		1	
1	KAMALA D. HARRIS Attorney General of California		
2	KENT D. HARRIS		
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General ELENA L. ALMANZO ELENA A. ALMANZO		
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 131058		
5	1300 I Street, Suite 125 P.O. Box 944255	1	
6	Sacramento, CA 94244-2550 Telephone: (916) 322-5524		
7	Facsirnile: (916) 327-8643 Attorneys for Complainant		
8	BEFORE THE		
9	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR		
10	STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
11			
12	In the Matter of the Accusation Against: Case No. 49/16 - 7427		
13	BALSWICK QUICK SMOG PAUL E. LANGLEY, OWNER		
14	379 N. Golden State Blvd. Turlock, CA 95380		
15	Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 243971 Secondary Production Lineage		
16	Smog Check, Test Only Station License No. TC 243971		
17	And		
18	ERIN BAILEY HOOVEN 2204 E. Hawkeye		
19	Turlock, CA 95380 Smog Check Inspector (EO) License		
20	No. 633678 Smog Check Repair Technician (EI) License		
21	No. 633678		
22	Respondents.		
23			
24	Patrick Dorais ("Complainant") alleges:		
25	PARTIES		
26	1. Complainant brings this Accusation and Petition to Revoke Probation solely in his		
27	official capacity as the Chief of the Bureau of Autornotive Repair ("Bureau"), Department of		
28	Consumer Affairs.		
	1		
	(BALSWICK QUICK SMOG; PAUL E. LANGLEY, OWNER and ERIN BAILEY HOOVEN) ACCUSATION		

Automotive Repair Dealer Registration

2. On a date uncertain in 2006, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer Number ARD 243971 to Paul E. Langley ("Respondent Langley"), as owner of Balswick Quick Smog. The Automotive Repair Dealer was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on February 28, 2017, unless renewed.

Smog Check, Test Only Station License

3. On or about April 25, 2006, the Bureau issued Smog Check, Test Only, Station License Number TC 243971 ("Station License") to Respondent Langley. The Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on February 28, 2017, unless renewed.

Technician License

4. On October 3, 2011, the Bureau issued Advanced Emission Specialist (EA)
Technician License No. 633678 to Erin Bailey Hooven ("Respondent Hooven"). Respondent
Hooven's Advanced Emission Specialist Technician License was due to expire on May 31, 2013.
Pursuant to California Code of Regulations, title 16 ("Regulations"), section 3340.28(e),
Respondent Hooven elected to renew the license as Smog Check Inspector (EO) License No.
633678, and Smog Check Repair Technician (EI) License No. 633678, effective May 16, 2013.
The Advanced Emission Specialist (EA) Technician License was cancelled on May 16, 2013.
The Smog Check Inspector (EO) License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on May 31, 2017, unless renewed. The Smog Check
Repair Technician (EI) License expired on May 31, 2015.

STATUTORY AND REGULATORY PROVISIONS

5. This Accusation is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs ("Director") for the Bureau of Automotive Repair, under the authority of the following laws.

¹ Effective August 1, 2012, Regulations, sections 3340.28, 3340.29, and 3340.30 were amended to implement a license restructure from the Advanced Emission Specialist Technician (EA) license and Basic Area (EB) Technician license to Smog Check Inspector (EO) license and/or Smog Check Repair Technician (El) license.

1	14. Health & Saf. Code section 44072.10 states, in pertinent part:	
2		
3	(c) The department shall revoke the license of any smog check technician or	
4	station licensee who fraudulently certifies vehicles or participates in the fraudulent inspection of vehicles. A fraudulent inspection includes, but is not limited to, all of	
5	the following:	
6		
7	(4) Intentional or willful violation of this chapter or any regulation, standard, or procedure of the department implementing this chapter	
8	15. Health & Saf. Code section 44024.5(a), states:	
9	The department shall compile and maintain statistical and emissions profiles	
10	and data from motor vehicles that are subject to the motor vehicle inspection program. The department may use data from any source, including remote sensing	
11	data, in use data, and other motor vehicle inspection program data, to develop and confirm the validity of the profiles, to evaluate the program, and to assess the	
12	performance of smog check stations. The department shall undertake these requirements directly or seek a qualified vendor for these services.	
13	16. Health & Saf. Code section 44037 states, in pertinent part:	
14	(a) The department shall compile and maintain records, using the samplin methodology necessary to ensure their scientific validity and reliability, of tests	
15	repairs performed by qualified smog check technicians at licensed smog check stations pursuant to this chapter on all of the following information:	
16 17	(1) The motor vehicle identification information and the test data collected at the station.	
18	••••	
19	(5) Data received and compiled through the use of the centralized computer	
20	database and computer network to be established pursuant to Section 44037.1, and any other information determined to be essential by the department for program	
21	enhancement to achieve greater efficiency, consumer protection, cost-effectiveness, convenience, or emission reductions	
22	17. Health & Saf. Code section 44037.1 states, in pertinent part:	
23	(a) On or before January 1, 1995, the department shall design and establish the equipment necessary to operate a centralized computer data base and computer	
24	network that is readily accessible by all licensed smog check technicians on a real time basis.	
25	(b) The centralized computer data base and network shall be designed with all	
26	of the following capabilities:	
27	••••	
28	///	

