BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR STATE OF CALIFORNIA

3

4

5

In the Matter of the Accusation Against:

Automotive Repair Dealer No. 269812

DON'S BODY REPAIR INC. MICHAEL E. SMITH; DANIEL R. ADAMS; SHELLEY MARIE SMITH

1937 West Lane

Stockton, CA 95205

_

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19 20

21 22

23[°] 24

25

26 27

28

Case No. 77/15-45

DEFAULT DECISION AND ORDER

[Gov. Code, §11520]

FINDINGS OF FACT

Respondents.

- 1. On or about April 6, 2015, Complainant Patrick Dorais, in his official capacity as the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair (Bureau), Department of Consumer Affairs, filed Accusation No. 77/15-45 against Don's Body Repair Inc., Michael E. Smith; Daniel R. Adams; Shelley Marie Smith (Respondent) before the Director of Consumer Affairs. The Accusation is attached as Exhibit A and incorporated herein.
- 2. On or about August 1, 2012, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer No. 269812 to Respondent. The Automotive Repair Dealer expired on August 31, 2013, and has not been renewed.
- 3. On or about April 14, 2015, Respondent was served by Certified and First Class Mail copies of the Accusation No. 77/15-45, Statement to Respondent, Notice of Defense, Request for Discovery, and Discovery Statutes (Government Code sections 11507.5, 11507.6, and 11507.7) at Respondent's address of record which, pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 136, is required to be reported and maintained with the Bureau. Respondent's address of record was and is:

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1.2

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

The proof of service by mail is attached to Exhibit A, the Accusation and Accusation Packet incorporated herein.

- 4. Service of the Accusation was effective as a matter of law under the provisions of Government Code section 11505, subdivision (c) and/or Business & Professions Code section 124.
- 5. On or about April 20, 2015, the aforementioned documents were returned by the U.S. Postal Service marked "Unable to Deliver as addressed. Unable to Forward."
 - 6. Government Code section 11506 states, in pertinent part:
 - (c) The respondent shall be entitled to a hearing on the merits if the respondent files a notice of defense, and the notice shall be deemed a specific denial of all parts of the accusation not expressly admitted. Failure to file a notice of defense shall constitute a waiver of respondent's right to a hearing, but the agency in its discretion may nevertheless grant a hearing.
- 7. Respondent failed to file a Notice of Defense within 15 days after service upon them of the Accusation, and therefore waived their right to a hearing on the merits of Accusation No. 77/15-45.
 - 8. California Government Code section 11520 states, in pertinent part:
 - (a) If the respondent either fails to file a notice of defense or to appear at the hearing, the agency may take action based upon the respondent's express admissions or upon other evidence and affidavits may be used as evidence without any notice to respondent.
- 9. Pursuant to its authority under Government Code section 11520, the Director after having reviewed the proof of service dated April 14, 2015, signed by Tami Acshenbrenner in Exhibit A, and returned envelopes in Exhibit B finds Respondent is in default. The Director will take action without further hearing and, based on Accusation, No. 77/15-45, proof of service and on the Affidavit of Bureau Representative Julian Rodriquez, finds that the allegations in Accusation are true.

26 | ///

27 | ///

28 | ///

E. Smith; Daniel R. Adams; Shelley Marie Smith has subjected its Automotive Repair Dealer No.

Repair Dealer based upon the following violations alleged in the Accusation which are supported

by the evidence contained in the affidavit of Bureau Representative Julian Rodriquez in this case.:

a. Business and Professions Code section 9884.7(a)(4) fraud for accepting, negotiating and

depositing a check in the amount of \$8,593.73 from a vehicle owners' insurer for full

could not purchase parts and materials or perform the repairs listed on Respondent's

b. Business and Professions Code section 9884.7(a)(2) preparing a repair estimate without

the vehicle's mileage and permitting the vehicle owner to sign the estimate.

payment of estimated repairs to the insured vehicle knowing Respondent would not and

The agency has jurisdiction to adjudicate this case by default.

repair estimate on the insured vehicles.

