1		*
1	Kamala D. Harris	
2	Attorney General of California DIANN SOKOLOFF	
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General ASPASIA A. PAPAVASSILIOU	
4	Deputy Attorney General	
	State Bar No. 196360 1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor	
5	P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550	
6	Telephone: (510) 879-0818 Facsimile: (510) 622-2270	
7	E-mail: Aspasia.Papavassiliou@doj.ca.gov Attorneys for Complainant	
8		RE THE
9	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR	
10		CALIFORNIA
11		1
12	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 79 15 - 2746
13	JOSUE MATEOS MONTOYA d.b.a.	*
14	SAN JOSE SMOG CHECK 147 East Santa Clara Street	ACCUSATION
15	San Jose, CA 95113	*
16	Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 270981 and Smog Check Station License No. RC 270981	
17	JOSUE MATEOS MONTOYA	
18 19	2219 Pacina Drive San Jose, CA 95116	
20	Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 631761 and Smog Check Repair Technician	* .
21	License No. EI 631761	8
22	and	
23	DOUGLAS ALLEN NIELSEN 219 Vineyard Drive	
24	San Jose, CA 95119	
25	Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 142249 and Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 142249	
26		
27	Respondents.	
28	Complainant alleges:	
		1
	( JOSUE MATEOS MONTOYA d.b.a. SAN JOSE SMOO	CHECK; DOUGLAS ALLEN NIELSEN) ACCUSATION

## **PARTIES**

1. Patrick Dorais (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair, Department of Consumer Affairs.

Respondent Station

- 2. On or about November 29, 2012, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 270981 to Josue Mateos Montoya doing business as San Jose Smog Check (Respondent Station). The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration expired on November 30, 2015, and has not been renewed.
- 3. On or about September 26, 2013, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Smog Check Station License Number RC 270981 to Respondent Station. The Smog Check Station License expired on November 30, 2015, and has not been renewed.

Respondent Station Owner's Other Licenses

4. On or about February 16, 2010, the Bureau issued Advanced Emission Specialist License No. EA 631761 to the Josue Mateos Montoya who subsequently became licensed as Respondent Station as described in paragraphs 2-3, above. On or about August 14, 2012, the Advanced Emission Specialist was cancelled due to a restructure of the Bureau's licensing program, and Josue Mateos Montoya was issued Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 631761 and Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 631761. The Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician Licenses expired on July 31, 2016, and have not been renewed.

## Respondent Technician

5. In 2003, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Advanced Emission Specialist Technician License Number EA 142249 to Douglas Allen Nielsen (Respondent Technician). On or about January 2, 2014, the Advanced Emission Specialist Technician License was cancelled due to a restructure of the Bureau's licensing program and Respondent was issued new licenses, as described in paragraphs 6-7, below.

- 6. On or about January 2, 2014, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Smog Check Inspector License Number EO 142249 to Respondent Technician. The Smog Check Inspector License was in full force will expire on July 31, 2017, unless renewed.
- 7. On or about January 2, 2014, the Bureau of Automotive Repair issued Smog Check Repair Technician License Number EI 142249 to Respondent Technician. The Smog Check Repair Technician License will expire on July 31, 2017, unless renewed.

#### JURISDICTION

- 8. This Accusation is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs (Director) for the Bureau of Automotive Repair, under the authority of the following laws. All section references are to the Business and Professions Code (Code), unless otherwise specified.
- 9. Section 477 of the Code provides, in pertinent part, that "Board" includes "bureau," "commission," "committee," "department," "division," "examining committee," "program," and "agency." "License" includes certificate, registration or other means to engage in a business or profession regulated by the Code.
- 10. Section 9884.13 of the Code provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration of a valid registration shall not deprive the director or chief of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary proceeding against an automotive repair dealer or to render a decision invalidating a registration temporarily or permanently.
- 11. Section 44002 of the Health and Safety Code provides, in pertinent part, that the Director has all the powers and authority granted under the Automotive Repair Act for enforcing the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.
- 12. Section 44072.6 of the Health and Safety Code provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration or suspension of a license by operation of law, or by order or decision of the Director of Consumer Affairs, or a court of law, or the voluntary surrender of the license shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with disciplinary action.