///

vehicles. The BAR-OIS system consists of a certified Data Acquisition Device (DAD), computer, bar code scanner, and printer.

- 21. The DAD is an On Board Diagnostic (OBD) scan tool that, when requested by the California BAR-OIS software, retrieves OBD data from the vehicle. The DAD connects between the BAR-OIS computer and the vehicle's diagnostic link connector. The bar code scanner is used to input technician information, the vehicle identification number, and DMV renewal information. The vehicle identification number (VIN) that is physically present on all vehicles is required to be programmed into the vehicle's On-Board Diagnostics Generation II (OBD II) on 2005 and newer vehicles, and on many occasions was programmed into the OBD II computer in earlier model-years. The electronically programmed VIN is referred to as the "eVIN", is captured by the Bureau during a smog check inspection, and must match the physical VIN on the vehicle. The printer is used to provide a Vehicle Inspection Report (VIR), which shows the inspection results and the Smog Check Certificate of Compliance Number for passing vehicles. Data retrieved and recorded during an OIS smog check includes the eVIN, the communication protocol, 2 and the number of Parameter Identifications (PID's)3.
- 22. As with the BAR-97 EIS, the technician also performs a visual and functional test on the vehicle. The visual inspection of the emission control components verifies the required emission control devices are present and properly connected and a functional test is performed of the malfunction indicator light. The OIS software makes the determination whether or not the vehicle passes the inspection based on the results of the OBD, visual, and functional tests.

² The OBD II communication protocol describes the specific manufacturer/vehicle communication "language" used by the OBD II computer to communicate to scan tools and other devices such as the BAR-OIS. The communication protocol is programmed into the OBD II computer during manufacture and does not change.

³ PID's are data points reported by the OBD II computer to the scan tool or BAR-OIS (for example, engine speed (rpm), vehicle speed, engine temperature, etc.) The PID count is the number of data points reported by the OBD II computer, is programmed during manufacture, and does not change. Each make and model vehicle reports a specific number of PID counts; i.e., the PID count does not vary for that make and model vehicle.

23. Beginning on or about May 2, 2016, Bureau Representative "J.L." reviewed BAR-OIS test data pertaining to smog inspections conducted at Respondent's facility. J.L. found that Respondent Hooven performed smog inspections on eight vehicles identified below using a

method known as "clean plugging", 4 resulting in the issuance of fraudulent certificates of compliance for the vehicles.

Vehicle #1

Review of OIS Test Data

24. J.L. reviewed BAR-OIS test data for Respondent Langley's facility that showed that on July 7, 2015, Respondent Hooven performed a smog inspection on a 2005 Toyota RAV4 (Vehicle 1), resulting in the issuance of Certificate of Compliance No. PS900396C. The BAR-OIS test details for Vehicle 1 showed that the eVIN recorded during the inspection did not match the VIN for Vehicle 1. J.L. reviewed the Comparative OIS Test Data for vehicle make and model 2005 Toyota RAV4 and found that the communication protocol and PID count recorded during the smog check on Vehicle 1 were not consistent with the communication protocol and PID count for that make and model. J.L. concluded that the DAD was not connected to Vehicle 1 during the smog inspection, resulting in the issuance of a fraudulent smog certificate of compliance.