Based on the foregoing findings of fact, Respondent Dons Body Repair Inc., Michael

The Director of Consumer Affairs is authorized to revoke Respondent's Automotive

1.

2.

269812 to discipline.

7

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17 |

III

III

18 ///

19 | ///

20 | ///

21 ///

22 ///

23 ///

24 | ///

25 ///

26 111

27 | 111

28 | ///

~

ORDER

IT IS ORDERED that Automotive Repair Dealer No. 269812, issued to Respondent Don's Body Repair Inc., Michael E. Smith; Daniel R. Adams; Shelley Marie Smith, is revoked.

Pursuant to Government Code section 11520, subdivision (c), Respondent may serve a written motion requesting that the Decision be vacated and stating the grounds relied on within seven (7) days after service of the Decision on Respondent. The motion should be sent to the Bureau of Automotive Repair, ATTN: William D. Thomas, 10949 North Mather Blvd., Rancho Cordova, CA 95670. The agency in its discretion may vacate the Decision and grant a hearing on a showing of good cause, as defined in the statute.

This Decision shall become effective on

It is so ORDERED

TAMARA COLSON

Assistant General Counsel

Division of Legal Affairs

12040859,DOCX Department of Consumer Affairs DOJ Matter ID:SA2014115980

Attachment:

Exhibit A: Accusation

Exhibit A

Accusation, Accusation Packet and Proof of Service by Mail

KAMALA D. HARRIS Attorney General of California 2 JANICE K. LACHMAN Supervising Deputy Attorney General 3 BRIAN S. TURNER Deputy Attorney General 4 State Bar No. 108991 1300 I Street, Suite 125 5 P.O. Box 944255 Sacramento, CA 94244-2550 6 Telephone: (916) 445-0603 Facsimile: (916) 327-8643 7 Attorneys for Complainant 8 BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS 9 FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR STATE OF CALIFORNIA 10 11 Case No. 77/15-45 In the Matter of the Accusation Against: 12 DON'S BODY REPAIR INC. 13 MICHAEL E. SMITH, Pr. ACCUSATION DANIEL R. ADAMS, Sec. 14 SHELLEY MARIE SMITH, Tr. 15 1937 West Lane Stockton, CA 95205 16 Automotive Repair Dealer No. ARD 269812 17 Respondents. 18 19 Patrick Dorais ("Complainant") alleges: 20 **PARTIES** 21 1. Complainant brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as the Chief of the 22 Bureau of Automotive Repair ("Bureau"), Department of Consumer Affairs. 23 2. On or about August 1, 2012, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer Number 24 ARD 269812 to Don's Body Repair Inc. ("Respondent") Michael E. Smith (Smith) President. 25 Daniel R. Adams Secretary, and Shelley Marie Smith, Treasurer. The registration expired on 26 August 31, 2013, and has not been renewed. 27 28

Section 9884.7 of the Business and Professions Code ("Code") states, in pertinent

part:

3.

- -

(a) The director, where the automotive repair dealer cannot show there was a bona fide error, may deny, suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration of an automotive repair dealer for any of the following acts or omissions related to the conduct of the business of the automotive repair dealer, which are done by the automotive repair dealer or any automotive technician, employee, partner, officer, or member of the automotive repair dealer.

- (2) Causing or allowing a customer to sign any work order that does not state the repairs requested by the customer or the automobile's odometer reading at the time of repair.
 - (4) Any other conduct which constitutes fraud.
- (6) Failure in any material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to it.
- (b) Except as provided for in subdivision (c), if an automotive repair dealer operates more than one place of business in this state, the director pursuant to subdivision (a) shall only suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration of the specific place of business which has violated any of the provisions of this chapter. This violation, or action by the director, shall not affect in any manner the right of the automotive repair dealer to operate his or her other places of business.
- (c) Notwithstanding subdivision (b), the director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this state by an automotive repair dealer upon a finding that the automotive repair dealer has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of this chapter, or regulations adopted pursuant to it.