# STATUTORY PROVISIONS

Business and Professions Code

- 13. Section 9884.7 of the Code states, in pertinent part:
- "(a) The director, where the automotive repair dealer cannot show there was a bona fide error, may deny, suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration of an automotive repair dealer for any of the following acts or omissions related to the conduct of the business of the automotive repair dealer, which are done by the automotive repair dealer or any automotive technician, employee, partner, officer, or member of the automotive repair dealer.
- (1) Making or authorizing in any manner or by any means whatever any statement written or oral which is untrue or misleading, and which is known, or which by the exercise of reasonable care should be known, to be untrue or misleading."

## 14. Section 9884.8 of the Code states:

"All work done by an automotive repair dealer, including all warranty work, shall be recorded on an invoice and shall describe all service work done and parts supplied. Service work and parts shall be listed separately on the invoice, which shall also state separately the subtotal prices for service work and for parts, not including sales tax, and shall state separately the sales tax, if any, applicable to each. If any used, rebuilt, or reconditioned parts are supplied, the invoice shall clearly state that fact. If a part of a component system is composed of new and used, rebuilt or reconditioned parts, that invoice shall clearly state that fact. The invoice shall include a statement indicating whether any crash parts are original equipment manufacturer crash parts or nonoriginal equipment manufacturer aftermarket crash parts. One copy of the invoice shall be given to the customer and one copy shall be retained by the automotive repair dealer."

- 15. Section 9884.9 of the Code states, in pertinent part:
- "(a) The automotive repair dealer shall give to the customer a written estimated price for labor and parts necessary for a specific job. No work shall be done and no charges shall accrue before authorization to proceed is obtained from the customer. No charge shall be made for work done or parts supplied in excess of the estimated price without the oral or written consent of the customer that shall be obtained at some time after it is determined that the estimated price is insufficient and before the work not estimated is done or the parts not estimated are supplied.

Written consent or authorization for an increase in the original estimated price may be provided by electronic mail or facsimile transmission from the customer. The bureau may specify in regulation the procedures to be followed by an automotive repair dealer if an authorization or consent for an increase in the original estimated price is provided by electronic mail or facsimile transmission. If that consent is oral, the dealer shall make a notation on the work order of the date, time, name of person authorizing the additional repairs and telephone number called, if any, together with a specification of the additional parts and labor and the total additional cost, and shall do either of the following:

- "(1) Make a notation on the invoice of the same facts set forth in the notation on the work order.
- "(2) Upon completion of the repairs, obtain the customer's signature or initials to an acknowledgment of notice and consent, if there is an oral consent of the customer to additional repairs, in the following language:

"I acknowledge notice and oral approval of an increase in the original estimated price.

(signature or initials)"

"Nothing in this section shall be construed as requiring an automotive repair dealer to give a written estimated price if the dealer does not agree to perform the requested repair."

16. Section 9884.11 of the Code states that "[e]ach automotive repair dealer shall maintain any records that are required by regulations adopted to carry out this chapter [the Automotive Repair Act]. Those records shall be open for reasonable inspection by the chief or other law enforcement officials. All of those records shall be maintained for at least three years."