Vehicle #2

25. J.L. reviewed BAR-OIS test data for Respondent Langley's facility that showed that on September 28, 2015, Respondent Hooven performed a smog inspection on a 2008 GMC Sierra K3500 (Vehicle 2), resulting in the issuance of Certificate of Compliance No. PW799849C. The BAR-OIS test details for Vehicle 2 showed that the eVIN recorded during the inspection did not match the VIN for Vehicle 2. J.L. reviewed the Comparative OIS Test Data for vehicle make and model 2008 GMC Sierra K3500 and found that the communication protocol and PID count recorded during the smog check on Vehicle 2 were not consistent with the communication

⁴ Clean-plugging is the use of a vehicle's properly functioning OBD II system, or another source, to generate passing diagnostic readings for the purpose of issuing a fraudulent smog certificate of compliance to another vehicle that is not in compliance with the Smog Check Program and/or is not present for testing.

10 11

12 13

14

15 16

17

18

19 20

21

22 23

24

25 26

27

28

protocol and PID count for that make and model. J.L. concluded that the DAD was not connected to Vehicle 2 during the smog inspection, resulting in the issuance of a fraudulent smog certificate of compliance.

Vehicle #3

J.L. reviewed BAR-OIS test data for Respondent Langley's facility that showed that on November 13, 2015, Respondent Hooven performed a smog inspection on a 2007 Dodge Ram 2500 (Vehicle 3), resulting in the issuance of Certificate of Compliance No. QA202430C. The BAR-OIS test details for Vehicle 3 showed that the eVIN recorded during the inspection did not match the VIN for Vehicle 3. J.L. reviewed the Comparative OIS Test Data for vehicle make and model 2007 Dodge Ram 2500 and found that the communication protocol and PID count recorded during the smog check on Vehicle 3 were not consistent with the communication protocol and PID count for that make and model. J.L. concluded that the DAD was not connected to Vehicle 3 during the smog inspection, resulting in the issuance of a fraudulent smog certificate of compliance.

Vehicle #4

27. J.L. reviewed BAR-OIS test data for Respondent Langley's facility that showed that on November 13, 2015, Respondent Hooven performed a smog inspection on a 2004 Dodge Ram 2500 Quad (Vehicle 4), resulting in the issuance of Certificate of Compliance No. QA202431C. The BAR-OIS test details for Vehicle 4 showed that the eVIN recorded during the inspection did not match the VIN for Vehicle 4. J.L. reviewed the Comparative OIS Test Data for vehicle make and model 2004 Dodge Ram 2500 Quad and found that the communication protocol and PID count recorded during the smog check on Vehicle 4 were not consistent with the communication protocol and PID count for that make and model. J.L. concluded that the DAD was not connected to Vehicle 4 during the smog inspection, resulting in the issuance of a fraudulent smog certificate of compliance.

Vehicle #5

28. J.L. reviewed BAR-OIS test data for Respondent Langley's facility that showed that on January 4, 2016, Respondent Hooven performed a smog inspection on a 2005 Mini Cooper

(Vehicle 5), resulting in the issuance of Certificate of Compliance No. YV502933C. The BAR-OIS test details for Vehicle 5 showed that the eVIN recorded during the inspection did not match the VIN for Vehicle 5. J.L. reviewed the Comparative OIS Test Data for vehicle make and model 2005 Mini Cooper and found that the communication protocol and PID count recorded during the smog check on Vehicle 5 were not consistent with the communication protocol and PID count for that make and model. J.L. concluded that the DAD was not connected to Vehicle 5 during the smog inspection, resulting in the issuance of a fraudulent smog certificate of compliance.

Vehicle #6

29. J.L. reviewed BAR-OIS test data for Respondent Langley's facility that showed that on January 7, 2016, Respondent Hooven performed a smog inspection on a 2008 Dodge Ram 2500 Quad (Vehicle 6), resulting in the issuance of Certificate of Compliance No. YV553394C. The BAR-OIS test details for Vehicle 6 showed that the eVIN recorded during the inspection did not match the VIN for Vehicle 6. J.L. reviewed the Comparative OIS Test Data for vehicle make and model 2008 Dodge Ram 2500 Quad and found that the communication protocol and PID count recorded during the smog check on Vehicle 6 were not consistent with the communication protocol and PID count for that make and model. J.L. concluded that the DAD was not connected to Vehicle 6 during the smog inspection, resulting in the issuance of a fraudulent smog certificate of compliance.