COST RECOVERY

4. Code section 125.3 provides, in pertinent part, that a Board may request the administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed a violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case.

CONSUMER COMPLAINT - 2006 FORD MUSTANG

5. On or about June 12, 2013, J N's ("consumer") 2006 Ford Mustang was towed to Respondent's facility following a collision. JN's spouse, JB signed Respondent's Estimate number 32237, but did not receive a copy.

-///

///

///

- 6. On or about June 13, 2013, the consumer's insurance company, State Farm Insurance Company ("State Farm"), inspected the vehicle and prepared a written estimate of the damage and cost to repair the vehicle that totaling \$8,593.73 (less a \$500 deductible).
- 7. On or about June 17, 2013, State Farm issued a check payable to Respondent in the amount of \$8,593.73 for repairs to the consumer's vehicle.
- 8. Between June 13, 2013, and August 15, 2013, there were several unsuccessful attempts by or on behalf of the consumer to contact Respondent by telephone and site visits to inquire about the status of the consumer's vehicle.
- 9. On or about August 15, 2013, the consumer filed a complaint about Respondent with the Bureau,
- 10. Between August 23, 2013, and September 3, 2013, a Bureau representative made several unsuccessful attempts to contact Respondent regarding the consumer's complaint and vehicle status.
- 11. On or about September 4, 2013 while on a site visit, a Bureau representative finally made contact with Smith. Smith represented to the Bureau's representative that the Internal Revenue Service had seized Respondent's business financial accounts, which prevented or interfered with Respondent meeting their business obligations. Consequently, Respondent had ceased operations and closed the business. Smith admitted depositing State Farm's check issued for repairs to the consumer's vehicle and failing to perform the repairs or purchase parts described in Respondent's estimate and State Farm's estimate.
- 12. On or about September 5, 2013, the consumer's vehicle was towed from Respondent's facility to All Foreign and Domestic Body Shop ("All Foreign"). All Foreign estimated the total cost of repairs to the consumer's vehicle would be \$9,093.73.
- 13. On or about November 7, 2013, JN paid All Foreign \$9,093.73 for the repairs to JN's vehicle.

FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Fraud)

14. Paragraphs 5 through 13 are incorporated herein as though set forth at length.

Respondent's registration is subject to discipline under Code section 9884.7(a)(4), in that

Respondent committed fraud by accepting payment of \$8,593.73 from State Farm for or on behalf

of JN for the repairs and/or services described, listed and promised in Respondent's and State

Farm's written estimates but failed to perform any of the repairs or services.

SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Failure to Comply with Provisions of the Automotive Repair Act)

15. Respondent's registration is subject to discipline pursuant to Code section 9884.7(a)(2), in that on or about June 12, 2013, Respondent presented and thereafter allowed the repair estimate to be signed on behalf of JN without the vehicle's odometer reading on the estimate.

OTHER MATTERS

16. Pursuant to Code section 9884.7(c), the director may suspend or revoke the registrations, licenses, and certificates for all places of business operated in this state by Don's Body Repair Inc., upon a finding that it has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of the laws and regulations pertaining to an automotive repair dealer.

PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- 1. Revoking, suspending or placing on probation Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 269812, issued to Don's Auto Body Repair Inc.;
- 2. Revoking, suspending or placing on probation any other automotive repair dealer registration issued to Don's Auto Body Repair Inc.;
- 3. Ordering Don's Auto Body Repair Inc. to pay the Director of Consumer Affairs the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of this case, pursuant to Code section 125.3; and,

1	4. Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper.
2	
3	DATED: April 6, 2015 Patrick Working
4	DATED: April 6, 2015 PATRICK DORAIS
5	Chief Bureau of Automotive Repair
6	Department of Consumer Affairs State of California
7	Complainant
8	SA2014115980
10	11787225.doex
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
25	
26	
27	
28	
ļ	5

Accusation