Health and Safety Code

- 17. Section 44014 of the Health and Safety Code states, in pertinent part:
- "(a) Except as otherwise provided in this chapter, the testing and repair portion of the program shall be conducted by smog check stations licensed by the department, and by smog check technicians who have qualified pursuant to this chapter."
  - 18. Section 44015 of the Health and Safety Code states, in pertinent part:

- "(a) A licensed smog check station shall not issue a certificate of compliance, except as authorized by this chapter, to any vehicle that meets the following criteria:
  - "(1) A vehicle that has been tampered with."
  - 19. Section 44072.2 of the Health and Safety Code states, in pertinent part:

"The director may suspend, revoke, or take other disciplinary action against a license as provided in this article if the licensee, or any partner, officer, or director thereof, does any of the following:

- "(a) Violates any section of this chapter [the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program (Health and Saf. Code, § 44000, et seq.)] and the regulations adopted pursuant to it, which related to the licensed activities.
  - "(f) Aids or abets unlicensed persons to evade the provisions of this chapter.
- "(g) Fails to make and keep records showing his or her transactions as a licensee, or fails to have those records available for inspection by the director or his or her duly authorized representative for a period of not less than three years after completion of any transaction to which the records refer, or refuses to comply with a written request of the director to make the records available for inspection."
  - 20. Section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code states, in pertinent part:

"The test at the smog check stations shall be performed in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department, pursuant to Section 44013, shall require, at a minimum, loaded mode dynamometer testing in enhanced areas, and two-speed testing in all other program areas, and shall ensure all of the following:

- "(f) A visual or functional check is made of emission control devices specified by the department, including the catalytic converter in those instances in which the department determines it to be necessary to meet the findings of Section 44001. The visual or functional check shall be performed in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department."
  - 21. Section 44014, subdivision (a), of the Health and Safety Code states, in pertinent part:

be the vehicle manufacturer's recommended procedures for emission problem diagnosis and repair

or the emission diagnosis and repair procedures found in industry-standard reference manuals and periodicals published by nationally recognized repair information providers. Smog check stations and smog check technicians shall, at a minimum, follow the applicable specifications and procedures when diagnosing defects or performing repairs for vehicles that fail a smog check test.

- 26. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.41, states, in pertinent part:
- "(c) No person shall enter into the emissions inspection system any vehicle identification information or emission control system identification data for any vehicle other than the one being tested. Nor shall any person knowingly enter into the emissions inspection system any false information about the vehicle being tested."
- 27. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42, states, in pertinent part, that smog check stations and smog check technicians shall conduct tests and inspections in accordance with the bureau's BAR-97 Emissions Inspection System Specifications referenced in subsections (a) and (b) of Section 3340.17.
- 28. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3353, states, in pertinent part:
  "No work for compensation shall be commenced and no charges shall accrue without specific authorization from the customer in accordance with the following requirements:
- (a) Estimate for Parts and Labor. Every dealer shall give to each customer a written estimated price for parts and labor for a specific job."
  - 29. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3356, states, in pertinent part:
- "(a) All invoices for service and repair work performed, and parts supplied, as provided for in Section 9884.8 of the Business and Professions Code, shall comply with the following:
- (1) The invoice shall show the automotive repair dealer's registration number and the corresponding business name and address as shown in the Bureau's records. If the automotive repair dealer's telephone number is shown, it shall comply with the requirements of subsection (b) of Section 3371 of this chapter.
  - (2) The invoice shall separately list, describe and identify all of the following:

The station, however, issued a smog certificate of compliance for the vehicle, and provided the

customer with a Vehicle Inspection Report (VIR) indicating that the vehicle passed smog inspection. The VIR report specifically stated that the vehicle had passed all applicable visual and functional tests, including a test of the Air Injection system.

## Inspection Conducted by Unlicensed Person

33. The entire inspection was conducted by an unlicensed technician, Mario Alberto Mateos-Montoya (Mario Montoya). He had previously been licensed as a technician, but his license was revoked on or about July 18, 2011. In conducting the inspection, Mario Montoya used the access code of Respondent Technician, who provided his smog check security access code to Mario Montoya. As a result, the Vehicle Information Database as well as the VIR document Respondent Technician as having performed the inspection, when in fact the inspection was conducted by the unlicensed Mario Montoya.

#### No Estimate or Invoice

34. The station failed to provide the customer with a written estimate or invoice. The customer did not sign a work order or receive an estimate prior to the inspection. After the inspection, Mario Montoya told the customer that the vehicle had passed smog inspection, and he provided the customer with an invoice form to fill out and sign. The customer complied and gave the form to Mario Montoya, but when the customer asked for a copy of the invoice, Mario Montoya told him he did not need it, and did not provide the customer with a copy.