Vehicle #7

30. J.L. reviewed BAR-OIS test data for Respondent Langley's facility that showed that on February 1, 2016, Respondent Hooven performed a smog inspection on a 2001 Ford Expedition XLT (Vehicle 7), resulting in the issuance of Certificate of Compliance No. YX390065C. The BAR-OIS test details for Vehicle 7 showed that the eVIN recorded during the inspection did not match the VIN for Vehicle 7. J.L. reviewed the Comparative OIS Test Data for vehicle make and model 2001 Ford Expedition XLT and found that the communication protocol and PID count recorded during the smog check on Vehicle 7 were not consistent with the communication protocol and PID count for that make and model. J.L. concluded that the DAD

was not connected to Vehicle 7 during the smog inspection, resulting in the issuance of a fraudulent smog certificate of compliance.

Vehicle #8

31. J.L. reviewed BAR-OIS test data for Respondent Langley's facility that showed that on February 5, 2016, Respondent Hooven performed a smog inspection on a 2003 Dodge Ram (Diesel) (Vehicle 8), resulting in the issuance of Certificate of Compliance No. YX492445C. The BAR-OIS test details for Vehicle 8 showed that the eVIN recorded during the inspection did not match the VIN for Vehicle 8. J.L. reviewed the Comparative OIS Test Data for vehicle make and model 2003 Dodge Ram (Diesel) and found that the communication protocol and PID count recorded during the smog check on Vehicle 8 were not consistent with the communication protocol and PID count for that make and model. J.L. concluded that the DAD was not connected to Vehicle 8 during the smog inspection, resulting in the issuance of a fraudulent smog certificate of compliance.

FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Untrue or Misleading Statements)

32. Respondent Langley's registration is subject to discipline pursuant to Code section 9884.7(a)(1), in that he made or authorized statements which he knew or in the exercise of reasonable care should have known to be untrue or misleading. Specifically, Respondent Langley certified that vehicles 1 through 8, identified in paragraphs 24 through 31, above, had passed inspection and were in compliance with applicable laws and regulations. In fact, Respondent Langley conducted smog inspections on the vehicles using clean-plugging methods in that he substituted a different vehicle during the inspections in order to issue smog certificates of compliance for the eight vehicles, and did not test or inspect the vehicles as required by Health & Saf. Code section 44012.

SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Fraud)

33. Respondent Langley's registration is subject to discipline pursuant to Code section 9884.7(a)(4), in that he committed acts that constitute fraud by issuing electronic smog

certificates of compliance for vehicles 1 through 8, identified in paragraphs 24 through 31 above, without ensuring that bona fide inspections were performed of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Motor Vehicle Inspection Program - Code Violations)

- 34. Respondent Langley's Station License is subject to discipline pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2(a), in that it failed to comply with the following sections of the Health & Saf. Code, as follows:
- a. <u>Section 44012(a)</u>: Respondent Langley failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on vehicles 1 through 8, identified in paragraphs 24 through 31 above, in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- b. <u>Section 44015</u>: Respondent Langley issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for vehicles 1 through 8, identified in paragraphs 24 through 31 above, without ensuring that the vehicles were properly tested and inspected to determine if it was in compliance with Health & Saf. Code section 44012.

FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Failure to Comply with Regulations)

- 35. Respondent Langley's Station License is subject to discipline pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2(c), in that it failed to comply with provisions of the Regulations, as follows:
- a. <u>Section 3340.35(e)</u>: Respondent Langley issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for vehicles 1 through 8, identified in paragraphs 24 through 31 above, even though the vehicles had not been inspected in accordance with Regulation section 3340.42.
- b. <u>Section 3340.42</u>: Respondent Langley failed to ensure that the required smog tests were conducted on vehicles 1 through 8, identified in paragraphs 24 through 31 above, in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

///

FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit)

36. Respondent Langley's Station License is subject to discipline pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2(d), in that Respondent Langley committed dishonest, fraudulent or deceitful acts whereby another is injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for vehicles 1 through 8, identified in paragraphs 24 through 31 above, without ensuring that a bona fide inspection was performed of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the people of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Motor Vehicle Inspection Program - Code Violations)

37. Respondent Hooven's smog check inspector license is subject to discipline pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2(a), in that he violated sections of that Code. Specifically, Respondent Hooven failed to perform the emission control tests on vehicles 1 through 8, identified in paragraphs 24 through 31 above, in accord with procedures prescribed by the department.

SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Failure to Comply with Regulations)

- 38. Respondent Hooven's smog check inspector license is subject to discipline pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2(c), in that he failed to comply with provisions of the Regulations, as follows:
- a. <u>Section 3340.30(a)</u>: Respondent Hooven failed to inspect and test vehicles 1 through 8, identified in paragraphs 24 through 31 above, in accordance with Health & Saf. Code sections 44012 and 44035, and Regulations, section 3340.42.
- b. <u>Section 3340.42</u>: Respondent Hooven failed to conduct the required smog tests on vehicles 1 through 8, identified in paragraphs 24 through 31 above, in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud, or Deceit)

39. Respondent Hooven's technician licenses are subject to discipline pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2(d), in that he committed dishonest, fraudulent, or deceitful acts whereby another is injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for vehicles 1 through 8, identified in paragraphs 24 through 31 above, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the people of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

MATTERS IN AGGRAVATION

40. To determine the degree of discipline, if any, to be imposed on Respondent, Complainant alleges as follows:

Balswick Quick Smog, Paul E. Langley, Owner

- a. On or about December 12, 2007, the Bureau issued Citation No. C08-0550 to Respondent Langley for violation of Health & Saf. Code section 44012(f) (failure to perform a visual/functional check of emission control devices according to procedures prescribed by the department) and Regulation, section 3340.35(c) (issuing a certificate of compliance to a vehicle that was improperly tested). On or about November 28, 2007, Respondent issued a certificate of compliance to a Bureau undercover vehicle with a non-functional EGR valve. The Bureau assessed civil penalties totaling \$500 against Respondent for the violations, and Respondent paid the fine on or about January 10, 2008.
- b. On or about May 29, 2008, the Bureau issued Citation No. C08-1050 against Respondent for violation of Health & Saf. Code section 44012(f) and Regulation, section 3340.35(c). On or about May 23, 2008, Respondent issued a certificate of compliance to a Bureau undercover vehicle with a missing positive crankcase ventilation (PCV) system. The Bureau assessed civil penalties totaling \$1,000 against Respondent for the violations, and Respondent paid the fine on or about July 14, 2008.

OTHER MATTERS

- 41. Under Code section 9884.7(c), the Director may invalidate temporarily or permanently or refuse to validate, the registrations for all places of business operated in this state by Respondent Paul E. Langley, upon a finding that he has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of the laws and regulations pertaining to an automotive repair dealer.
- 42. Under Health & Saf. Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check, Test Only Station license Number TC 243971, issued to Paul E. Langley, as owner of Balswick Quick Smog, is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under this chapter in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the director.
- 43. Under Health & Saf. Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Inspector (EO) License No. 633678, or Smog Check Repair Technician (EI) License No. 633678, issued to Erin Bailey Hooven, is revoked or suspended, then any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of the licalth & Saf. Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.

PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- 1. Revoking or suspending Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 243971, issued to Paul E. Langley, as owner of Balswick Quick Smog;
- 2. Revoking or suspending any other automotive repair dealer registration issued to Paul E. Langley;
- 3. Revoking or suspending Smog Check, Test Only, Station License Number TC 243971, issued to Paul E. Langley, as owner of Balswick Quick Smog;
- 4. Revoking or suspending any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Paul E. Langley;
- 5. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Inspector (EO) License No. 633678 (formerly Advanced Emission Specialist Technician EA License No. 633678) issued to Erin Bailey Hooven;

	l				
1	6.	Revoking or suspending Smog Check Repair Technician (EI) License No. 633678			
2	(formerly Advanced Emission Specialist Technician EA License No. 633678) issued to Erin				
3	Bailey Hooven;				
4	7.	Revoking or suspending any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of the Health			
5	and Safety	Code in the name of Erin Bailey Hooven;			
6	8.	Ordering Paul E. Langley and Erin Bailey Hooven to pay the Bureau of Automotive			
7	Repair the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of this case, pursuant to				
8	Business and Professions Code section 125.3; and,				
9	9.	Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper.			
10		\sim \sim			
11	DATED: _	12-15-16 Patrick Dornis by Jung Bu			
12		PATRICK DORAIS Chief Bureau of Automotive Repair Corch. Chie			
13		Department of Consumer Affairs State of California			
14		Complainant			
15	SA2016104140 12525094.doc				
16	12323094.00				
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					
26					
27					
28					