Respondent Perez failed to comply with provisions of the California Code of Regulations, title 16, as follows:
- (a) <u>Section 3340.30, subdivision (a)</u>: Respondent Perez failed to inspect and test those vehicles in accordance with Health and Safety Code section 44012.
- (b) <u>Section 3340.41, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent Perez entered false information into the OIS.
- (c) <u>Section 3340.42</u>: Respondent Perez failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on those vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

## EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit - Respondent Perez)

39. Respondent Perez's Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician License are subject to discipline pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in conjunction with Health and Safety Code section 44072.10 subdivision (c), in that regarding the vehicles set forth above in paragraphs 27-31, Respondent Perez committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud or deceit whereby another was injured by issuing electronic certificates of compliance for those vehicles without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

### **OTHER MATTERS**

40. Pursuant to Business & Professions Code section 9884.7, subdivision (c), the Director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this State by Respondent Surf City Smog Shop upon a finding that Respondent Surf City Smog