## Records Not Kept

35. On or about February 25, 2015, Bureau representatives interviewed Respondent Station and requested all records for February 19, 2015, but Respondent Station failed to provide any of the requested records.

## **Automotive Repair Dealer Registration**

# FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE (Untrue Statements) (Bus. & Prof. Code, § 9884.7, subd. (a)(1))

36. Respondent Station has subjected its automotive repair dealer registration to discipline for making untrue or misleading statements (Bus. & Prof. Code, § 9884.7, subd. (a)(1)). The circumstances are described in paragraphs 32-33, above.

1 2	SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE (Failure to Provide Customer with Legible Copy of Invoice) (Bus. & Prof. Code, § 9884.6; Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, § 3356, subd. (a))	
3	37. Respondent Station has subjected its automotive repair dealer registration to discipline	
4	for failing to provide the customer with a legible copy of the invoice (Bus. & Prof. Code, §	
5	9884.6; Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, § 3356, subd. (a)). The circumstances are described in paragrap	
6	34, above.	
1		
8	THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE  (Failure to Provide Customer with Written Estimate)  (Bus. & Prof. Code, § 9884.9, subd. (a); Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, § 3353, subd. (a))	
9	38. Respondent Station has subjected its automotive repair dealer registration to discipline	
10	for failing to provide the customer with a written estimate (Bus. & Prof. Code, § 9884.9, subd. (a	
11	Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, § 3353, subd. (a)). The circumstances are described in paragraph 34,	
12	above.	
13	FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE (Failure to Keep Records)	
14	(Bus. & Prof. Code, § 9884.11; Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, § 3358, subd. (c))	
15	39. Respondent Station has subjected its automotive repair dealer registration to discipline	
16	for failing to keep records as required (Bus. & Prof. Code, § 9884.11; Cal. Code Regs., tit. 16, §	
17	3358, subd. (c)). The circumstances are described in paragraph 35, above.	
18	Smog Check Station License	
19 20	FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE (Violation of Motor Vehicle Inspection Program and Regulations) (Health & Saf. Code, § 44072.2, subd. (a))	
21	40. Respondent Station has subjected its smog check station license to discipline for	
22	violating the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program and its associated regulations (Health & Saf.	
23	Code, § 44072.2, subd. (a)). The factual circumstances are described in paragraphs 31-32, above	
24	The specific violations are listed below.	
25	A. Respondent Station failed to perform the required visual and/or functional checks of	
26	emission control devices ( Health & Saf. Code, § 44012, subd. (f)).	
27	B. Respondent Station conducted smog testing by using an unlicensed technician (Health	
28	& Saf. Code, § 44014, subd. (a)).	

of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program (Health & Saf. Code, § 4407.2.2, subd. (f)). The circumstances are described in paragraph 32, above.

#### OTHER MATTERS

- 44. Pursuant to Code section 9884.7, subd. (c), the Director may invalidate or suspend the registrations for all places of business operated in this state by Josue Mateos Montoya, upon a finding that he has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violation of the laws and regulations pertaining to an automotive repair dealer.
- 45. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Station License No. RC 270981, issued to Josue Mateos Montoya, doing business as San Jose Smog, is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under this chapter in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the director.
- 46. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 142249, issued to Douglas Allen Nielsen, is suspended or revoked, any additional license issued under this chapter in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.
- 47. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 142249, issued to Douglas Allen Nielsen, is suspended or revoked, any additional license issued under this chapter in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.

#### **PRAYER**

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters alleged in this Accusation, and that following the hearing, the Director of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- Invalidating or suspending Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD
   270981, issued to Josue Mateos Montoya doing business as San Jose Smog Check;
- 2. Revoking or suspending any additional automotive repair registration issued to Josue Mateos Montoya;